The Tibetan Doctors: A Study of Chinese Non-governmental Organizations

Professional Project by Yi Gan

As part of the completion of a Master of Arts degree

Missouri School of Journalism

May 2014

Committee Members:

Prof. David Rees, Project Chair

Prof. Keith Greenwood

Prof. Ryan Thomas
Acknowledgements

I want to thank all my family for their support during my pursuit of my master’s degree. Especially I want to thank my mom, Xiaodong Wu, who supported me in all ways through my completion of my degree.

I want to thank my friend Jing Zhong for her support and company when I travelled to Dege, Sichuan and the encouragement she provided.

I want to thank Mr. Thinley Phuntsok and all his families for their accommodation in Dzongsar and their kindness to show their life to me.

I want to thank Mr. Karpu for his patience and encouragement while I was doing research for my project.

And finally, I want to thank members of my committee, David Rees, Keith Greenwood and Ryan Thomas for their patience, advice and encouragement.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements........................................................................................................... ii

Chapter One: Introduction.............................................................................................. 1

Chapter Two: Chronological Description of Activities (including field notes)......... 4

Chapter 3: Evaluation of Project.................................................................................. 29

Chapter 4: Abundant Physical Evidence........................................................................ 35
  
  Selection of photos and videos.................................................................................... 32
  
  Audio log sheets........................................................................................................... 49

Chapter 5: Analysis Component .................................................................................... 70
  
  Statement of Topic and Research Question............................................................... 66
  
  Theoretical Framework............................................................................................... 68
  
  Literature Review....................................................................................................... 69
  
  Mapping the Chinese NGOs...................................................................................... 69
  
  Framing analysis of social movements..................................................................... 69
  
  Methodology............................................................................................................... 75
  
  Findings..................................................................................................................... 76
  
  Discussion.................................................................................................................. 86
  
  Conclusion................................................................................................................ 89

Appendix: Original Proposal.......................................................................................... 103
I. Introduction

My interest in this project developed from my passion for China’s emerging grassroots organizations and the social movement that it may bring about. Before attending the Missouri School of Journalism, I went to Sichuan University in my hometown, Chengdu, China and graduated with a biology degree. During my years in college, I joined the Environmental Volunteer Association of Sichuan University and volunteered in various projects and organizations. I also attended meetings organized by local non-governmental organizations (NGOs) where I recognized the grassroots power of emerging NGOs organized by local people in China. I was enthusiastic about the grassroots movement brought about by NGOs in China and decided to go to a journalism school to equip myself with important communication skills.

With little previous professional skills in photography, I studied photojournalism because I know I am a visual person and I have a general passion of all the beauty in the world. I took the Fundamentals of Photojournalism in my first semester here, through which I learned how to take pictures in a variety of situations. I learned to feel comfortable with my camera when facing people and how to talk to people to get access. The Advanced Techniques in Photojournalism class taught by Rita Reed helped me really start to “see the light” while photographing. During the summer of 2012, I took Staff Photojournalism, which gave me a demanding training that I had to go to assignments nearly every day in a newspaper environment. In this class, I learned to take notes and gather information precisely for the caption of the pictures. The last photo class I took,
Picture Story and Photo Essay gave me a more structured training of producing visual stories. Above all these, the Electronic Photojournalism class provided me with digital visual story telling skills including video shooting, web designing and audio editing. With all the education I have had, I am able to work on photography projects independently and generate publishable stories.

In the future, I hope to contribute to the grassroots social movement in China for the possibilities of building a more democratic society. I want to document the people who are organized as local grassroots organizations and their difficulties and challenges as well as achievements. Through my work I want to bring more attention from the public to this group and make them more visible to people.

The professional component of this project documents a specific local NGO, Yothok Yonden Gonpo Medical Association (YYMA), in Southwest China. By doing this project, I was able to develop a deeper understanding of their work. The close observation of this NGO can be viewed as a case study of the existing NGOs in China. The analysis component of this project is a content analysis of Chinese media’s representation of NGOs through which I gained more knowledge of the media’s role in representing China’s grassroots movement.

YYMA is a local NGO in Dege County of Ganzi Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture in Sichuan Province. Mr. Luore Phuntsok, a passionate traditional Tibetan doctor, artist and farmer, established it in 1983. Since then, the association has not only provided medical service to local people but also conserved traditional Tibetan medicine and
culture. In Chinese society, the functions of such an NGO lie in the benefits to the community as well as its power of generating a voice at the local level where people have their own voice aside from the central government.
II. Chronological Description of Activities (Field Notes)

I went back to China on December 24, 2012. In the beginning of January I started to contact Yothok Yonden Gonpppo Medical Association and arranged meetings with Mr. Karpu (Jiangyong Phuntsok) in January. I interviewed Mr. Karpu and planned the trip to the Tibetan Hospital. Considering the weather condition, I travelled to Garze Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture in Sichuan province in March. I came back to the US on April 2, 2013 and started writing the research paper as well as editing the video. The field notes begin as follows:

Field Notes
January 30, 2013

I contacted YYMA (Yothok Yonden Gonpppo Medical Association) and Mr. Karpu who’s the contact person at YYMA said I could go and meet them at their office in Chengdu.

The first time I entered the office it looked so different from how I thought their office would be like. The desks and chairs in the living room are all wooden furniture with Tibetan decorations on them. Then I understand that the organization is closely bonded with its origin and the culture of Tibet.

Mr. Karpu explained to me the things they’ve been doing and most of them are related to culture conservation and the benefit for the local people. It seems that YYMA has done a lot of projects to help the development and facility of the village, but there wouldn’t be much going on when I go there during March. These are the things I need to
keep in mind when I go there.

I’m also reading a book of the history of Kang area in Sichuan. It is the area is dominated by Tibetans in Sichuan province. I think it is important to know as much as possible about the history and culture of the area where the hospital locates before I actually set out on my trip.

February 14, 2013

I started to write down the things I need for this trip. I purchased a video mic to ensure that I can take videos with decent quality. The weather was to my greatest concern. It won’t be too cold in March but it’s still quite cold and there will be no air-conditioning. It would be easier for me to travel with companions so I contacted my friends to see if any of them will be able to travel with me. It is still the Spring Festival in China, so a lot of people are still on vacation. My next plan is to get in touch with Mr. Karpu as soon as possible after the holiday and conduct an interview with him. I also want to ask him about the details of the trip.

February 25, 2013

I went to the YYMA office in Chengdu to see Mr. Karpu and interview him today. He told me that the weather is still very cold in Dege County where the hospital is located. And because of the snow, a lot of roads have been closed and it is kind of dangerous to go there now.
Currently YYMA is trying to develop several products that utilize the traditional Tibetan crafts and materials. For example, they are doing research and experiments with the hair of yaks to produce a fabric that can be used on handbags. A French designer has done the design of their product, and it is a modern and high-end brand they are trying to develop. According to Karpu, the products can bring a lot of profits to the local people in Dege and they don’t even have to leave their hometown and abandon their traditional crafts to make money. Both conserving the culture and benefiting the local people are the goals of YYMA.

Karpu said since the government is restricting the NGOs activities to an extent that they have no space to expand and only a little space to survive, he decided to transform YYMA from an NGO to a social enterprise that can help the local people make profits from their work. “Now my dream is to become an entrepreneur” Karpu said.

Karpu provided me a lot of information about the hospital and whom I should contact. And he said March should be ok if I go there. Karpu has 9 siblings in total and his younger brother is now a doctor at the hospital and he is the vice-president of the hospital. He lives in the hospital with his family and he will accommodate me and my friend there.

Karpu also showed me the samples they already developed which are stored at their office. The designs include features of Tibetan culture and modern fashionable looks.
The video clip of an interview with Karpu.

Samples of the products developed by YYMA.

February 28, 2013
I planned my journey to be on March 2 when my friend can travel with me because it is safer than travelling alone. I will have to car-pool with strangers on the trip and it takes four days to get there. I’m thinking about the story ideas that I might be able to do at the Tibetan hospital. At first I thought about following the things done by the NGO but there may not be much going on by the time I get there. Since I will be living with the family of Thinley Phuntsok in the hospital, it might be a good idea to focus more on the medical service provided by the hospital.

Basically, it can be about aspects of the daily life in the hospital, patients who come to the hospital, Tibetan traditional medicine practice, the Tibetan culture, Buddhism religion, etc.

March 4, 2013

I arrived in Maisudama Village in Dege County where the Yothok Yonden Gonpo Medical Association (YYMA) is located. It took me three days to get there from my hometown Chengdu. Maisudama Village is located at the northwest side of Ganze Tibetan Autonomous State which is dominated by Tibetan people.

Tibetan culture has been preserved well here despite the fast economic development of China because of the isolated location and the inconvenience of transportation.

Yothok Yonden Gonpo Medical Association was established by Mr. Luore Phuntsok and it was developed from a local clinic which later became the “Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital”. His son, Thinley Phuntsok greeted me in the hospital where he works as a
professional doctor. They gave me a room in the hospital and I can live and eat with them during the time I do my project. Thinley, his wife Tsing Tsok and his daughter live in the hospital and he also manages the hospital.

According to Thinley, there are eight doctors and 38 employees in the hospital. Five of the doctors are the families of Mr. Luore Phuntsok who inherited the knowledge of Tibetan traditional medicine from him. The hospital provides medical service to local people for free. Patients of the hospital only have to pay a little money for the medicine not for the service.

After dinner, around 10 p.m., two local people rode a motorcycle to the hospital to ask for a doctor. Thinley went into his car and drove to the patient’s house. I videotaped the process of Thinley giving medical service to the patient (Acuo, 78) who is also a previous patient of his. The old man lives alone and has no child. According to Thinley, he has never asked for money from him.

Related pictures
Yothok Yonden Gonpo Medical Association is located at Maisudama Village in Dege County. There are eight doctors who work here to provide medical service to local people. The doctors also serve to preserve the practice of traditional Tibetan medicine.

Chinaipengcuo gives medical service to Acuo on March 4, 2013.
March 5, 2013

Mr. Luore Phuntsok’s youngest daughter Quga picked us up in the morning to take us to the Dzongsar Temple and the Dzongsar Buddhist College.

Quga is one of the doctors in the hospital too and she learnt Tibetan traditional medicine from her dad. Born in 1988, she has received higher education in a college in Chengdu.

We met Dawazhuoma at her house. She is the daughter of Mr. Luore Phuntsok’s daughter and her father is a craftsman who makes traditional Tibetan Buddha statue. Dawazhuoma was born in 1990 and she speaks Mandarin and can write in English. She has received two offers from American universities but she’s afraid that she couldn’t get a passport on time because she is Tibetan. She has been working on a book of traditional Dege folk songs for three years. She gathers materials from local people and writes about the traditional culture of her hometown. If she has the chance to study abroad, she will come back and work for her hometown, she said.

It seems to me that it is really interesting to do a story on the three generations of the family and show their passion for their traditional culture and how they are working to improve the life of people there. Starting from the father, Mr. Luore Phuntsok who has worked a lot for the conservation of local culture, his sons and daughters worked as doctors in the Tibetan hospital. His daughter’s daughter is also working for the benefit of their people. I already did a video interview with his oldest son, Karpu, who is now managing the YYMA and working as an entrepreneur to develop and promote handcrafts
made by local people.

My idea now is to do separate video interviews with Luore Phuntsok, Quga, Thinley and Dawazhuoma and shoot video of their everyday life and what they are doing in the aspect of benefit other people and the conservation of their culture.

Related pictures:

Students from Dzongsar Buddhist College take a rest after a class in the afternoon on March 5, 2013.
Maisudama Village has preserved the traditional Tibetan culture because of its far location from the main city in Sichuan and the inconvenience of transportation.
March 7, 2013

We went to “empowerment” a religious ceremony of Tibetan Buddhism, with the family of Thinley Phuntsok. People from nearby villages and local area all came to attend it. It shows Tibetan people’s strong belief and passion for their religion. I recorded the ceremony with the presence of Thinley and his family to show their religious belief and their traditional culture.

Before the ceremony, I got a chance to meet Mr. Luore Phuntsok, father of Thinley Phuntsok. He lives in the Dzongsar Temple and he sees patients in his study room everyday. According to him, there are around 30 to 40 patients each day. Some are from
nearby places, but some even have to ride a motorcycle for two days to come here.

I took video of Mr. Luore Phuntsok and his patients and talked with him about some basic information of the hospital that he founded. He can’t speak much Mandarin and his daughter Quga interpreted for me. Again, the medical service is always free to every patient.

Each year, the hospital provides medical service to around 500,000 monks and normal people and gives away more than $47,619 worth of free medicine to patients. The traditional Tibetan medicine is practiced based on ancient medical books that have a history of more than 1300 years. Mr. Luore Phuntsok preserved the complete Tibetan medical lineage and works as the president of the hospital. People who work in the hospital produce the medicine in a traditional way and most of the work is done by hand.

