

CULTURAL VALUES, EOMOTIONS AND INFORMATION: A COMPARISON OF
WEBPAGES FROM TWO CULTURALLY DIFFERENT COUNTRIES

A Thesis

presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School

University of Missouri-Columbia

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Arts

by
WANG YE

Dr. Shelly Rodgers, Thesis Supervisor

AUGUST 2008

The undersigned, appointed by the dean of the Graduate School, have examined the thesis entitled

CULTURAL VALUES, EMOTIONS AND INFORMATION: A COMPARISON OF
WEBPAGES FROM TWO CULTURALLY DIFFERENT COUNTRIES

PRESENTED BY WANG YE,

A CANDIDATE FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF JOURNALISM,

AND HEREBY CERTIFY THAT, IN THEIR OPINION, IT IS WORTHY OF
ACCEPTANCE.

Professor Shelly Rodgers

Professor Glen Cameron

Professor Wayne Wanta

Professor Ge Xiao

DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to my parents Zhang Liulian and Wang, Defu my husband Sun Lin, and my son Sun Binhua.

Thanks Mom and Dad. Without your love, I could not be brave enough to travel thousands miles away and start my adventure in the US.

Thanks my dearest husband. Without you, I could not overcome so many difficulties.

Thanks my lovely son. You are the best present in my whole life.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	v
ABSTRACT	vii
Chapter	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. THEORIES & CONCEPTS EXPLICATION	5
1. Standardization	
2. Individualism and Collectivism	
3. Emotion, Information and Culture	
III. LITERATURE REVIEW	14
1. Standardization, International Corporations and Domestic Corporations	
2. Cultural Dimensions and Appeals to Cultural Values	
3. Emotion, Information and Cultural Dimensions	
IV. METHODOLOGY	28
1. Content Analysis	
2. Sampling	
3. Unit of Analysis	
4. Coding Instrument	
5. Reliability	
V. RESULTS	45
VI. DISCUSSION	61
VII. LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE RESEARCH	68
REFERENCES	70

APPENDIX

A. AMERICAN DOMESTIC BRANDS AND MODELS.....76

B. AMERICAN INTERNATIONAL BRANDS AND MODELS.....78

C. CHINESE DOMESTIC BRANDS AND MODELS85

D. CHINESE INTERNATIONAL BRANDS AND MODELS88

E. EXAMPLES OF THE CODING CATEGORIES94

LIST OF TABLES

Tables	Page
1. Models.....	31
2. American Domestic Brands	31
3. American Foreign Brands and Models.....	32
4. Chinese Domestic Brands and Models.....	33
5. Chinese Foreign Brands and Models	34
6. Cultural Values.....	41
7. Intra-Coder Reliability	44
8. Frequencies of Cultural Values	46
9. Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Harmony, Benevolence, and International Appeals	49
10. Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Domestic Chinese and US Websites	49
11. Correlations with the Canonical Function of American Websites	50
12. Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Achievement, Self- Competence, and Benevolence.....	51
13. Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Chinese Websites....	52
14. Frequencies of Information Content	53
15. Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Domestic Chinese and US Websites.....	54
16. Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function.....	55
17. Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Guarantee	56

18. Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of American Websites	.56
19. Correlation with Canonical Function of Shape and Performance57
20. Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Chinese Websites58
21. Frequencies for Emotional Appeals59
22. Percentages of Emotional Appeals of Domestic Websites60
23. Percentages of Emotional Appeals of Chinese Websites60
24. Percentages of Emotional Appeals of American Websites60

CULTURAL VALUES, EOMOTIONS AND INFORMATION: A COMPARISON OF WEBPAGES FROM TWO CULTURALLY DIFFERENT COUNTRIES

Wang Ye

Doctor Shelly Rodgers, Thesis Supervisor

ABSTRACT

The present study empirically tested Triandis and Gelfand's (1998) four dimensional cultural theory, and evaluate the usage of standardization advertising strategies. The method used was content analysis. Product-based corporate webpage of 200 car models were subjected to the analysis. By dividing the 200 webpages into four groups, namely domestic Chinese webpage, international webpage in the Chinese market, domestic American webpage, and international webpage in the US market, the present study access the standardization degree of international webpage against its respective domestic webpage.

