Student retention and persistence has been a continued concern for those in higher education. In response to those concerns, educators have explored various programs and interventions to assist students in persistence and completion of their academic career. This dual case study seeks to gain an understanding of the experiences and perceptions of Midwest community college students and administrators of successful peer mentoring programs to enhance retention efforts of students. The implications of this inquiry for application in higher education directly influence school leaders trying to create meaningful interventions to increase retention and completion rates in college. The findings in this study demonstrated successful mentoring programs include training to build community, provide opportunities to reflect upon both personal and academic growth, and set expectations of accountability and leadership for all students. The use of peers can enhance the academic performance of both the mentees and mentors if the right conditions are created throughout the mentoring program.