I’m planning to do a video interview with Mr. Luore Phuntsok and take more videos of his work. He is the father Thinley, Quga, Karbu and Dawazhuoma’s mother. He originated the conservation of local culture in Dege. I want to show his spirit, which transcends the two following generations.

In the morning before the “empowerment” I videographed Thinley and his wife Zhaxiqingcuo prescribing for patients and giving the medicine to them. These can be used as a part of information to show Thinley’s job.

I think I would like to pursue three specific stories from Thinley, Luore Phuntsok and Dawazhuoma and then try to connect these three stories to show their inherent relation.
Mr. Luorepengcuo prescribes for patients who travel here to see a doctor.

During the ceremony of “empowerment” people in the village gather around the temple to participate. Monks will bless everyone who comes. After the ceremony, friends and families will get together and spend the afternoon together.
March 8, 2013

I stayed in the hospital for a whole day to take photos and videos of the hospital and Thinley’s work. He works from morning, around nine to the evening, around seven. But actually there is no specific time of working for him. Even if it’s the night, when there’s a patient he will see the patient and prescribe for them.

This evening, around seven when it is a usually slow time of the day, Thinley got a phone call to ask him to go to the Puma Xiang to see a patient, another area in Maisu. I followed him and videotaped the whole process of him going out to see the patient.

It was getting dark outside, but Thinley went into his car and drove out of the hospital. It took him around 30 minutes to get to the mountain where the patient lives. The patient was an old man who was already very weak. He was surrounded by monks who came from a local temple and the monks were reading Buddhism scriptures to prepare the old man if he dies. Thinley used the traditional Tibetan medicine skills to help the man and the man’s conditions became stable after his treatment.

I took videos of the whole process of Thinley giving treatment to the old man and the videos turned out to be good. Although it was very dark during the night, the video clips covered the whole process. These videos will help me develop a story of Thinley who practice traditional Tibetan medicine in the remote area. I’m still trying to find a chance to do a video interview of Thinley. It’s a challenge that he wouldn’t speak Mandarin when being interviewed and I don’t understand any Tibetan language.
Thinley drives his car to see the patient who lives 30 minutes away from the hospital.

Thinley gives treatment to Acuo, the patient who went into unconsciousness because of cerebral hemorrhage. He became conscious after the treatment but he died a few days later.
March 9, 2013

Dawazhuoma contacted me and she said I could follow her today. She is known as a hardworking young woman in the village and she has gotten two offers from universities in America. She created a documentary of the craft of making a traditional pot in her village which won a prize in a video competition in India.

Dawazhuoma has written a book of the traditional work songs of her culture. Now she’s planning to make a documentary of other crafts like pottery and Tibetan thangka (a religious illustration in Tibetan culture). Currently she’s doing interviews with local craftsmen to gather the materials she needs.

We went to a sewing class where she wanted to interview and photograph the sewer. There were four people in the class today and the teacher was making a traditional wallet that Tibetan women wear. I took video of Dawa interviewing the teacher about the wallet and did some videos of the sewing process of the local crafts.

According to Dawa, the traditional Tibetan wallet can cost as much as $4,838 each because of the unique materials, the time and skills needed to make it. The leather that is used on this wallet is from a kind of animal that is already extinct. The pieces that are used today are taken from ancient saddles. The silver part of the wallet takes months to make. The entire wallet is hand made and it is an important item for Tibetan women to wear on important occasions. “I don’t know if those fancy handbags like Louis Vuitton ones really worth the money they cost or it’s just the brand people are buying. Although
this wallet cost more than $4,000, it is worth its price.” Dawa said to me.

After interviewing the teacher in the sewing class, we went to the Dzongsar monastery to interview the craftsman who makes clay statues. The man is the teacher of her father who is also a clay statue maker. Dawa recorded the interview on her phone and she went to her grandfather’s place afterward.

Dawa interviews the craftsman about how to make the traditional Tibetan wallet.
The craftsman makes the traditional wallet in the class.

The man makes the leather part of the traditional wallet.

March 10, 2013

I stayed at the hospital for a whole day to gather some video of the people’s daily
life and interview patients who came here. As a hospital that practices traditional Tibetan medicine, there is a prayer room set up to give the medicine prayers. It is known traditionally that the prayers can enhance the effect of the medicine.

I took videos of Jundo, a lama who works at the hospital, giving prayers this morning. He read scriptures while using some ritual objects including the thunderbolt \((dorje\ or \ vajra)\) and bell \((drilbu)\). I interviewed him in the afternoon and asked him about the meaning of giving prayers and how long has he worked there.

I interviewed some of the patients who came to pick up the medicines that are prescribed for them. But not all of the videos turned out good. It’s hard to do an interview without knowing the language so I usually need to find a person to interpret for me.

In the afternoon, I interviewed Tsing Tsok, Thinley’s wife. She speaks mandarin, and the interview went smooth. But as mandarin is not her mother tongue, her answers tended to be short. I think I would not be able to use the audio of her interview.

After dinner, I finally interviewed Thinley. I wrote down the questions in the afternoon and his wife translated them into Tibetan so that he can read them. He answered the questions in front of the camera during the interview. It felt awkward that I didn’t understand anything he said in Tibetan, and I couldn’t ask any follow-up questions. But this was the only way to make him talk comfortably and finish the interview. It is quite dark in the room during the night, but I think the audio turned out decent.
Jodhu gives the prayers in the prayer room to the medicine prescribed by the hospital. He gives the prayers everyday.

Thinley speaks to the camera about his position in the hospital and his life.
Tsingcuo talks in front of the camera.

March 11, 2013

It is the first day for Enzhulamu, Thinley’s daughter to go to school. She’s about six years old and the family decided to send her to the elementary school in the village. In the Tibetan area in China, parents do not view going to school as a mandatory for young kids. But it has been valued much here in Maisu village because the Khenpo (the superior of a monastery) of Dzongsar Monastery tells the people that education is very important and they should send kids to the outside world to learn different knowledge and skills.

The date of going to school is specially picked for Enzhulamu in a traditional way. The parents went with the kids to go to register in the school early in the morning. The process was brief in a small village like that and kids go to school whenever the parents want them to. It is quite different from how it is in other areas in China.
My friend took video of the family went to school. The teacher told them to bring Enzhulamu to school at 8:30 a.m. every day. Enzhulamu was very excited to go to school. They came back after the registration.

In the afternoon, I went to another empowerment with the family of Thinley Phuntsok. Villagers gathered at a special location and the lamas were reading scriptures in a tent before the empowerment. Everyone waited in silence until the ceremony began. I attended the empowerment rather than take pictures outside of the crowd.

The empowerment is a quite common ritual ceremony in Tibetan area. In addition to its religious meaning to people, it is also an opportunity for villagers to get together and talk to each other. After the empowerment, they always sit in small groups to hang out for a while.

Prayer flags are colored cloth with sutras on them. Tibet Buddhists believe that the
sutras on them are released to heaven and this brings merit to the people who tied them.

Enzhulamu goes to school and register for the semester.

March 28, 2013

I came back from the trip and I still have a lot of things to do. The videos are in Tibetan so I need to go to Karpu’s office in Chengdu where I can find the employees who knows both Tibetan and Chinese to translate.

I watched all the video clips I have and tagged the ones that I might need to translate. I went to the office and found Karma who is also from Maisu village, which means she can understand the local language very well. I sat down with her and played the clips while typing in the translations on the audio log sheet. It took longer than I expected to translate those audios so I went back to the office for 4 times to complete the work.

I also asked Karma for the translation of some culturally related words in case I
April 10, 2013

I came back to the US on April 3. The jet lag took me a few days to recover, and I started to write my research paper. I identified the articles from Xinhua News Agency’s website and printed them out. I scanned through the articles, and I found a few news frames that frequently appeared in the data such as associated topics, civil society, and human interest.

At the same time, I’m editing my videos into a short documentary. I have a lot of video clips and I was at sea what to do in the beginning. There are a few clips I really like to use, for example the night when Thinley Phuntsok went to see a patient who was dying, the videos of Thinley’s father and the videos of the empowerment. I think I will start with the beginning of a day by showing images of the hospital and Thinley’s family’s morning. It is very hard to find the appropriate transitions in the video clips. It’s still a long way to go.

April 17, 2013

I finished translating the audio log sheets I have for the videos. I will later use these as subtitles. The video is roughly done, but I feel that the story is not very clear and it was too long, about 27 minutes. I need to cut this short a lot. I found that a lot of videos I took are not useful for they are redundant and some are not in good quality. There are
two videos that turned out without any sound. I tried to find the files I have on another
hard drive, but those still don’t have sound. The only reason I could think of is that I
forgot to turn on the microphone when I was taking the videos.
III. Evaluation of Project

This project was very challenging to me for it was planned, conducted and produced all by myself. It is hard to say if it was successful or not because I did my best. By doing the project, I learned a lot in terms of what it takes to complete a journalism independent project. The key to start the project is gaining access and trust to the right people. I was lucky that I was able to talk to Mr. Karpu, the oldest son of Mr. Luore Phuntsok before I went to the Tibetan hospital. Gaining his trust has provided me with a lot of help and access during my stay at the hospital, for example, my full access of his brother’s family who manage the hospital, accommodation at the hospital and his other families who interpreted for me.

Planning to do a project like this takes a lot of efforts. I considered factors that may affect me, such as transportation, weather, culture, accommodation, medicine, food and budget. Since I was going to live and eat with people in the hospital, I didn’t do much about food and accommodation. But still, I brought snacks and instant noodles with me just in case. I read a book about the history and culture of Ganzi Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture to have a basic understanding of where I was going. In addition to ordinary medication such as pills for cold and diarrhea, I took Deep Sea Shark Squalene to combat altitude sickness. It is cheap to travel with public transportation in China and it took about 1000 yuan ($158.7) for the round-trip from Chengdu to Dege.

It is also very important for the photographer to be respectful to the unfamiliar culture and remember to always show it. When videotaping, I always asked the doctor if I
could videotape in certain situations, especially during religious ceremonies and practices. In the hospital, females are not allowed to enter a room with special medications (because according to Tibetan medicine, those medications will lose its effectiveness after being seen by females), so I was very cautious when I walked around.

I would see this project as an independent documentary that still needed a lot of work before it’s done. When I was in the Tibetan hospital, I lived there and ate with the people there. Everyday was the same after a short time there during which I explored every single detail of the area and the life there. I was trying to take videos as much as possible but a lot of the videos were useless. Due to my inexperience throughout this production, I felt there could have been a more structured way to do it, which may lead to more success.

The cold weather and the inconvenience of the poor facility there have challenged me too. I wasn’t able to take a shower there, and it felt worse than I expected. Another challenge was the language barrier, which was a total surprise to me. Since most of the Tibetans can only speak Tibetan vernacular, which is totally different from Mandarin, I found it hard to communicate with a lot of people. Without a common language, it was more challenging for me to do interviews in a manner as I usually did. I then found translators to further help or assist me eliminate the language barrier but it seems there were miscommunications still. But I did my best to still conduct the interviews I needed. I interviewed the doctor by writing down my questions on a paper, which his wife translated for me before he read them.
After I came back from the Tibetan area and started to edit my videos, I realized I could have taken a lot more videos of different aspects of Tibetan people’s lives by further exploration. First of all, the founder of the hospital, Mr. Luore Phuntsok was not interviewed. He is a traditional man who was passionate about Tibetan traditional culture. Because of his effort, the Dzongsar Temple was rebuilt after its destruction during the culture revolution in China. Being the founder was only part of his contributions. He taught his children about Tibetan medicine applications and allowed them to become doctors. Being a prestigious figure within his community, he merely referred to himself as a farmer. Being able to interview him would have provided this project with a lot of insight into deeper cultural background and history and how it shaped his personality. I was able to give a glimpse of his practices throughout my videos, but the videos I have of him are very limited in contents.

Secondly, more aspects of the hospital could be explored. For example, how they obtain their medicine, which involves herbal practices. By obtaining this information, it would contribute positively to this documentary by recording local people who venture into the mountains and gather their own medical herbs which inherits a lot of traditions. A specific kind of herb may be used to tell the story. Also I could tell the story of how Thinley Phuntsok buys medicine from online but there wasn’t a chance to record him through this process.

Thirdly, I think I can do more to provide the “sense of place”, I kept this in my mind of showing “a sense of place” all the time when I was taking videos, but I think I
was too nervous and tried to record everything. I think I should have been concerned more about the imagery of the video, like the imagery impact of the videos. But a lot of times I was too anxious to record what was happening and forgot to make a “good picture.” I now realized that I should adopt a more relaxed mood when I was doing my project. Due to the time frame, the current season was another element I had to deal with. It was early spring and the green on the land is still growing back which created a yellow colored landscape and dusty weather. However, the Tibetan area is one of the most beautiful places in the world, and it is important to show that in this documentary to provide a wholesome picture of that area. In this sense, it would be more powerful to tell the idea that how the local NGOs forms their ideology based on their own environment, culture and challenges. When I was there, the mountains were bold and yellow, so it would be good if I can take videos of other seasons especially the beautiful summer.