The result shows that cultural differences moderately affect ad appeals to values and information content in online advertisement, to the direction as the four-dimensional cultural theory predicts. Chinese online advertisement uses more international appeals, and appeals to harmony and benevolence. American online advertisement is more informative than Chinese online advertisement. The effect of cultural difference on emotional appeals is not significant because of the universality of basic emotions. As predicted, since online advertisement is more cost-efficient than traditional media, American online advertisement is highly localized. The results also support the contingent standardization theory. A combination of standardized strategies and localized strategies are used in international online advertisement in the Chinese market.

I. INTRODUCTION

The present study contributes to the understanding of successful international advertising strategies by analyzing online advertisements in the Chinese and American markets. The general picture of online advertising strongly indicates a world-wide trend that the internet is becoming a strong communication tool for companies to advertise and promote their products. Online advertising is gradually taking up the advertising revenue that traditionally goes to print media. Statistics from the Newspaper Association of America showed that in 2006 online advertising spending increased by 35% in the US while newspaper print ads rose by only 0.3% (Bosman, 2006). Figures from China were rather exciting for a nascent market: 1.5 billion yuan (around 214 million dollars) revenue from online display advertising in the second quarter of 2006 (Perez, 2006). Nissan turned out to be the leading advertiser in the vehicle industry (Perez, 2006). Together with two other consumer brands (Founder Electronics and Coca-Cola), they ate up 60% of China's internet advertising (Perez, 2006). The increase of online advertising also occurs in other parts of the world. Online advertising expenditure in New Zealand in the first half of 2007 was \$57.6, and the total online advertising spending was likely to be doubled for the next half of 2007(Andrew, 2007). In Britain, online advertising spending surpassed £ 2 billion in 2006 (Allen, 2007). It was 11.4% of the total advertising revenue when the advertising revenue of traditional media dropped down (Allen, 2007).

One reason that online advertising enjoys world-wide popularity is that it reaches

a large international audience with limited budget. Budget is an important factor in international marketing. It was one of the factors that initiated the debate over standardized advertising strategies (using the same ads for different markets) and localized strategies (ads should adapt to local cultural of the market) (Laroche, Kirpalani, Pons, & Zhou, 2001). One strong argument of standardized advertising strategies is that it is going to be a huge cost if a company needs to tailor their advertisement to fit every market. With the innovation of the internet, the concern over the cost-and-efficiency issue in international advertising was relieved. Websites is a powerful tool of communication; it is economic and efficient (Quah, 2007). It enables corporate websites to carry out direct business-to-consumer communication online and skip traditional media that eat up a large proportion of advertising budget. In addition, corporate websites can also keep well-documented classifieds with rich information on their webpage. The same amount of detailed product information would be too expensive to afford in traditional media. With so many potential advantages in international advertising, corporate websites are highly recommended by business and communication experts (Quah, 2007).

Despite the rapid adoption of online advertising in the industry, research on online international advertising is left behind. A lot of studies that investigated the relationship between international advertising, standardization, and cultural orientations were in print ads (Albers-Miller & Gelb, 1996; Al-Olayan & Karande, 2000; Javalgi, Cutler, & Malhotra, 1995) and TV commercials (Cervellon & Duté, 2000; Kalliny & Gentry, 2007; Zhou, Zhou, & Xue, 2005). Only a few studies

contributed to the understanding of online international advertising. Singh, Zhao and Hu's (2005) and Okazaki's (2004) studies are ones of the few. Singh, Zhao and Hu (2005) examined local websites of several countries. Okazaki (2004) studied product-based webpages in corporate websites of Japanese multinational companies. Following Singh, Zhao and Hu's (2005) and Okazaki's (2004) studies, the present study chooses product-based webpages in corporate websites as its subject, and contributes to the research in international online advertising. The method of the present study is content analysis, and the purpose is to evaluate the degree of standardization of online advertisements.

The theoretical framework of the present study is contingent theory of standardization, horizontal and vertical individualism and collectivism (Triandis & Gelfand, 1998), and emotion theories in marketing. The horizontal and vertical individualism and collectivism is the most important among the three. It is a new development of Hofstede's (1991) four cultural dimensions. The present study is built on this new theoretical framework, and explores the relationship between cultural categories and cultural values, the relationship between cultural categories and emotions, and the relationship between cultural categories and information.

