In the advertising and marketing world, understanding what drives consumers to purchase products or grasping what creates favorable attitudes towards brands in consumers’ minds is an invaluable asset. The purpose of this research is to examine the impact of professional athlete endorser familiarity and endorser/product congruency on consumer attitudes towards the brand, consumer attitudes towards the ad, consumer purchase intentions, and perceived endorser credibility. Source credibility model, source attractiveness model, and the match-up hypothesis were used as theoretical support for this research. A 2 x 2 factorial experiment was implemented to test the effects of endorser familiarity and endorser/product congruency on consumer attitudes, purchase intentions, and perceptions of endorser credibility. After two pre-tests were conducted to ensure that the endorser familiarity and endorser/product congruency manipulations were successful, 256 participants answered questions regarding their perceptions of endorser credibility, attitudes towards the brand and ad, and purchase intentions. Results showed that endorser familiarity had no impact on perceived endorser credibility or consumer attitudes and purchase intentions. However, results did support that when the endorser matched up with the product endorsed, higher consumer attitudes, purchase intentions, and perceptions of endorser trustworthiness and expertise were found. Since celebrity endorsements represent a multi-million dollar industry and endorsement strategy is a high risk and high reward strategy, it is vital to determine the factors that can best explain endorsement success. This research contributes to the extant literature on celebrity endorsements by focusing on athletes as celebrity endorsers and introducing the aspect of endorser familiarity as an important construct for choosing the most appropriate endorser for a brand.