Fourthly, other people who work for the hospital may be an interesting aspect of it. I did take some videos of people working in the hospital but most of the videos were not interesting. I would like to interview them and put it in the video to show a different view. But I was working under time constraint and I didn’t find a chance to do so.

Fifthly, the comments from outside were an ignored aspect in my project. I did read some literature from a famous author who specializes in writing books relevant to the Tibetan population and culture. I contacted him before I started my project. I think it might be helpful to ask him and other people from the outside world to comment
on the story. Then the documentary can show more social aspect toward Tibet in China and provide advice to the government.

   Technically speaking, I think there are a lot of aspects in my project that can be improved. Firstly, I didn’t write up a story line before I went to the hospital. I knew too little about the life there and I wasn’t sure about the story. After I got there and started filming, I had a vague idea of what story I wanted and what to focus when I was doing my work everyday. There were a few times that I thought there was nothing to film any more but I found out later I still missed a lot of things. I think writing the storyline is very important for this kind of documentary because the photographer could easily get lost. Even if I had a vague idea of what I was doing, some videos turned out not good enough to tell the story. But if I have a storyline, I would look for specific images and record the important ones to tell the story.

   In addition, when I first started editing, I still wanted to include everything. A lot of the videos seemed important to me but later I realized they were actually redundant. I think it was important to show the story to other people to see if they understood the story. I was having trouble making a comprehensive documentary because I was too familiar with the videos. A lot of text information other than just the image was important for my documentary because it couldn’t be understood thoroughly by a person who has little knowledge of the content. Having a focus of the story is important too.

   Through the courses I’ve taken, I learned a lot about how to be a journalist, how to get access and how to get information. As a photographer, I learned to work
independently and build good communication with my subjects. But I still think I haven’t become a good photographer yet. Sometimes I can see I’m trying too hard which made me nervous when taking photos. And I should have enjoyed it more than I feel pressured about it. I’m still learning and that was always the fun part. To me, this project doesn’t seem completed and I wish I could work on it in the future when I have the chance.

I always wanted to show the audience what appears in front of my eyes without putting in my subjective observation, but a lot of times it looks too ordinary to appear in a journalism documentary. I think I tend to forget that I’m telling a story rather than showing who they (my subjects) are. But I think it is possible to do both, and I was just not sophisticated enough in this practice.

If given a chance to do this project again, I would definitely work harder on the storyline of the documentary. I would write a logic storyline of the documentary even before I start taking videos. Even though it is hard to write a story without being there and understanding the culture it can be done while taking videos. This approach will help me putting together the video when editing them. One other thing is the lighting.
IV. Abundant Physical Evidence

The videos and photographs I took consist of about 150 GB on the disk and the documentary video I edited is about 17 minutes. The following evidence consists of two parts that are a selection of photos and videos and audio log sheets.

a) Selection of Photos and Videos

The sample room of YYMA
The video clip of an interview with Mr. Karpu, the director of YYMA is displayed.

The total interview is about 40 minutes.

Karma, an employee of YYMA, arranges the samples in the sample room.
Thinley Phuntsok went to see a patient in the evening on March 4, 2013.

Lamas pray in the Dzongsar Temple.
Dzongsar monastery is built along the slope of the mountain.
Dama village
Dama village
Tibetan traditional Thangka painters
Thinley Phuntsok prescribes for the patients who come to the hospital.

Luore Phuntsok prescribes for his patients from all around.
As a famous doctor, Mr. Luore Phuntsok sees 30-40 patients a day.

During the empowerment, people in the village gather together to be prayed by the monks in the monastery.
The ceremony of empowerment.

Young monks walk across the bridge.
The bottles are specially made to store medicine.

Mr. Phuntsok sees his patient.
Employees in the Tibetan hospital have lunch together.

Thinley Phuntsok checks the herbs they have that will be used to produce medicine in the back of the hospital.
A video interview with the patients who come from another village
Mr. Luore Phunstok walks in the Tibetan Hospital.
A view of the Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital.
A scene of the Dama Village
An interview with Thinley Phuntsok

An interview with a lama who came to buy medicine
An interview with Thinley Phuntsok

The edited video
### Audio Log Sheet

**Date**: 3.4  
**Video Name**: untitled-492

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:01-00:28</td>
<td>我昨天喝了一点牛肉汤, 有二十几天我站不起来, 今天我也站不起来</td>
<td>I drank some beef soup, and for twenty some days, I couldn’t stand up. Today I couldn’t stand up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:28</td>
<td>你喝了牛肉汤有没有不舒服的</td>
<td>Did you feel sick after drinking the soup?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:34-00:42</td>
<td>牛肉汤喝了没有特别的感觉, 但是感冒很严重</td>
<td>I didn’t feel much after drinking it. But my cold is very bad.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:42-00:48</td>
<td>全身都疼, 膝盖特别疼, 右边身体比较疼一点, 疼得出汗</td>
<td>I feel it hurts everywhere especially my knees. The right side of my body hurts even more. I’m sweating because of that.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:50</td>
<td>你以前受伤过吗？</td>
<td>Did you get injured before?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:01-01:23</td>
<td>是的，受伤过。疼得忍不住了所以才叫你过来</td>
<td>Yes I was injured before. It was so hurtful that I called you.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:23-01:32</td>
<td>我没吃过其他药，</td>
<td>I didn’t take other medicine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:35</td>
<td>把嘴张开</td>
<td>Open your mouth please.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:35</td>
<td>我有 mubo</td>
<td>I have mubo (a kind of disease).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:47</td>
<td>眼睛不舒服吗</td>
<td>Is there anything wrong with your eyes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:58</td>
<td>没有病, 但是因为这次感冒让我眼睛睁开比较困难, 感冒很久了</td>
<td>I don’t have other problems with my eyes, but this time my cold was too heavy that it makes it hard to open my eyes. I’ve had this cold for very long.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:23</td>
<td>以前有没有眼病</td>
<td>Did you have any eye problems before?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:27</td>
<td>除了背疼还有哪儿疼？</td>
<td>Does anywhere hurt except for your back?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:27</td>
<td>右边的身体，和脚都疼</td>
<td>My right side of my body and my feet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Chinese Translation</td>
<td>English Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:02</td>
<td>看起来不错！</td>
<td>It looks good!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.6  Video Name 视频名称:mvi_9042.mov

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:02</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.6  Video Name 视频名称: mvi_9042.mov

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01:00</td>
<td>这个还没有记录</td>
<td>I haven’t recorded this one yet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.6  Video Name 视频名称: mvi_9043.mov

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:36</td>
<td>多少钱</td>
<td>How much?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 块钱</td>
<td></td>
<td>Seventeen yuan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Chinese Translation</td>
<td>English Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:23</td>
<td>你拿下这个</td>
<td>Can you take this for a while?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:12</td>
<td>没有其他人了</td>
<td>There’s no one.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:58</td>
<td>我要筷子！</td>
<td>I need chopsticks!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:14</td>
<td>你准备好了吗？</td>
<td>Are you ready?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Chinese Translation 中文</td>
<td>English Translation 英文</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:36</td>
<td>车子就放在前面</td>
<td>I’ll probably park the car there.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:47</td>
<td>你自己看着办吧。</td>
<td>Wherever you like.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:05</td>
<td>需不需要 daxie?</td>
<td>Do you need Daxie (a kind of medication)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:07</td>
<td>要的。</td>
<td>Yes, I do.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:33</td>
<td>要检查小便</td>
<td>I need to check your urine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>是安那的吗</td>
<td>Is this Anna’s?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:35</td>
<td>不是，是我的</td>
<td>No, it’s mine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:39</td>
<td>哦，是你的</td>
<td>Ok.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:41</td>
<td>是的</td>
<td>Yeah.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>我的头特别痛，眼睛也痛，看到太阳特别不舒服</td>
<td>My head hurts badly and my eyes too. It feels quite irritating when I look at the sun.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>你几岁</td>
<td>What’s your age?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:55</td>
<td>31岁</td>
<td>Thirty-one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:06</td>
<td>你头疼吗</td>
<td>Your head hurts?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:10</td>
<td>我这里痛</td>
<td>This part hurts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Chinese Translation</td>
<td>English Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:14</td>
<td>把那个拿过来</td>
<td>Bring that here please.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:20</td>
<td>你不能吃油腻</td>
<td>You should eat greasy food.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:27</td>
<td>你不能吃陈的,坏的,发霉的菜</td>
<td>You shouldn't eat old and spoiled food, especially with mold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:41</td>
<td>这个是哲马拉木的</td>
<td>This is for Zhemalamu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:51</td>
<td>22岁</td>
<td>Twenty-two.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:10</td>
<td>是不是很想睡觉?</td>
<td>Does she feel drowsy?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:21</td>
<td>是的,这里疼,这边都疼</td>
<td>It hurts here, and this side too.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:47</td>
<td>什么东西不能吃</td>
<td>It there some food she shouldn’t eat?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>陈的东西,油腻的东西,发霉的</td>
<td>Don’t eat old food and greasy food. Molded food too.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.7
Video Name 视频名称:mvi_9068

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.7
Video Name 视频名称: MVI9070

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3.7
Video Name 视频名称: 9071
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:17</td>
<td>你叫什么名字</td>
<td>What’s your name?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:18</td>
<td>名字叫 norbu</td>
<td>My name is Norbu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:32</td>
<td>我 32 岁</td>
<td>I’m 32.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:37</td>
<td>眼睛里长了一个小东西</td>
<td>There’s a small lump in my eye.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:54</td>
<td>你要多久的 药</td>
<td>How much medicine do you want?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:55</td>
<td>一个月的药</td>
<td>The amount of one month please.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表
Date 日期:  3.7                                      Video Name 视频名称: 9072

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:03</td>
<td>我胸口疼</td>
<td>My chest hurts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:13</td>
<td>我吃了 daxi，已经好点了</td>
<td>I had Daxie before and it feels better already.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>谢谢</td>
<td>Thank you.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表
Date 日期:  3.7                                      Video Name 视频名称: 9073

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:04</td>
<td>你多大了</td>
<td>How old are you?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:06</td>
<td>我 48 岁了</td>
<td>I’m 48 years old.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:21</td>
<td>摇晃一下</td>
<td>Shake it a little bit please.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:52</td>
<td>药在这里拿吗</td>
<td>Do I get the medicine here?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>不在，药在藏医院</td>
<td>No, you will get it at the hospital.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表
Date 日期:  3.7                                      Video Name 视频名称: 9079
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:00</td>
<td>胆以前做了手术，前几年又开始痛</td>
<td>I had a surgery on my gallbladder before and it started hurting a few years ago.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:08</td>
<td>叫什么名字</td>
<td>What’s your name?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:13</td>
<td>年龄多大</td>
<td>What’s your age?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:26</td>
<td>把小便倒过来看看</td>
<td>Can you turn the urine upside down?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:32</td>
<td>摇晃一下</td>
<td>Please shake it a little bit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:46</td>
<td>两边肋骨很疼</td>
<td>Both sides of my ribs hurt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:16</td>
<td>你大概需要几天的药</td>
<td>How much medicine do you need?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:21</td>
<td>我要 50 块钱的药</td>
<td>Fifty yuan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:24</td>
<td>应该可以吃半个月</td>
<td>It should last for half a month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:56</td>
<td>还有一个是叫 norbu songmo（挪不让姆）的，他 70 岁了</td>
<td>There’s another one who’s name is Norbu Songmo. She’s seventy years old.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:25</td>
<td>她 70 岁了吗</td>
<td>She’s seventy?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:26</td>
<td>是的</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:36</td>
<td>她有好多病，血压高</td>
<td>She has a lot of problems and her blood pressure is high.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:42</td>
<td>她主要哪里不舒服</td>
<td>What’s her main problem?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:45</td>
<td>全身都有不舒服，还恶心，眼睛也看得不太清楚</td>
<td>She feels unwell her whole body and she feels sick too. Her eyes can’t see very well.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03:05</td>
<td>咳嗽得比较厉害</td>
<td>She coughs badly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03:24</td>
<td>要多久的</td>
<td>How much medicine do you need?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>一个月的</td>
<td>For one month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03:41</td>
<td>我还需要发烧的药</td>
<td>I also need medicine for the fevers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>那边就可以拿</td>
<td>You can get it there (at the hospital).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3 / 8 Video Name 视频名称: MVI_9230.mov
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:57</td>
<td>水从这个山上引下来可以对更多的人有好处</td>
<td>If we channel the water from this hill down, it will benefit more people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:23-01:32</td>
<td>这个水从哪里引过来</td>
<td>Where to channel the water?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:35</td>
<td>上面应该有另外一个可以引的水源</td>
<td>There should be another source of water we can channel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:42</td>
<td>那个是什么样的</td>
<td>How is it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:46</td>
<td>另外那个比这个大一点</td>
<td>The other one is bigger than this one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:57</td>
<td>是比这个大的吗</td>
<td>Larger than this one?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:00</td>
<td>是的</td>
<td>Yeah.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:05</td>
<td>那这样的话可以汇到一起</td>
<td>In this case we can bring them tighter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:10</td>
<td>那下面可以</td>
<td>We can do it down there?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:20</td>
<td>可以</td>
<td>We can.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:26</td>
<td>肯定需要包一个车</td>
<td>I need to rent a car.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>是的</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