Another purpose of the present study is to assess two important car markets in the world, the Chinese and American markets. The US has a mature and well-developed auto industry. The history of American auto industry can be dated back to the 19th century. Today's American car industry owns world famous brands such as Ford, Pontiac, Chrysler, Lincoln, etc. The US also has the largest car market

in the world. Sales figures from 2006 showed that 1,309, 092 vehicles were sold by July in that year (Teahen, 2007). The market share of the American market was almost equally divided between domestic brands and foreign brands. In 2006, 51.9 % of the sales were imported vehicles, and 48.1% were domestic brands (Teahen, 2007). China, as an emergent market of car consumption, is enjoying soaring sales records. Its new passenger vehicle sales increase to 4.2 million units in 2006. China is now the second largest car market in the world (2007 Guide to China's Auto Market, 2007). Besides importing large volume of foreign brands such as Toyota, Ford, Honda, Volkswagen, etc China also exported 101,299 cars in 2006 (2007 Guide to China's Auto Market, 2007). Examining advertising strategies in the two markets will reveal from the angle of consumer-vehicle retailing to what extent the two markets differ from or resemble each other.

II. THEORIES & CONCEPT EXPLICATION

1. Standardization

International companies need to seek a balanced combination of communication objectives, brand images, and advertising budget in international advertising. To solve this problem, standardized advertising strategies and localized strategies were proposed. The idea of standardized strategies was to economize international promotion while localized strategies was intended for maximizing advertising effects on local markets (Laroche, et. al, 2001). Standardized strategies advocate using the same advertisement in every market to reduce advertising cost. As cost-wise strategies, as soon as it was proposed in 1960's, a discussion about whether international corporations could use identical advertising strategies in culturally different markets was heated up.

Cross-national segmentation was proposed as the theoretical backup to standardized strategies. It purported that certain groups of consumers behaved similarly across cultures. Another strong buttress to standardized strategies was that standardized advertising was not only about saving money, but also maintaining an integrated brand image in different markets (Laroche et. al 2001). In addition, business models were also developed to analyze standardized advertising. The most recent models of standardized advertising contain multi-factors, for example, the degree of control of MNCs (Multinational Corporations) over their subsidiaries, organizational factors, market situation, and advertising execution, just to name a few

(Harris, 1994; Laroche et. al, 2001; Samiee, Jeong, Hyeon, & Tai, 2003). Cultural differences have also been incorporated into standardization models (Laroche et. al, 2001). Standardization models became more and more elaborate; standardization strategies have been gradually transformed from complete standardization to degrees of standardization. Sak and Shaw (1999) used the term of contingent standardization to describe the idea that standardization could happen at any level and to any degree, depending on specific situations (Sak & Shaw, 1999).

Unlike the research in standardized advertising, localized advertising strategies always focus on cultural differences in advertising content. Researchers who support localized advertising strategy are questioning the idea of using the same advertisement across cultures. They took the strongest position at the beginning--- complete localization--- advertisement could not ignore cultural differences (Sak & Shaw 1999). Following this theory, researchers empirically gathered evidence of cultural dimensions manifesting in advertising content. Such studies were not well formulated until theories were borrowed from social psychology and cultural theories. Among them Hofstede's (1991) cultural dimensions are the most influential. Following Hofstede's theory, researchers examined relationships between ad appeals and cultural dimensions in advertisement from different countries (e.g. Albers-Miller & Gelb, 1996; Javalgi et al., 1995). The research started with print and TV media, and then spread to online advertising. Some of the empirical findings found significant cultural differences in advertisements (e.g. Singh, Zhao & Hu, 2005), and some of them did not detect significant differences in advertisements of different countries (e.g.

Kalliny & Gentry 2007).

Empirical studies in standardized and localized strategies provided a picture more complicated than what the complete localization and the complete standardization theories predicted: complete standardization or complete localization is rare in the real world. It seems that the theory of contingent standardization grabs the truth in the standardization issue --- it depends on each situation. Regarding this theoretical insight, the present study assesses the degree of standardization in the American and Chinese markets by making distinction between domestic advertisements and international advertisements. In addition, the present study also analyzes appeals to cultural values, emotions and information on product-based webpages of corporate websites.