Date 日期: 3 / 8  Video Name 视频名称: mvi9229

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01:12</td>
<td>水是从上面引还是从下面引好</td>
<td>Do we channel the water from upper site or the lower site?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:14</td>
<td>从下面引比较好</td>
<td>It’s better that we channel the water from lower site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:35</td>
<td>这样弄应该可以</td>
<td>It can work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:48</td>
<td>哪一种</td>
<td>Which one?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:53</td>
<td>那样应该可以</td>
<td>That should work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:00</td>
<td>应该不会冻吧</td>
<td>It won’t freeze right?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:07</td>
<td>那样好一点</td>
<td>That one works better.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:46</td>
<td>叫一下吧</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

03:10
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 03</td>
<td>不是的</td>
<td>No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00: 13</td>
<td>我需要两盒</td>
<td>I need two boxes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00: 35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 03</td>
<td>48 块钱</td>
<td>Forty-eight yuan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00: 13</td>
<td>我需要两盒</td>
<td>I need two boxes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 53</td>
<td>病了什么</td>
<td>What’s wrong?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>头晕</td>
<td>I feel dizzy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>多久了</td>
<td>How long have you feel this way?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5－6 天，生了孩子以后就是这样，差不多两个月了</td>
<td>Five to six days. It feels like this after I give birth to a baby. It’s been about two months.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01: 19</td>
<td>有没有叹气</td>
<td>Did you sigh a lot?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>有时候有</td>
<td>Sometimes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01: 41</td>
<td>孩子生了两个月，流鼻血两三</td>
<td>I’ve born the baby for two months and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
天，有没有什么问题

my nose bled for two or three days. Is it serious?

01: 46 应该没事
You should be fine.

02: 09 是拉肚子吗
Did you have diarrhea?

有时候拉肚子，有时候也流鼻血

Sometimes I have diarrhea sometimes I have a nasal bleeding.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 54</td>
<td>我来自康德格宗萨，我叫赤乃彭措，今年 34 岁，</td>
<td>I’m from Kham Dzongsar. My name is Chinaipengcuo. I’m thirty-four years old.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01: 59</td>
<td>我是德格宗萨藏医院副院长</td>
<td>I’m the vice-president of Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02: 06</td>
<td>开始学藏医二十多年，从爸爸洛热那里学的</td>
<td>I have learned Tibetan medicine for more than twenty years. I learn it from my dad Luorepengcuo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>爸爸受。。。的传授，医术很好，我们也跟着学</td>
<td>My dad learned medicine from his teacher and his</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:**  3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 28

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time 时间</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 06</td>
<td>需要什么</td>
<td>What do you need?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00: 18</td>
<td>仁切玛交（rechen monjor）需要吗</td>
<td>Do you need Rechen Monjor?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>不需要</td>
<td>No, I don’t.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>（扎）帝大结巴需要 200 块</td>
<td>Dida Jieba needs 200 yuan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:**  3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time 时间</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>52，53，54，55。</td>
<td>52，53，54，55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:**  3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 33

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time 时间</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00: 13</td>
<td>另外一个应该不要取</td>
<td>The other one should not be needed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:**  3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 43
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>病人应该 46，7，脚都肿了</td>
<td>The patient is 46 or 47. His feet are swollen.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

还有一个病人得了 zajiu，手脚肿，经络痛
There’s another patient who had Zajiu (a kind of disease), his hands and feet hurt. His meridians hurt too.

年纪大的吃这些药，年纪小的病人吃这些药
The older patients take these medicine, the younger patients take these medicine.

以后需要药的时候我联系你，钱可以打过来，药帮我寄过去
In the future if I need the medicine I will contact you. I can transfer the
money to you and please mail the medicine to me.

---

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期：** 3.9  **Video Name 视频名称:** 49

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation 中文</th>
<th>English Translation 英文</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00:42</td>
<td>我是康区德格宗萨人，今年 34 岁</td>
<td>I’m from Dege Dzongsar, Kham. I’m thirty-four years old now.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:06</td>
<td>我是医生，也是还在学习</td>
<td>I’m a doctor. I’m still learning too.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:06</td>
<td>学藏医 23 年，小的时候就从我爸爸那里开始学，我爸爸叫洛热彭措</td>
<td>I’ve learned Tibetan medicine for twenty-three years. I started to learn from my dad when I was a kid. My father’s name is Luore Pengcuo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:22</td>
<td>关于藏医院，在这儿有四十多个工作人员</td>
<td>About the Tibetan hospital, there are 40 staff here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:37</td>
<td>有 8 个医生，他们当中，我是副院长</td>
<td>There are eight doctors. Among them, I’m the vice-president.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:44</td>
<td>院长是我爸爸</td>
<td>The president of the hospital is my father.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:51</td>
<td>病人来自四面八方，有白玉，Nyrang Ruo，等等</td>
<td>Our patients come from all around. The places include Baiyu, Nyrang Ruo, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:10</td>
<td>有人骑自行车，有人骑摩托车，有人，有开车的，有人走 2.3 或 4 天的路来</td>
<td>Some ride a bicycle, some ride motorcycle, some drive here. Sometime it takes patients two, three, even four days to get here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:29</td>
<td>因为我爸爸是有名的医生，</td>
<td>Because my father is a very famous doctor.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are a lot of people who know my dad. His medical skills are very high and so many people know it.

I believe in Buddhism. It is hard to express my belief in language.

We serve patients 24 hours a day.

Sometimes when we are eating, I will see the patients who visit here. Sometimes in the mid of the night, I have to visit patients at their homes.

But if I say it’s 24-hour service, it wouldn’t be totally. It’s just the time we rest is not for certain.

Except for patients from the local area, I have visited many places to see patients. For example, there was one day, a patient named Atsok was said very sick. So I went to visit him.

He was a patient who’s older than 70.

His illness is related to fever. After I got enough information about the situation, I gave him the medications. And I told him about the ways to take care of him.
到这个时，我心里很开心。They called me that night later and told me that he had been a lot better. When I heard this, I was very happy in my heart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01:08</td>
<td>问我我爸爸对我的看法，</td>
<td>You ask about how my dad looks at me.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:16</td>
<td>爸爸对孩子的看法应该不用问， 但是爸爸对我看法很好</td>
<td>There is no need to ask about how a father looks at his child. But my dad thinks highly of me.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:** 3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 53

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>来打算在爸爸那里继续学习继续做医生，</td>
<td>In the future, I want to continue learning medicine from my dad and keep doing my job as a doctor.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:** 3.9  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 54

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese Translation</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>问我我对女儿将来的打算，我女儿将来希望信仰佛教，成为医生。就是这两个期望，没有其他的。</td>
<td>You asked about my expectations of my daughter to be in the future. I hope she believe in Buddhism and become a doctor. There’s nothing else except for these two.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Audio Log Sheet
音频记录表

**Date 日期:** 3 / 11  
**Video Name 视频名称:** 20130311dege180
Time | Chinese Translation 中文 | English Translation 英文
---|---|---
00:25 | 我叫教渡 | My name is Jodhu.
00:46 | 我是给药的 | My job is to give the medicine to patients.
01:02 | 工作一年多，早上在佛堂念经 | I’ve worked here for over one year. In the morning I also chant sutras in the prayer room.
01:27 | 因为有病人需要治疗 | Because there are patients who need treatment.
00:17 | 为了病人 | It’s for the patients.
00:32 | 所以我要给药 | That’s why I give the medicine.
01:25 | 在上面的佛堂念经可以让药有更好的效果 | After praying for the medicine in the prayer room, the medicine will have a better effect.
01:27 | 有更好的效果就可以帮助别人 | When it has better effects, it can help more people.
02:32 | 每天不停的念经可以让药有更好的效果 | The medicine will have a better effect if we chant sutras everyday.
01:03 | 今天是好日子 | Today is a good day.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Chinese</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01:07</td>
<td>好，好</td>
<td>Okay.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:12</td>
<td>明天早上过去</td>
<td>Come tomorrow morning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:27</td>
<td>因为有病人需要治疗</td>
<td>There were patients who need treatment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:29</td>
<td>明天几点上课</td>
<td>What time will the classes begin tomorrow?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:32</td>
<td>明天8点40上课，8点半要过来</td>
<td>Tomorrow at 8:40 am. It’s better to get to school at 8:30.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
V. Analysis

a) Statement of Topic

After the Chinese economic reform in the 1980s, China's economy has grown dramatically, changing people's life and Chinese society. The economic reform has brought opportunities for entrepreneurs and start-up businesses, which made a part of the Chinese population rich. The newly formed middle class in the end of 20th century and the beginning of 21st century is composed of people who have a high living standard and also a yearning for civil society (Zhang, 2003). The boom of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other civil society organizations is considered one of the significant developments of Chinese society to bring about a gradual bottom up reform (Morton, 2005, p. 521). China’s grassroots nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), which started to form in the early 1990s and boomed in the early 21st century are important to be studied for their contribution of transforming the country to a more civic one.

China has an authoritarian society in which its media system has adopted the authoritarian tradition. After the People’s Republic of China was founded in 1949, the media in China adopted a wartime propaganda ethos and functioned as a “political tool” and an integral part of the state apparatus of the government, a role that was officially defined as the “throat and tongue” of the Party (Cao, 2010, p. 139). As Cao (2010) articulates, “one primary responsibility of Chinese journalism is to ‘guide public opinion’” and to “distinguish ‘right’ from ‘wrong’” (p. 140).
After the economic reform in the past three decades, Chinese media has retained its mouthpiece function while achieving a profit in the market (Cao, 2010). Interestingly, with the economic development and emergence of the Internet, the Chinese government has become less hegemonic in dealing with media and “control has to be exercised through negotiation rather than imposition” (Cao, 2010, p. 145). As a result, the media has begun to publish more and more stories about issues and social conflicts. However, the media is not totally free from the government’s interference. The party-state still possesses the continuing ability to suppress oppositional ideas and prevent the formation of counterhegemonic alliances between various protesting social forces (Zhao, 2008, p. 62). Zhao (2008) argues, reporting on “numerous protests by expropriated farmers, laid-off state enterprise workers, and uncompensated pensioners, as well as other disenfranchised and dispossessed groups is almost impossible” (p. 62). With relatively looser control over today’s Chinese media, reporting on counterhegemonic alliances is still highly sensitive and even impossible.

Chinese NGOs on the other hand, stand for different voices in society and they contribute to a more civic society. They are different from counterhegemonic protesting groups because they are not totally against the central government’s policies. They tend to help solve social issues by volunteering and charity. By doing so, NGOs create their own voices as a third sector that is autonomous from the state (Morton, 2005, p. 519). Their increasing power of articulating social issues and influencing how to solve social issues may create conflicts and tension with the central government. Recent studies of
Chinese nongovernmental organizations have been focused on NGOs and civil society (Shieh & Deng, 2011; Tang & Zhan, 2006; Chen, 2010), use of the Internet by NGOs (Sima, 2011), grassroots NGOs in an authoritarian state (Spires, 2011), development of environmental NGOs in China (Ru & Ortolano, 2009), implications for domestic social and political reform (Morton, 2005). While most of these studies focus on the political impact brought about by these NGOs and a lot of scholars have addressed the grassroots movement in China to suggest an emerging civil society, little research has been conducted in the field of media representation of this group. This research, which is aimed at analyzing Chinese media’s representation of NGOs, may serve to fill this gap. Studying the news coverage of Chinese NGOs sheds light on how Chinese media perform their role with the tension between greater freedom to publish stories about issues and social conflicts and the mission to suppress oppositional ideas.

b) Theoretical Framework

The representation process mainly ties in with the journalism theory of framing. Framing is a concept in communication research developed in several different disciplines including psychology, psychiatry, sociology, anthropology, epistemology, ethnography and linguistics and communication (Johnson-Cartee, 2005, p.160). It is used in the research of mass media to address the media’s effect on audience and society. When reporting news stories, journalists write in narratives that are developed within their culture to give meanings to the narratives so that they can be understood. Frames in media give emphasis on particular values, facts and problems in society and provide
perspectives of approaching certain issues. By analyzing news frames, the underlying social factors such as political power, culture and historical background can be identified to achieve a deeper understanding of the media and society.

c) Literature Review

1. Mapping the Chinese NGOs.

With the emergence of Red Maple Women’s Psychological Counseling Center and Friends of Nature in the early 1990s, China has witnessed a rapid growth of NGOs in the early 2000s, which constitute the marker of an emerging civil society (Shieh & Deng, 2011). These NGOs include environmental organizations; organizations providing services to needy populations such as migrant workers, battered women and the disabled; homeowners’ associations; cultural and recreational associations; and professional associations (Shieh & Deng, 2011). Although no reliable number of such NGOs in China is available, some previous research suggests that by 2005 there were at least 2,768 environmental nongovernmental organizations (ENGOs) (Tang & Zhan, 2006). The estimated total number of NGOs goes as high as 1.5 million (Shieh & Deng, 2011). In recent years, Chinese NGOs have actively participated in environmental protection and education (Sima, 2011), crisis alleviation such as 2008 Sichuan earthquake, SARS and HIV/AIDS (Shieh & Deng, 2011).

2. Framing analysis of social movements.

Numerous researchers have explored the concept of framing in the field of journalism. Entman (1993) defines framing as the following:
To frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation. (p. 52)

By giving selective information to readers, framing is being practiced by journalists to weave a value system in which the journalists and citizens live. Similarly, Reese explains that, “Frames are organizing principles that are socially shared and persistent over time, that work symbolically to meaningfully structure the social world” (2001, p. 11). He also suggests that the study of framing helps provide tools for examining human knowledge structures.

In addition to giving priority to particular values, frames found in media can also serve to define political issues and as a result enhance the political power structure. For example, Nelson, Clawson, and Oxley (1997) argue, “framing is the process by which a communication source such as a news organization [or a political leader, public relations officer, political advertising consultant, or news consumer], defines and constructs a political issue or public controversy” (p. 576).

Framing can also be explored in the perspective of a journalism practice. Johnson-Cartee (2005) explains the framing process of news reporting as a “learned” craftsmanship based on the professional skills built in the journalism industry. She says:

In their efforts to define the situation, select a news frame, and then build upon that news frame, reporters seek evidence, whether in the form of
expert testimony, written reports, public record or eyewitness accounts, that affirms their approach to the story. (p. 162)

She also addresses that the assigned responsibility is another important component in news framing that has been widely explored. Researchers such as Iyengar (1989) have categorized issue responsibility into two categories: causal responsibility, or the emphasis on the origin of the social problem; and treatment responsibility, or the emphasis on who or what has the means to resolve the social problem, whether by solving the social problem, alleviating the social problem, or perpetuating the social problem (Johnson-Cartee, 2005). The effect of framing can change the applicability of particular thoughts and result in their activation and use in evaluations (Pan & Kosicki, 2001). Pan and Kosicki (2001) describe framing as a “strategic action in a discursive form” (p. 39) and “framing an issue is to participate in public deliberation strategically” (p. 59).

When studying media representation of a social group in a social movement, framing analysis is a common approach. In 2005, Bronstein analyzed the framing of third wave feminism to compare the frames that have been used by journalists for second wave feminism. In her research, five major frames were identified in news stories from mainstream U.S. media. Bronstein (2005) found that “journalists have relied heavily upon some of the stock frames that were used to construct the second wave to depict third wave feminism” (p. 795) and the using of frames resulted in the media’s providing its audiences “a limited and partial account of modern feminism” (p. 795). Bronstein’s research shows how the frames used by journalists in the coverage of a social movement
were constructed. It also provides insights of how these frames could be identified, articulated and compared.

Maeseele (2011) examined whether or to what extent the media in Northern Belgium facilitates the democratic debate over the GM (genetically modified) crop, a debate brought about by the coalition of social movements/NGOs (non-governmental organizations) in the second half of 1990s. The debate is characterized by its bearing of “risk conflicts” a quality also possessed by the particular frames identified in news articles. Maeseele (2011) found that two examined newspapers prefer science and industry over movements for the interpretation of news events while the other two have an opposite preference. Maeseele’s (2011) research provided hints that NGOs as a third sector of society are considered by the media as less legitimate than the government in the news reports.

Edgerly, Toft and Veden’s (2011) analysis of the protest paradigm in the coverage of immigrants’ rights protests in 2006 determined the protest paradigm was a powerful organizing principle in media coverage where organizers could evaluate their discursive resources as effective countermeasures. They argue that an “issue frame” was caused by the organizers’ reliance on “strategically ambiguous terms such as immigration reform and amnesty” (p. 329). In the media coverage, the representation of the protest group put emphasis on the ambiguous “frames” rather than on the ideology of the group. Hence, Edgerly et al. (2011) conclude, “Mass-mediated polysemy presents a difficult challenge for political activists who seek to use the mass media to broadcast their goals” (p. 328).
The research suggested that media coverage of protests within the conventional issue frames might cause the failure of communicating the real ideology of protest groups and as a result, disrespect their value.

A similar example was examined by Watkins (2001) of the framing in network television news coverage of the Million Man March. He found the news framing was patterned by Louis Farrakhan, a central character being reported on, and his appeal as a deviant newsworthy personality. He claims that by using Farrakhan as their primary focus in their framing practices, the news media omitted other frames that “could have rendered the march and the complex web of factors that ignited interests in it more recognizable” (p. 98). He concludes, “While the media spotlight generates attention for organized protest, it seldom, if ever, promotes the goals of movement practitioners” (p. 99). Such media representation of protests uses popular narratives to tell the story while losing the information of the goals of these groups.

On the contrary, media representation can also lead to successful social movement. For example, Sandberg (2006) combined discourse analysis and framing analysis to analyze an anti-globalization movement organization, Association pour la taxation des transactions financiers pour l’aide aux citoyens’ (ATTAC) success in Norway in 2001. Sandberg focused on the perspective of the social constructivism that emphasizes “the production of knowledge” (p. 210). Sandberg suggests that “the well developed collective action framing” (p. 222) may be the reason of ATTAC Norway’s success in 2001 because the discourses embedding it may “have given the organization
the crucial values of novelty and “truth”” (p. 222). In the media’s representation of the organization, the emphasized values of “novelty” and “truth” are crucial for the success of the movement.

While studies of America and European countries are useful, it is important to examine Chinese media framing because the Chinese media system is inherently different. In China, the media system has an authoritarian tradition and is controlled strictly in the reporting of diverse social groups. Chen (2005) analyzed the framing of Xinhua News Agency’s coverage of the new religious movement in China. His discourse analysis provided insight on how journalists told the story of Falun Gong and the government crackdown. By identifying the frames and narratives in the news reports, Chen found that Xinhua News Agency portrayed the Falun Gong group as “deviant”, “dangerous”, “evil” and an organization needed to be contained (p. 30). He also states that the Xinhua serves as a “lapdog” function in the Chinese government’s anti-Falun Gong campaign (p. 30).

Although little research has addressed Chinese media’s representation of social movements, there are scholars who have conducted discourse analysis of Chinese media representation of social problems. For example, Tong (2009) conducted a discourse analysis of three cases in Chinese media’s coverage of social problems. He found that when covering a social riot in China, the newspaper Dahe Daily originally created an “opposition” between people and the government, but it had to make revisions to conceal social conflicts and lessen political criticism (Tong, 2009, p. 598). The topics of social
problems are considered to be “political minefields” (Tong, 2009, p. 609) and any improper approach to them may cause political crackdown on news media (Tong, 2009). Unlike the result of Chen’s (2005) research, Tong points out that journalists were actually willing to tell the truth and provide criticism of the government but there existed a compromise of content to protect the newspaper.

Based on the literature discussed above, it is expected that Chinese news media are still under tight government control. Despite their freedom on reporting some issues and conflicts, they are considered as the mouthpiece of the party. Although Chinese NGOs are not as controversial as protest groups, they have an increasing ability of endangering the value of the party. Looking at the relationship between journalistic structure, political power and social sector, I ask the following research questions:

**RQ1**: Are Chinese grassroots NGOs framed in terms of an issue or a personality?

**RQ2**: Are Chinese grassroots NGOs portrayed as adversarial to the government’s policy?

**RQ3**: Are Chinese NGOs framed as a third sector in Chinese society?

In order to answer these questions, I analyzed the coverage in a single media outlet, Xinhuanet.com. As the online English news website of Xinhua News Agency, Xinhuanet.com is the most used source of Chinese news that is open to all the other countries in the world.
d) Methodology

A qualitative content analysis of Chinese media Xinhua News Agency’s coverage of NGOs in China was conducted. The news articles were gathered on xinhuanet.com, the English website of Xinhua News Agency. All the articles on the website are in English. As one of China’s largest state news agencies, Xinhua News Agency is considered to be a government bureaucracy and a political and ideological apparatus for the ruling Chinese Communist Party (CCP) since it was founded more than 80 years ago (Hong, 2011, p. 377). News articles published by Xinhua News Agency are representative of the discourse developed between the power of CCP and the democratic values embody in the NGOs.

I searched key words such as grassroots NGO, Chinese NGO to identify the articles that have a theme of Chinese NGOs from the date of January 1, 2008 to December 31, 2012. I found 88 articles that used or contained information of Chinese NGOs. I chose the year of 2008 because after the Sichuan earthquake in May 2008 the participation of volunteers in NGOs during the relief of the disaster has increased the awareness of the value of NGOs from the Chinese state and the media (Shieh & Deng, 2011). Since no preexisting frames of Chinese NGOs have been identified in previous studies, I established the frames using constant comparative method. This involves an inductive process of forming a theory by comparing, namely coding, categorizing, delineating categories and connecting them (Boeije, 2002). By reading the text, I created a unique code for any new idea presented by the text. The newly established code was
compared with the previous ones to see if it elucidated any new meaning on the theme or if the existing codes needed to be modified in light of the current one (Frohlich, 2013). After examining all the materials available, I categorized similar codes into a single category that formed a frame. During the coding process, I specifically examined aspects of news framing, including types of stories, sources used, topics, and general evaluative orientation of news frames.

e) Findings

Instead of the expected frames of “deviant”, “dangerous” and “evil” (Chen, 2005, p. 30), the “opposition” against government authority (Tong, 2009), the stories of Chinese NGOs in the news reports were portrayed as a friendly third sector between the government and citizens in Chinese society. Among the 88 articles, 35 articles quoted NGO documents or used comments of NGO workers; 25 articles were short news reports about NGOs; 2 articles were official reports of Chinese NGOs; and 25 articles were long feature stories of specific NGOs. In the articles that quoted NGO documents and workers, the content was informative and the NGOs were viewed as a social sector that offered an aspect in specific social issues. Short news reports told stories that were associated with NGOs. The official reports were articles written in an official manner that provide statistics and the status of Chinese NGOs. Feature stories of NGOs were longer pieces of human-interest in-depth stories. Among these articles, five frames can be identified.

A. Associated topics. Topics reported with quotes from NGOs include environmental issues, education, AIDS preventions, elderly welfare, animal welfare,
domestic abuse, women and family issues, the gay community, medical assistance, hospice care, smoking-control, human trafficking and immigrant workers. Among the above topics, AIDS prevention, smoking-control environmental issues and education issues were the most prominent. For example, a news report about China’s suspension of closure of rural schools cited an NGO report on the social issue of fast disappearing high schools in rural area. It said,

An average of 63 rural primary schools and three junior high schools disappeared each day between 2000 and 2010, according to an NGO report issued by the Beijing-based 21st Century Education Research Institute (CERC). (Tang, 2012)

The citation provided specific statistics and it shows that the Xinhua News Agency accepts NGO as a valid source of information. In an article about a newly introduced program by the government that helps young offenders, Chinese Society for Juvenile Delinquency Prevention Research, the only NGO in the country that specializes in young offenders was quoted to provide comments about this program. The secretary-general of the organization pointed out that the new system still needed exploration because “there’s no standard about what kind of people are suitable for the role” (Cao, 2012) and the system “isn’t independent and it must be used with other articles” (Cao, 2012). The comments made by the NGO served as a voice that is valid to be heard but different from the government in the news. A similar example can be seen in a news article about a man who founded a school for migrant workers’ children. As the story concerned the social issue of restrictions of educational resources to migrant workers’ children in China, an
NGO worker was quoted to comment on the issue.