2. Individualism and collectivism

When talking about cultural factors in international advertising, no one could skip individualism and collectivism (Hofstede, 1980; Hofstede, 1991). These two concepts explore individuals' relationships with the society and the degree of societal-individual dependence (Hofstede, 1991). In Hofstede's (1991) original work, countries were categorized into four cultural dimensions: individualism/collectivism, power distance, uncertainty avoidance, and masculinity. Among the four dimensions, individualism and collectivism enjoys the longest and most wide-spread popularity in social psychological studies. Individualism refers to giving priority to personal goals and objectives over group goals and objectives; collectivism works in the opposite direction --- personal goals and objectives are subjected to group goals and objectives

(Hofstede, 1991). Under Hofstede's (1991) categorization, researchers could hypothesize that advertisement in certain type of cultures would exhibit features of a specific cultural dimension that they belonged to.

Recently, a refined conceptualization of individualism and collectivism has been proposed by Triandis and Gelfand (1998). The new conceptualization draws great attention from the academic world. Triandis and Gelfand's (1998) theory purports that collectivism and individualism are not uni-dimensional construct. Under each of them, there is a horizontal and vertical division. The vertical and horizontal contrast is close to Hofstede's (1991) cultural category of power distance, but defined in more sophisticated ways. The vertical orientation emphasizes hierarchical structure in inter-personal relationship while the horizontal orientation stresses equality in human relationship (Shavitt, Lalwani, Zhang, & Torelli, 2006). This new multi-dimensional model consists of four sub-dimensions: horizontal individualism (HI), vertical individualism (VI), horizontal individualism (HI), and vertical individualism (VI). The source of individualism for vertical individual orientation is inequality between people. Those who are with VI would be inclined to agree with statements like I have better abilities or qualities than others do. In contrast, people with HI orientation understand independence based on equal relationship among people. They tend to agree with statements like I am who I am, and my ego is the same as others. Similarly, vertical collectivism is a collective orientation based on inequality, and horizontal collectivism is based on equality. To be specific, vertical collectivism refers to the interdependence between people of different social ranks or the privilege of collective

values over individual goals. Horizontal collectivism refers to interdependence between people who are equal and similar. Generally speaking, the horizontal pattern deals with relationship between peers, and the vertical pattern with relationship between different social levels (Li & Aksoy, 2007).

Measurements of VI, VC, HI, and HC have also been developed by Triandis, Chen, and Chan (1998) and Triandis and Gelfand (1998). The validity of these measurements has been extensively examined. The results unanimously indicated that the multi-dimensional model was a better model than either uni-dimensional or the bi-dimensional models in explaining cultural differences in values and personalities (Gouvenia, Clemente, & Espinosa, 2003; Li & Aksoy, 2007; Nelson, & Shavitt, 2002; Soh & Leong, 2002). Both the collectivism and individualism construct as well as the vertical and horizontal construct were found in empirical data, but the distinction between vertical and horizontal orientations was not as significant as the theory predicted (Gouvenia, Clemente, & Espinosa, 2003; Li & Aksoy, 2007; Nelson, & Shavitt, 2002; Soh & Leong, 2002).

The studies using Triandis and Gelfand's (1998) multi-dimensional model also categorized countries into cultural dimensions. According to Shavitt et al.'s (2006) theoretical synthesis, the United States is a vertical individualistic society, Denmark is a horizontal individualistic society, and Eastern Asian countries are vertical collective societies. Chen, Meindl, and Hunt's (1997) study implied that both vertical-orientation and horizontal orientation could be found within Chinese culture.

This new model of cultural orientations has not been widely adopted in

advertising research, but several directions have been explicated in Shavitt et al.'s (2006) theoretical paper. Future studies can explore how the power value differentiating the vertical and horizontal dimensions, the distance between vertical individualism orientation and the vertical collectivism orientation, and representations of horizontal orientations in advertisement (Shavitt et al., 2006). Shavitt et al. (2006) summarized from the perspective of consumer psychology that status, power, and achievements best represented the vertical individualism dimension; status, duty, and conformity best represented the vertical collective dimension; self-competence, self-direction, and independence best represented the horizontal individualism dimension; sociability, benevolence, and corporation best represented the horizontal collectivism dimension. This recent theoretical development in individualism and collectivism uplift the research of standardized advertising to a higher level of sophistication and preciseness.