The existence of schools for migrant workers’ children reflects that public schools cannot provide enough educational resources for the children, and that the government did not actually shoulder its responsibility to provide equal access to education for everybody,” said Sun Heng, founder of a Beijing-based NGO named Migrant Workers Home Cultural and Development Center. (Lu, 2011)

In *Xinhua News*, non-governmental organizations, though not associated with the government, were frequently quoted when it came to social issues. Their voice mostly appeared in the field of education, animal welfare, environment, etc. As a result, Chinese NGOs have the ability of making their voice heard under the circumstances that appeared in the articles. Generally speaking, the NGOs in China have gradually been recognized as a social sector that is capable of commenting on the social issues and government policies.

Most of the topics associated with NGOs were those that have no political controversies, those of social issues that call for the awareness of the whole society. But the issue of human rights, which has drawn special attention from foreign countries, was actually positively associated with Chinese NGOs in the news. An article called “Official: NGOs can play bigger role in China’s human rights protection” described “the rapid growth of non-governmental organizations in China has played an increasingly important role in human rights protection” (Yan, 2008). The article said,

In a paper presented to a human rights seminar here, Wang described the NGOs
as "the third force and mechanism with a special advantage, besides the government and the market, to contribute to the improvement and protection of human rights." He added: "They have played a positive role in China's cause of human rights protection, which regards the rights to live and to develop as core issues." (Yan, 2008)

The topics associated with NGOs were all associated with the general benefit of society. Negative coverage that might bring political controversy was not seen in the data.

**B. Human interest.** In the news coverage, a major way of portraying the NGO workers was to personalize the story by featuring individual lives. This narrative appeared in all of the feature stories that were lengthier than the other types of articles. The personal choice of founding an organization or joining one was a common theme in the story to portray an NGO worker. Sympathy and passion were both the qualities of NGO workers as portrayed in the media coverage. Lu launched an NGO dedicated to animal welfare and rescue and was portrayed as a well-educated lady who devoted her retired life to animal welfare. Lu couldn’t tolerate the “barbarian and uncivilized side of China” and she started her “mission to save abused animals and to awaken people’s conscience so they treat animals properly” (An, 2010). The personal feelings of Lu reported in the article show a human-interest emphasis of the story. Environmentalist Ma Jun was the central character in a feature story of river pollution. The story started by portraying Ma Jun as an environment fighter,

When Ma Jun stood on the banks of the mighty and yet polluted Yangtze River in
1994, he had vague idea that one day he would devote himself to a Mission Impossible: saving China's dying rivers. Named as one of 100 Most Influential Persons of 2006 by Time magazine, Ma has spared no efforts to raise public participation in environmental protection. Backing him up is a brand-new information platform linking government, businesses and ordinary people. (Gong, 2009).

Zheng Xiaojie, an NGO worker “loves to tell heartwarming success stories about her work with the blind” (Feng, 2011). A volunteer who devoted to helping students in remote and poor areas said “I have been waiting for this moment for eight years” after knowing the easier registration process for social organizations because of the new policy (An, 2012). Feng, who ran an NGO dedicated to helping parents of mentally challenged children, was portrayed as a determined social worker who even sacrifice the time she could spent with her family,

Feng’s work at the organization has not come without a price. Last year, she got divorced because her husband wasn't’ satisfied with the amount of time she was spending with him or her son. “I don’t feel guilty about the divorce. I hope one day my son will grow up and understand.” Feng said she fells a sense of accomplishment when she meets with parents she has helped in the past. (An, 2010)

Like the story of Feng, feature stories of NGOs in Xinhua often told the personal stories of the founders and volunteers in the association.
Personalization of NGO workers depicted them as a group of people who were passionate about helping others and solving social issues. When journalists deployed this frame, they brought this group of people to light with their personal stories. To a certain extent, the journalists glorified these social workers through detailed stories and suggested the importance of their work. In this sense, NGO workers are viewed as contributors to a better society rather than rebellion.

C. Difficulties. The frame of operation difficulties can be found in the data. This frame highlighted the challenges faced by NGOs and such challenges have been widely discussed in Xinhua News. For example, in an article titled “China’s NGOs spread HIV/AIDS prevention and awareness” the author approved the efforts of NGOs first then pointed out the difficulties faced by the NGO,

Despite these and other NGOs’ efforts in the fight against HIV/AIDS, homosexual rights NGOs continue to struggle into existence. To date, no homosexual rights NGO has registered with China's civil affairs authorities, due to their unique and unprecedented nature. Their ambiguous status poses difficulties in raising funds and holding meetings. (Deng, 2011)

Two major challenges were identified in the news coverage: a lack of funding and a lack of legislation. A report about environmental NGOs said “most environment NGOs still face problems including difficulty in raising money, shortage in personnel and weak organization ability in their development process” (Yao, 2008). Lu, head of China Small Animal Protection Association “struggles to get enough money, as member contributions
and donations always fall short” (An, 2010). In an article about the NGO called Community Development Center for Facilitators, the most experienced member “earns a monthly salary of 2,000 yuan (about 318.6 U.S. dollars), while the average disposable income of a Nanjing resident is about 2,800 yuan a month” (Zhang & Wang, 2012). The legislation problem concerning NGOs was discussed in a few articles. For example, one article reported,

Tang Guoping, head of the Guangzhou administration of NGOs, said that prior to the new regulations, many administrative bodies would be reluctant to act as supervisors for social organizations, as they feared it would mean taking on troubles or responsibilities. As a result, many social organizations ended up operating without being registered, a move that has hampered their activities and development. (An, 2012)

Another news article described the situation of charity legislation in China,

There has been strong public desire to pass a charity law ever since the 2008 Sichuan earthquake, during which time some of the biggest charity foundations failed to reach Chinese people’s expectations. But 3 years on, though a draft of the legislation has been finished, the law remains near the bottom of the agenda of the state council. Without such legislation, charitable NGOs, especially grass-root foundations are vulnerable to public accusations. (Chen, 2011)

Many NGOs were facing the difficulty of operation because of the low salary the organization can offer. The people who work for NGOs were said to be “undervalued”
and “underappreciated” (Feng, 2011). Jobs offered by NGOs “cannot be filled by qualified people due to the low pay and the lack of opportunity for career development” (Wu, 2012). Issues about the operation of NGOs were discussed and analyzed in the news to inform the public about the cost of running an NGO and the unfairness of the underpaid people who work for the good of society.

While covering difficulties faced by Chinese NGOs, the media didn’t pose a direct criticism to the government’s policy. However, it is very common to encounter suggestions to the government posed by NGO workers and scholars in the news articles. In a news piece, a professor suggested, “Chinese government should mobilize more NGOs to join the fight against HIV/AIDS” (Deng, 2011). The government was advised in an article to “become a pusher instead of an obstacle for the development of social welfare and charity” (An, 2012). Wang qiyan, director of the Policy Research Center under the Ministry of Civil Affairs was quoted in an article to comment on the policies toward NGOs,

He said the country needs to give more support to the NGOs in terms of tax relief, financial assistance and less intervention from governments. "Governments should realize the importance of the NGOs that can be a helpful partner in the building and management of a diversified society," he said. (Yan, 2008)

A professor of Beijing Normal University, Cheng Huixia provided legislation advice in an article,
Cheng said governments should regulate areas such as financing, project operating management and financial management in order to prevent the organizations from becoming tools for private gain. (An, 2012)

By reporting about advice to the Chinese government’s policy towards non-governmental organizations, the NGOs were portrayed as a social sector that needed more support from the government. At the same time, the government’s attitude was depicted as positive towards social organizations’ contribution and work. The frame indicates that, NGOs are not viewed as negative forces by the media and they serve as a social sector that has the right to make their voice heard.

**D. Civil society.** Quite unexpectedly, words such as civil society and democracy were associated with the work of NGOs in the news stories. Because of China’s authoritarian tradition toward the media, these words related to a more democratic society are supposed to be forbidden in a communist media. However, a news article about China’s environmental NGOs complimented their work as “influencing the government’s policy making, supervising the government’s task of environment responsibility and raising public awareness in environmental protection” (Yao, 2008). In an official report, the role of NGO has been portrayed as a third sector of society that should supervise the government. *Xinhua* reported,

More importantly, the NGOs have worked as a bridge between citizens and governments in the drive to nurture a civil society and promote democracy at the grassroots level, he said. "As organizations, they can represent individuals to
voice their concerns, coordinate dialogues with the government, and supervise the
government, which are quite important to the building of democracy in China," he
said. (Yan, 2008)

In addition, Xinhua has closely related the value of civil society to the work of NGOs. In
a report about an earthquake relief, NGOs were said to be “sprouting up everywhere”
which was a star performer of “China’s civil society” (Lu, 2008). A scholar was quoted
for his comment on the NGOs’ performance in the article,

Economic liberalization and a changing culture have placed far greater emphasis
on the individual. The public is more aware that everyone counts. A strong and
persistent consciousness of citizenship and civic responsibility is the foundation
for a civil society that is indispensable to the establishment of a harmonious and
democratic China. (Lu, 2008)

In this sense, “democracy” and “civil society”, concepts cherished by capitalist countries
were not avoided as deviant in the communist media. But rather, they were constructed in
the news as positive goals in Chinese society, which were also recognized by the
government. Moreover, the NGOs were portrayed as the social sector that helped fulfill
such goals and values.

E. Boom of NGO. Statistics of NGOs in China have been reported through the
news with a suggestion of the booming fact of their status. A report said China’s
environmental NGOs have “doubled their number in the past three years” (Yao, 2008). It
said, “there are 3,539 environment NGOs in the country” and “the figure jumped by 771
from three years ago.” Another article reported that “the number of Chinese NGOs increased to 386,000 in 2007 from 266,000 in 2003” (Yan, 2008). Xinhua also reported the statistics from the Ministry of Civil Affairs, which showed that China had 457,500 social organizations in 2011 (An, 2012). Along with the increasing number of NGOs, their contribution to society was recognized in the news coverage. In areas such as “poverty eradication, disaster relief, medical care, education and environmental protection” (Yan, 2008) their contributions were described as huge. A report said,

Soon after the catastrophic earthquake in Sichuan in May, the Red Cross Society of China raised 15.84 billion yuan (2.3 billion U.S. dollars) in relief funds and facilities through its national network. Another well-known NGO, the China Youth Development Foundation, has helped more than 2.5 million school drop-outs go back to school through its flagship Project Hope since 1989, Wang said. He said more than 2,000 NGOs focusing on environmental issues began to demonstrate their power through actions such as initiating environmental protection projects and offering advice to policy makers. (Yan, 2008)

A report about environmental NGOs said, “58.6 percent of the organizations were involved in the energy saving and emission cutting work, and 11 percent participated in protecting people’s rights concerning environment protection” (Yao, 2008). The numbers and social influence of NGOs in the news coverage showed the growing attention about this social sector. Again, the booming of NGOs is viewed as positive to society, not as a negative force.
f) Discussion

From the findings of the news frames, it is quite obvious that the language toward Chinese NGOs is positive and friendly. Without avoiding words like democracy and civil society, Chinese NGOs are portrayed as an important sector of society. The functions of NGOs and their contributions to social issues are approved in the news articles. All in all, no negative report about social organizations could be found. There are two possible explanations to this result. One is that the media coverage eliminated the negative portrayal of NGOs because of the authoritarian tradition of Chinese media. This is because the government worries that NGO growth will lead to loss of political control and stability. It coincides with the argument made by Huang (2003),

While there is no control over a lot of issues in China, sensitive political and policy issues such as the independent movements in Taiwan and Tibet, foreign policy and open criticism of Chinese leadership and their major socio-economic policies are still constrained by the authority of the Chinese Communist Party. (p. 448)

The other explanation could be that since the NGOs in China survive by avoiding offending the government, their activities involve no political controversies.

In addition, the frames may show an implicit message that social organizations in China are indeed portrayed as serving a facilitative role to the government. One article emphasizes, “the direct registration has not changed the government’s responsibility to regulate social organizations in accordance with the rule of law” (An, 2012). In the news
articles, social organizations in this sense are free to solve social issues and the government is actually supportive about that. The government’s efforts were reported in the actions of simplifying the registration process and drafting a law to regulate China’s Charity Sector. When talking about the development of social organizations, the government’s official voice is always somewhere in the article, either it’s about the regulation of NGOs, or the status of NGOs. The data indicates that NGOs’ work is not to be against the government and the authority of Chinese government should not be shattered because of this different social sector. By portraying NGOs as a social sector and the supportive government in a definite manner, the media made a determined role for the NGOs. In this sense, NGOs are supposed to work facilitating the central government. This in return shows that Chinese media is not totally away from the propaganda tradition in a communist society even though it can’t be obviously read in the article.

For example, news about NGOs is written in a way to lighten the atmosphere of severe situations that government should be responsible for. An article about the smoggy weather in Beijing has created a narrative to transfer the attention of people by talking about NGOs. The story started with a discrepancy between the U.S. Embassy's measurements and data released by the capital's environmental watchdog in Beijing. While the U.S. Embassy rated the air as “hazardous”, Beijing Municipal Environmental Protection Bureau said the pollution was “slight” (Bi, 2011). The article focuses on a Beijing-based NGO, Daerwen Nature Quest Agency and how the members and other
citizens tested the air on their own. It went on as an actively participated grassroots environmental watch, but little has been mentioned in terms of the government. Nothing about why the air is polluted so badly has been discussed, and there’s no information of how this polluted air would affect people’s health. The only official response says,

    In the growing public debate over air quality, Du Shaozhong, deputy head of Beijing’s environmental watchdog, is in the spotlight. Over the past month, he has faced a flurry of questions and criticism regarding air quality from Internet users.

    Du said the grassroots campaign and ongoing public discussion are indications of China’s rising environmental awareness. (Bi, 2011)

The response by Du contains no explanation of the pollution itself or any of the responsibility of the government. Instead, it talks about the “rising environmental awareness” which is a “positive” thing.

    However, in a lot of circumstances, NGOs are also used as a social sector that’s independent from the government. To a certain extent, their voice is considered positive to society and legal to the government. In a report about bile bears in China, there’s no other criticism than some from the quotes of NGO workers. It reports an NGO staffer said it is possible that the farm gives local anesthetics to the bears during the extraction to make them look fine (Mo, 2012). In this case, NGO stands out of the general public to articulate a different voice from the business company. Similar cases are seen in the reports of AIDS protection, environmental protection and gay rights. In this sense, when it is about social issues in China that has no conflict to the government, the NGO has a
strong voice because of their organization and specialty in those areas. On the other hand, in those cases, the media tend to put their attention on the social work of NGOs rather than questioning the policies made by the government for the overall media environment is affected by the authoritarian tradition. However, by reporting the stories, suggestions to the government are provided by NGOs.

g) Conclusion

After the year 2008, Xinhua has portrayed Chinese NGOs in a positive way to inform the public about their contribution to solving social issues and being as a third social sector. It is difficult to say the authoritarian tradition of Chinese media is apparent in a way that the media is trying to suppress social organizations as a new force in society. In this sense, the media is certainly not a single purpose press that serves party and state policies (Huang, 2003). But it is also hard to say that all of the NGOs in society are openly discussed and have gained their voice for the possibility that NGOs with political controversies are generally ignored by Xinhua News to avoid problems from the central government. The findings tend to support Liu and McCormick’s (2011) argument,

“Even under the political pressure of the state’s intervention, the commercialized media have already created some space for alternative ideas and perspectives, and critical and rational debate on political issues, some of it explicit and much more of it implicit.” (p. 132)

This phenomenon may reflect an aspect of “Chinese society in social transition” (Liu & McCormick, 2011) where the media tend to be “strange” (Huang, 2003, p. 453). Because
the media is in transition, it can hardly be simplified by a single existing normative press model (Huang, 2003). The press performs dynamically whereas Chinese society undergoes social change. Such social change features in an expanding civil society where diverse and numerous social organizations came into being and actively engaged in social issues. While the non-governmental organizations have gained their right and power in the public sphere, “state decentralization and institutional transformation have created some limited political space for independent social groups”(Yang & Calhoun, 2008, p. 11).

This research is limited in that it was only focused on five years’ worth of articles from Xinhua News, a state news agency of China. Its representation of NGOs reveals only a small part of the media in today’s pluralistic media environment in China. Comparison of different frames in different media is not studied here and the whole picture of how NGOs are represented in Chinese media can’t be seen. Different news organizations and other media forms such as online forum and blogs may provide a different image of Chinese NGOs. Further research should take the transitional status of Chinese media into account to provide better insights of the already very complicated Chinese media.
References


doi:10.1080/10670561003666103


doi:10.1080/0129298042000329775


Retrieved from


Appendix: Original Proposal

I. Introduction

My interest in this project developed from my passion for China’s emerging grassroots organizations and the social movement that it may bring about. Before going to Missouri School of Journalism, I went to Sichuan University in my hometown, Chengdu, China and graduated with a biology degree. During my years in college, I joined the Environmental Volunteer Association of Sichuan University and volunteered in various projects and organizations. I also attended meetings organized by local nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) where I recognized the emerging grassroots power of emerging NGOs organized by local people in China. I was enthusiastic about the grassroots movement brought about by NGOs in China and decided to go to a journalism school to equip myself with important communication skills.

With little previous professional skills in photography, I studied photojournalism because I know I am a visual person and I have a passion of generally all the beauty in the world. I took the Fundamentals of Photojournalism in my first semester here, through which I learned how to take pictures in a variety of situations. I learned to feel comfortable with my camera when facing people and how to talk to people to get access. The Advanced Technique class taught by Rita Reed, helped me really start to “see the light” while photographing. During the summer of 2012, I took the Staff Photojournalism, which gave me a tough training that I had to go to assignments nearly everyday in a newspaper environment. In this class, I learned to take notes and gather
information precisely for the caption of the pictures. The last photo class I took, Picture Story and Photo Essay gave me a more structured training of producing visual stories. Above all these, the Electronic Photojournalism class provided me with digital visual story telling skills including video shooting, web designing and audio editing. With all the education I have had, I am able to work on photography projects independently and generate publishable contents.

In the future, I hope to contribute to the grassroots social movement in China. I want to document the people who are organized as local grassroots organizations and their difficulties and challenges as well as achievements. Through my work I want to bring more attention from the public to this group and make them more visible to people.

The professional component of this project aims at documenting a specific local NGO in China. During the process, I will be able to develop a deeper understanding of their work. The close observation of this NGO can be viewed as a case study of the existing NGOs in China. The analysis component of this project aims at doing a content analysis of Chinese media’s representation of NGOs through which I would have a better knowledge of the media’s role in representing China’s grassroots movement.

II. Professional Component

a) Description of Project

For this project, I want to do a photographic and multimedia documentary of a Chinese local NGO called Yothok-Yondengonpo Medical Association (YYMA) in Sichuan province, Southwestern China. YYMA locates at Dêgê County in Garzê Tibetan
Autonomous Prefecture in Sichuan province. The origin of the association is Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital which is a newer and more established version of Puma Cooperation Clinic, a local clinic established by six different villages and townships. In 1981, under a new policy, which allowed fixed farm output quotas for each household, the president of YYMA, Mr. Luore Phuntsok signed a contract with the clinic himself. For over twenty years, he was devoted to protecting the ecology of the natural environment, preserving traditional culture, and offering free medical treatments to the poor using his own resources (Yothok-Yondengonpo Medical Association, the Origin of the Establishment, n.d.).

Although China has had huge development in economy in the past three decades, this hospital made little development due to its remote location. Because of China’s fast paced social and economic progress, traditional culture, the ecology of the environment have been threatened. As a result, Dr. Luore realized the urgency of introducing outside resources into this region and expanding the influence in order to serve the society in many aspects so that the cultural and the ecological balance might be maintained, and so he founded an NGO: Yothok Yoden Gonpo Medical Association (YYMA) (Yothok-Yondengonpo Medical Association, the Origin of the Establishment, n.d.).

YYMA is an NGO that signifies the attributions of a local grassroots organization in China. It was founded by a local person who is trying to do something to protect what is important for the community and eventually benefit the community, which the government is not doing. The indigenous organization understands local people’s needs.
The work that they do covers environmental protection, medical service and medical education, traditional cultural conservation and ecotourism (Yothok-Yondengonpo Medical Association, n.d.).

On the other hand, behind YYMA’s work lie the conflicts between the economic development and the preservation of traditional culture. According to Zhang Lei, a member of the association, a large part of their work is to provide training class of traditional Tibetan handicrafts to local people and bring their products to the market outside the area. YYMA also works to preserve the traditional Tibetan medicine and they provide free medical services to the local people, lamas and nuns.

The challenges that YYMA faces also provide insights to the difficulties of the local NGOs in China. Money is a major problem because of a lack of financial resources. A lack of professional volunteers is another significant problem. Some programs such as the training for midwives, often taught by foreign volunteers, have aroused antipathy from the government. As the Tibetan national minority’s traditional culture is closely bounded with the Tibetan Buddhism, some regulations established by the Communist government put pressure on the religious activities of local people. Under these circumstances, YYMA have to work cautiously with their projects to avoid any controversy that may catch the government’s attention, which is a common principle of operation in a lot of NGOs in China. Nevertheless, YYMA is still actively engaging local people and carrying out their projects. According to Zhang Lei, there are eight members
who work in the association now and the YYMA can be viewed as a medium-sized NGO in China.

I would like to travel to Dêgê County where the YYMA locates at the beginning of next semester. Although the exact date hasn’t been decided yet, I would like to consider starting the trip within the week of January 21, 2013. It takes around three days to drive from Chengdu, my hometown to Dêgê County. The trip may be affected by the traffic and the weather since some part of the traffic condition is not very good. I want to stay at the Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital for at least one and a half months until around March 21, 2013.

Ge Bu, the director of the association agrees to provide me a place to stay where I can do my project for as long as I want. During my stay there, I want to first take pictures on an everyday basis and gain trust of the people there. After that, I wish to gain some genuine visuals to show the life of people there. To document the association as a local NGO, I would like to think about several aspects now, including, the medical services, the cultural preservation, the building of community, and their challenges. It is basically about what they are doing there. To provide a more holistic vision of YYMA, I would also like to include aspects of the religion, the environment, the traditional culture, the modern and traditional aspects of local people’s life in the visuals. But these are just the aspects that I can think of now, I’m open to all the other valuable aspects that I may come across on site. With all these aspects in mind, I would consider the medical service they are providing as a possible central theme for my project.
For this project, in addition to still pictures, I also want to shoot some video to produce a 10 to 20 minutes video documentary film focusing on the work of the NGO. I may identify three to four major aspects that I want to feature the video during the process of shooting still images. I also want to include some interview with the people I met there in the film. My objective is to achieve a documentary that tells the truthful story of their activities.

I will come back to United States in the early part of April to accomplish the editing process and the analysis component of my whole project and defend my project before May 3, 2013. After finishing the project, I will contact some local newspapers such as Chengdu Economic Daily and West China City News and also national newspapers to try to gain the possibility of publishing a picture story. I also hope that more people can see my video. To achieve that, I would first contact the local TV stations, such as Chengdu Television, to gauge their interest in screening my work. In addition, I would like to contact the NGOs I worked with in Chengdu and ask them to show this work to their volunteers or help me gain access to other audience. I can also go back to the Environmental Volunteer Association of my university to show my project to its current members.

b) Project Report

I will write weekly field notes to report the progress of the project. The field notes concerning the photographic project will be emailed to my committee members David
Rees and Keith Greenwood and Ryan Thomas. Since the Internet is available at Dzongsar Tibetan Hospital, I will keep in touch with my committee by email.

III. Research Component

a) Statement of Topic and Research Question

China’s economic growth during the past three decades has not only increased the living standards of a huge population of people, but also created a yearning for a civil society (Zhang, 2003). The boom of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other civil society organizations are considered one of the significant developments of Chinese society to bring about a gradual bottom up reform (Morton, 2005, p. 521). I’m interested in China’s grassroots nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), which started to form in the early 1990s and boomed in the early 21st century and how they are transforming the country to a more civic one.