3. Emotion, Information and Culture

Emotion has been widely discussed in advertising and marketing communication as an important component of persuasive communication. Theories of emotion in marketing and advertising were borrowed from psychology as early as in 1970s (Huang, 2001). The major four emotional theories are differential emotions theory, marketing success, circular model of emotion, and PAD (pleasure-displeasure, arousal-nonarousal, and dominance-submissiveness) model of affect (Huang, 2001). Richins' (1997) consumption emotion set (CES) identified 17 types of emotions and classified them into positive emotions, negative emotions and other emotions. Edell

and Burke (1989)'s ad feeling dimensions only had three sub-dimensions of emotion, namely upbeat, negative and warm feelings. Taking one step further into consumers' emotional reaction, Batra and Holbrook (1990) proposed 12 affective responses evoked by advertising messages. The 12 responses cover pleasure, arousal and domination. Aaker, Stayman, and Vezina (1988) developed the ad feeling model into 31 feeling clusters. 16 of them are positive emotions, and 15 are negative. In their study, they differentiated emotions that are inherent to the advertisement and feelings that a viewer have on an advertisement. Based on the four psychological emotional models, five empirical models have been developed in marketing research. Generally speaking, advertising research on emotions has three focuses: valence values of emotions, arousal level, and emotional categorizations. Besides the four emotional theories in marketing, the theory of basic emotions or primary emotions in cognitive psychology is also borrowed into marketing research. According to this theory, some emotions are more elemental than other emotions; they are universal and fundamental to all humans, despite cultures and races (Plutchik, 1980). Those elemental emotions cannot be de-composited, and are called basic emotions or primary emotions (Plutchik, 1980). Primary emotions are not many in number. They constitute other emotions. Studies in marketing that make use of the theory of basic emotions include Zeitlin and Westwood (1986), Havlena, Holbrook, and Lehmann (1989), Huang (1998), and Cervellon and Dube (2000).

An important but so far unclear issue associated with emotions is the influence of cultural dimensions on emotions. Emotions are culturally defined construct. As

pointed out by experientialism (embodied realism) (Lakoff, 1987), being cultivated in different language and cultural environment, people's cognition processes are quite different. Consequently, the representations of abstract concepts in real life vary from culture to culture. Emotions are also abstract dimensions, and have different representations in different cultures. Yu (1995)'s study on anger and happiness implies that even basic emotions are represented differently in different cultural contexts. By addressing the idiosyncrasy in the encoding process, the Limited Capacity Model also implies that cultural background influences people's reaction to emotional arousals (Lang, 2000).

Closely related with the relationship between emotions and culture, previous literature suggested that this relationship was usually moderate, but when it came to highly contextual emotions, the relationship was comparatively stronger. Oyserman, Coon and Kemmelmeier (2002) reviewed studies on the relationship between well-being, a sub-construct of emotions, and the individualism and collectivism orientations. Well-being refers to people's satisfaction with the society. Personal goals, happiness and personal control are essential to well-being in the individualism dimension, and obligation and duties are central to well-being in a collective context (Oyserman et. al, 2002). Their review also revealed that the individualism/collectivism contract and well-being were moderately related, and only highly contextualized emotions like appropriateness of expressing happiness and embarrassability were associated with lower individualism and higher collectivism (Oyserman et. al, 2002).

Besides emotion, information is another important component in advertising. The most popular theory in predicting the relationship between information and cultural orientations was the high and low contextual theory proposed by Hall (1976). High context means that much information in communication is presupposed rather than stated explicitly (Zhou et. al, 2005). In contrast, communicating in a low contextual culture contains more explicit information than presupposed information (Zhou et. al, 2005). Horizontal and vertical individualism and collectivism also developed similar theory to describe the same phenomena. Oyserman et al. (2002) categorized direct communication into features of individualism and contextualization into features of collectivism. A collectivism orientation is inclined to suppressing direct expression of information (emotions), and an individualism orientation encourages direct exchange of information (emotions). Since the individualism and collectivism theory also has a theoretical framework to incorporate information elements, the proposed study chooses to follow the individualism and collectivism framework.