China has an authoritarian society in which its media system has inevitably adopted the authoritarian tradition. After 1949, the year People’s Republic of China was founded, the media in China adopted a wartime propaganda ethos in the 1940s and functioned as a “political tool” and an integral part of the state apparatus of the government, a role that was officially defined as the “throat and tongue” of the Party (Cao, 2010, p. 139). As Cao (2010) articulates, “one primary responsibility of Chinese journalism is to ‘guide public opinion’” and to “distinguish ‘right’ from ‘wrong’” (p. 140).
After the economic reform in the past three decades, Chinese media retains its mouthpiece function while achieving a profit in the market (Cao, 2010). Interestingly, with the economic development and emergence of the Internet, Chinese government has become less hegemonic in dealing with media and “control has to be exercised through negotiation rather than imposition” (Cao, 2010, p. 145). As a result, the media has begun to publish more and more stories about issues and social conflicts even though it is not totally free from the government’s interference. However, the party-state still possesses the continuing ability to suppress oppositional ideas and prevent the formation of counterhegemonic alliances between various protesting social forces (Zhao, 2008, p. 62). Zhao (2008) argues, reporting on “numerous protests by expropriated farmers, laid-off state enterprise workers, and uncompensated pensioners, as well as other disenfranchised and dispossessed groups is almost impossible” (p. 62). Under the circumstances, Chinese media’s reaction toward grassroots NGOs when considering their role as a third sector that is autonomous from the state (Morton, 2005, p. 519) hasn’t been mapped. In my research, I would like to conduct a content analysis to examine Chinese print media and see how grassroots NGOs and people who are active in this field represented. In this sense, my research question would be: *How are Chinese grassroots nongovernmental organizations represented in news media?*

This research is in close relation to my professional project, which will be a photo story about a local NGO named Yothok-Yondengonpo Medical Association (YYMA) in China. The existed media reportage of YYMA include a poorly-made 20 minutes report
produced by a local TV channel and an in-depth story published online in 2009. The fact that no reportage of YYMA has gone to a national media shows some hints of the sensitivity of the topic in Chinese media. For me, telling a story of a specific NGO not only provides a microscopic perspective of this social sector but also help bring more attention form the public to them. Furthermore, by conducting content analysis for the research component, I want to achieve a deeper understanding of how the media is representing this third sector in Chinese society.

b) Theoretical Framework

The representation process mainly ties in with the journalism theory of framing. Framing is a concept in communication research developed in several different disciplines including psychology, psychiatry, sociology, anthropology, epistemology, ethnography and linguistics and communication (Johnson-Cartee, 2005, p.160). It is used in the research of mass media to address the media’s effect on audience and society. When reporting news stories, journalists write in narratives that are developed within their culture to give meanings to them so that they can be understood. Frames in media give emphasis on particular values, facts and problems in society and provide perspectives of approaching certain issues. By analyzing news frames, the underlying social factors such as political power, culture and historical background can be identified to achieve a deeper understanding of the media and society.

d) Literature Review

i. Mapping the Chinese NGOs.
Along with the economic development China has experienced during the past three decades, the boom of nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) characterizes a yearning for a civil society. With the emergence of Red Maple Women’s Psychological Counseling Center and Friends of Nature in the early 1990s, China has witnessed a rapid growth of NGOs over the last decade which constitute the marker of an emerging civil society (Shieh & Deng, 2011). These NGOs include environmental organizations; organizations providing services to needy populations such as migrant workers, battered women and the disabled; homeowners’ associations; cultural and recreational associations; and professional associations (Shieh & Deng, 2011). Although no reliable number of such NGOs in China is available, some previous research suggests, by the year of 2005, there were at least 2768 environmental nongovernmental organizations (ENGOs) (Tang & Zhan, 2006). The estimate total number of NGOs goes as high as 1.5 million (Shieh & Deng, 2011). In recent years, Chinese NGOs have actively participated in environmental protection and education (Sima, 2011), crises alleviation such as 2008 Sichuan earthquake, SARS and HIV/AIDS (Shieh & Deng, 2011). These social groups have made a huge impact and play an important role in China’s grassroots movement.

Recent studies of Chinese nongovernmental organizations have been focused on NGOs and civil society (Shieh & Deng, 2011; Tang & Zhan, 2006; Chen, 2010), use of the Internet by NGOs (Sima, 2011), grassroots NGOs in an authoritarian state (Spires, 2011), development of environmental NGOs in China (Ru & Ortolano, 2009), implications for domestic social and political reform (Morton, 2005). While most of these
researches focus on the political impact brought about by these NGOs and a lot of scholars have addressed the grassroots movement in China to suggest an emerging civil society, little research has been conducted in the field of media representation of this group. My research, which is aim at analyzing Chinese media’s representation of NGOs, may serve to fill this gap.

ii. Framing analysis of social movements.

In the field of journalism, numerous researchers have explored the concept of framing. Such as Entman (1993) defines framing as the following:

To frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation. (p. 52)

By giving selective information to readers, framing is being practiced by journalists to weave a value system in which the journalists and citizens live. Similarly, Reese defines that, “Frames are organizing principles that are socially shared and persistent over time, that work symbolically to meaningfully structure the social world” (2001, p. 11). He also suggests that the study of framing helps provide tools for examining human knowledge structures.

In addition to giving priority to particular values, frames found in media can also serve to define political issues and as a result enhance the political power structure. For example, Nelson, Clawson, and Oxley (1997) argue, “framing is the process by which a
communication source such as a news organization [or a political leader, public relations officer, political advertising consultant, or news consumer], defines and constructs a political issue or public controversy” (p. 576).

Framing can also be explored in the perspective of a journalism practice used by journalists. Johnson-Cartee (2005) explains the framing process of news reporting as a “learned” craftsmanship based on the professional skills built in the journalism industry. She says:

In their efforts to define the situation, select a news frame, and then build upon that news frame, reporters seek evidence, whether in the form of expert testimony, written reports, public record or eyewitness accounts, that affirms their approach to the story. (p. 162)

She also addresses that the assigned responsibility is another important component in news framing that has been widely explored. Researchers such as Iyengar (1989) have categorized issue responsibility into two categories: casual responsibility, or the emphasis on the origin of the social problem; and treatment responsibility, or the emphasis on who or what has the means to resolve the social problem, whether by solving the social problem, alleviating the social problem, or perpetuating the social problem (Johnson-Cartee, 2005). The effect of framing can change the applicability of particular thoughts and resulting in their activation and use in evaluations (Pan & Kosicki, 2001). Pan and Kosicki (2001) describe framing as a “strategic action in a discursive form” (p. 39) and “framing an issue is to participate in public deliberation strategically” (p. 59).
When studying media representation of a social group in social movement, framing analysis is a common theme. In 2005, Bronstein conducted a study to analyze the framing of third wave feminism to compare the frames that have been used by journalists for the second wave feminism. She analyzed third wave feminism news stories published in mainstream U.S. media including The New York Times, Time, Newsweek, and U.S. News & World Report between 1992 and 2004. In her research, five major frames were identified in news stories which include:

- The demonization frame, describing feminists with pejorative labels, or as social deviants;
- The personalization and trivialization frame, focusing attention on personal appearance and style as a means of diminishing a woman's credibility and her message;
- The goals and rights frame, focusing attention on desired outcomes, such as wage equity, abortion rights, or legislation such as the Equal Rights Amendment;
- The victimization frame, presenting feminists as weak or helpless, or as victims of violence;
- The agency frame, presenting feminists as powerful and self-actualized. (p. 788).

Bronstein (2005) found that “journalists have relied heavily upon some of the stock frames that were used to construct the second wave to depict third wave feminism” (p. 795) and the using of frames resulted in the media’s providing their its audiences “a limited and partial account of modern feminism” (p. 795). Bronstein’s research shows the
effects of the frames used by journalists in the coverage of a social movement. It also provides insights of how these frames could be identified, articulated and compared.

Maeseele (2011) examined whether or to what extent the media in Northern Belgium facilitates the democratic debate over the GM (genetically modified) crop, a debate brought about by the coalition of social movements/NGOs (non-governmental organizations) in the second half of 1990s. The debate is characterized by its bearing of “risk conflicts”, a quality also possessed by the particular frames identified in news articles. Maeseele (2011) found that two examined newspaper prefer science and industry over movements for the interpretation of news events while the other two have an opposite preference. Maeseele (2011) analyzed the claimed that with the pattern showing the choice “‘dissenting’ sources such as the NGO-platform as much as on institutional sources” among different newspapers, the legitimacy of NGOs is stage-dependent. Maeseele’s (2011) research provided hints on NGOs as a third sector of society are considered by the media as less legitimate than the government in the news reports.

Edgerly, Toft and Veden (2011) conducted an analysis of protest paradigm in the coverage of May 1 protests in 2006. According to Edgerly et al. (2011), protest paradigm was found to be a powerful organizing principle in media coverage where organizers could evaluate their discursive resources as effective countermeasures. They argue that an “issue frame” was caused by the organizers’ reliance on “strategically ambiguous terms such as immigration reform and amnesty” (p. 329). In the media coverage, the representation of the protest group in media put emphasis on the ambiguous “frames”
rather than on the ideology of the group. Hence, Edgerly et al. (2011) concludes, “Mass-mediated polysemy presents a difficult challenge for political activists who seek to use the mass media to broadcast their goals” (p. 328). The research suggested that media coverage of protests within the conventional issue frames might cause the failure of communicating the real ideology of protest groups and as a result, disrespect their value.

A similar example was examined by Watkins (2001) of the framing in network television news coverage of the Million Man March. He finds that the news framing was patterned by Farrakhan, a central character being reported, and his appeal as a deviant newsworthy personality. He claims that by using Farrakhan as their primary focus in their framing practices, the news media omitted other frames that “could have rendered the march and the complex web of factors that ignited interests in it more recognizable” (p. 98). He concludes, “While the media spotlight generates attention for organized protest, it seldom, if ever, promotes the goals of movement practitioners” (p. 99). Such media representation of protests uses popular narratives to tell the story while losing the information of the goals of these groups.

On the contrary, media representation can also lead to successful social movement. For example, Sandberg (2006) combined discourse analysis and framing analysis to analyze an anti-globalization movement organization, Association pour la taxation des transactions financiers pour l’aide aux citoyens’ (ATTAC) success in Norway in 2001. Sandberg focused on the perspective of the social constructivism that emphasizes “the production of knowledge” (p. 210). Sandberg suggests that “the well
developed collective action framing” (p. 222) may be the reason of ATTAC Norway’s success in 2001 because the discourses embedding it may “have given the organization the crucial values of novelty and ‘truth’” (p. 222). In the media’s representation of the organization, the emphasized values of “novelty” and “truth” are crucial for the success of the movement.

While studies of America and European countries are useful, we need to examine Chinese media framing because Chinese media system is inherently different. In China, the media system has an authoritarian tradition and is controlled strictly in the reporting of diverse social groups. Chen (2005) conducted a framing analysis of Xinhua News Agency’s coverage of the new religious movement in China. His discourse analysis provided insight on how journalists told the story of Falun Gong and the government crackdown. By identifying the frames and narratives in the news reports, Chen found that Xinhua News Agency portrayed the Falun Gong group as “deviant”, “dangerous”, “evil” and an organization needed to be contained (p. 30). He also states that the Xinhua serves as a “lapdog” function in the Chinese government’s anti-Falun Gong campaign (p. 30).

Although little research has addressed Chinese media’s representation of social movements, there are scholars who have conducted discourse analysis of Chinese media representation of social problems. For example, Tong (2009) conducted a discourse analysis of three cases in Chinese media’s coverage of social problems. He found that when covering a social riot in China, the newspaper Dahe Daily originally created an “opposition” between people and the government, but it had to make revisions to conceal
social conflicts and lessen political criticism (Tong, 2009, p. 598). The topics of social problems are considered to be “political minefields” (Tong, 2009, p. 609) and any improper approach to them may cause political crackdown on news media (Tong, 2009). Unlike the result of Chen’s (2005) research, Tong points out that journalists were actually willing to tell the truth and provide criticism to government but there existed a negotiation of content to protect the newspaper.

d) Methodology

I will conduct a content analysis of Chinese media Xinhua News Agency’s coverage of NGOs in China. The news articles will be gathered on xinhuanet.com, the website of Xinhua News Agency. As one of China’s largest state news agencies, Xinhua News Agency is considered to be a government bureaucracy and a political and ideological apparatus for the ruling Chinese Communist Party (CCP) since it was founded more than 80 years ago (Hong, 2011, p. 377). News articles published by Xinhuan News Agency are representative of the discourse developed between the power of CCP and the democratic values embody in the NGOs.

I will identify the articles that have a main theme of Chinese NGOs from the date of December 31, 2012 to January 1, 2008. I choose the year of 2008 is because after the Sichuan earthquake in 2008, the participation of volunteers in NGOs during the relief of the disaster has increased the awareness of the value of NGOs from the Chinese state and the media (Shieh & Deng, 2011). I will examine the articles to identify the frames and patterns that have been used in the coverage by using constant comparative method. The
objective of data collecting is to reach the point of data saturation where no new frames can be identified.

After collecting the articles, I will conduct a content analysis to examine how the Chinese NGOs are represented in the news articles. Specific frames found in previous study, including “deviant”, “dangerous” and “evil” (Chen, 2005, p. 30), the “opposition” against government authority (Tong, 2009) may be expected.

The primary goal of the content analysis is to make visible the restrictions that Chinese media have when covering social movement related topics. In addition, it will shed light on the challenges faced by Chinese NGOs of delivering their ideology in an authoritarian media system. When conducting the analysis, I will keep in mind the social and media characteristics of China that may affect the framing schemes in media as well as the existed pattern in the coverage of social movement such as “protest paradigm” (Edgerly et al., 2011).

e) Possible Publication

This research will be possibly published in academic journals that have a focus of international journalism and Chinese media system such as the International Communication Research Journal, Chinese Journal of Communication and China Media Research.
References


doi:10.1080/10670561003666103


doi:10.1080/0129298042000329775


### Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expenses</th>
<th>No of items (trips)</th>
<th>Cost per item</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transportation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas &amp; Public transportation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>$160</td>
<td>$320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Photography Equipment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video Mic</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$149</td>
<td>$149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audio Recorder</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$110</td>
<td>$110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Quantity</td>
<td>Price</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF Memory card</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>$50</td>
<td>$50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accommodation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living expense</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>$500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>$1129</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>