III. LITERATURE REVIEW

The literature review has three parts: standardization, cultural values, and emotions and information. The theme of cultural dimensions glues the three parts together. In the first part, the present study argues that it is necessary to make a distinction between the international companies and domestic companies to evaluate the degree of standardization. Not making distinction between the two types of advertisement can reduce the statistical power of detecting cultural differences. Not differentiating advertisements of domestic brands from international brands, Kalliny and Gentry (2007) retained the null hypothesis --- TV commercials of the Arab world and the US did not showed significant cultural differences. On the contrary, Singh et. al (2005) deliberately made a distinction between domestic companies and international companies, and found cultural differences in advertisement from different countries.

The second part reviews studies on the relationship between cultural dimensions and cultural values. Those studies include Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996), Al-Olayan and Karande (2000), Javalgi et. al (1995), Soh and Leong (2002), and Zhou and Belk (2004). The first three studies examined the relationship between cultural dimensions and appeals to cultural values. Javalgi et. al's (1995) study did not applied Hofstede's (1991) cultural theories. Albers-Miller and Gelb's (1996) study used Hofstede's (1991) four dimensions and conducted a multi-national comparison. Al-Olayan and Karande

(2000) also applied Hofstede's (1991) dimensions, but their analysis only involved two countries. Limited number of countries enabled them to examine advertisements of the two cultures in detail. Soh and Leong's (2002) study was not directly related with advertisements. It dealt with the relationship between Schwartz's cultural values (1992) and Triandis and Gelfand's (1998) cultural dimensions. Zhou and Belk (2004) specifically addressed the issue of international appeals, which was related with the distinction between the vertical individualism orientation and the vertical collectivism orientation.

The third part of the literature review is about the relationship between emotions and cultural dimensions, and between information and cultural dimensions. Cervellon and Duté's (2000) study on food advertisement indicated that each emotion has different sensitivity to cultural dimensions. Zhou et. al (2005) compared cultural differences in information format in TV commercials. Okazaki (2004) extended cross-cultural comparison to online media. Along the process of viewing previous literature, hypotheses and research questions are raised.

1. Standardization, International Corporations and Domestic Corporations

Most of previous studies on cultural differences in advertisements did not make a distinction between advertisements of international corporations and domestic corporations. Not differentiating advertisements by domestic companies and international companies has several problems. First, the significance of cultural

differences observed in ad appeals, emotions and information may be smaller than it actually is. Domestic companies do not need standardized strategies; standardized strategies are only utilized by international companies. The statistical power of detecting differences in ad appeals, emotions, and information is reduced by advertisements of domestic corporations in the sample. Second, because of the same reasons, researchers cannot use this approach to evaluate the degree of standardization in advertisement. The degree of standardization is weakened by advertisements of domestic corporations in the sample.

When most of the advertisements are from international corporations, what are found in data are largely the effects of standardized advertising. One example would be Kalliny and Gentry's (2007) study on TV advertising of the Arab and American cultures. This study revealed a lot of similarities in the Arab and American TV commercials (Kalliny & Gentry, 2007). Kalliny and Gentry (2007) attributed those similarities to standardized advertising strategies of international corporations in TV commercials.

Kalliny and Gentry (2007) took a wider view of cultural values in this study. They pointed out that Islamic culture was a shaping force for the Arab world, and commented that the religious root in Muslim greatly influenced people's life. The authors brought up the heterogeneous ethnic origins of American people and the underlying Christian beliefs of major US citizens. Being so culturally different, the author hypothesized that Arab television commercials should display more traditional manifestation, more respect for the old, more manifestation of "oneness with nature",

more harmony and thriftiness, and the US advertisements had more appeals to independence and enjoyment in advertisements.

To answer those questions, Kalliny and Gentry (2007) conducted content analysis on 866 TV commercials of various product types sampled from the US and five Arabic countries. The results showed that there was no difference in “thriftiness,” respect to the old, tradition, and harmony. Differences on independence were moderate, and enjoyment did not exhibit any cultural sensitivities. With so many similarities being found between culturally different regions, the authors observed that since most of the TV commercials from the Arab world were about foreign commodities, the standardized advertising strategies applied by international companies reduced the effects of cultural differences.

Singh et. al’s (2005) study was fully aware of the distinction between advertising by domestic corporations and international corporations. Contrary to Kalliny and Gentry’s (2007) findings, Singh et. al’s (2005) comparison of domestic corporate websites in India, China, Japan and the US led to the conclusion that Websites were divided along their cultural affiliation.

The purpose of their study was to find out whether domestic corporate websites depicted domestic cultural values. They used Hofstede (1991)’s original categorization (individualism-collectivism contrast, power distance, uncertainty avoidance, masculinity-femininity) and the high and low context contrast. To evaluate culture content of domestic websites from the four countries, coders were required to assess the degree of depiction of each cultural value category on a five-point likert scale ranging from “not depicted” to “prominently depicted.” The results indicated that domestic sites of India, China, Japan and the US differ significantly from each

other on cultural dimensions. On the collectivism dimension, Japanese and Chinese websites were significantly higher in the depiction of collectivist values than the US and Indian websites were.

The above two studies revealed from different angles that international companies discount the effects of cultural orientations in advertising. The comparison that can actually reveal cultural differences is the one that compares local advertisements. Therefore, the present study makes a distinction between domestic corporate websites and international corporate websites. In addition, taking domestic companies as standards, the evaluation of the degree of standardization can be meaningful and justifiable. The present study evaluated the degree of standardization of international corporations

2. Cultural Dimensions and Appeals to Cultural Values

One strong argument of localized advertising strategy is that advertisements cannot overcome differences in cultural values. Appeals to cultural values have been widely observed in across-cultural advertising. The most popular method revealing differences in appeals to cultural values is content analysis. In early stage of examining cultural values in advertisement, there was not the concept of cultural orientation, and the comparison was on case by case basis. Therefore, the strong relationships between advertising features and cultures detected in those early studies could not be generalized to larger samples without cultural orientations and cultural categorizations of countries.

Javalgi et. al's (1995) content analysis of magazine ads in the US and Japan was one of the early type. Their theoretical model was a four-way categorization of advertisement appeals: executional elements, process appeals, content appeals, and

portrayal of people¹. The results showed that price information was more frequently portrayed in Japanese advertisements. Portrayal of products in print ads had no difference in the two cultures. In terms of process appeals, Japanese advertisements tended to be more symbolic than American advertisements. Although American advertisements used more content appeals, appeals of status and quality were significantly higher in Japanese advertisements. Being influenced by the idea of localization, Javalgi et. al (1995) warned against standardized advertising strategy, by saying that practitioners should be prudent in using advertising appeals in different cultures.

Two things are worth mentioning in this study. First, a collective society (Japan) prefers more symbolic and metaphorical ways of communication while an individualistic society (the US) does not show this inclination. This is in line with the theoretical observation in Oyserman et. al's (2002) paper. Second, without specifying which specific appeals of status were being used, Javalgi et. al (1995) study showed that status appeals were more frequently used in a vertical collective society (Japan) than in a vertical individualistic culture (the US).

A second stage of cultural comparison of advertisement was marked by the application of Hofstede's (1991) four cultural dimensions (individualism/collectivism, power distance, uncertainty avoidance, and masculinity) and cultural scores of countries on the four dimensions. With the assistance of the concept of cultural

¹ Executional elements referred to product portrayals and price information. Process appeals consisted of the identification of the product or the company, description of the product, comparison, metaphors, storytelling, and association with lifestyle. Content appeals mainly included quality, variety of choice, status, comfort, and beauty. Portrayals of people referred to groups of people with different demographic characteristics.

dimensions, researchers could generate meaningful results with samples from more than two countries.

Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996) examined the relationship between the old four cultural dimensions and ad appeals by conducting content analysis on 11 countries' advertisement. Their categories of ad appeals were modified from Pollay's (1983) categories. They collected advertisement from business publications covering office use products, financial products, travel, and clothing. The results showed that some of the ad appeals, but not all of them, had either significantly positive or negative relationships with one of the cultural dimensions. Especially findings with individualism/collectivism and power distance were similar to those of later studies under the two dimensional model (individualism and collectivism) and the four dimensional model (vertical individualism, horizontal individualism, vertical collectivism, and horizontal individualism). To be specific, appeals to independence, distinctive, and self-respect were positively related with individualism; popular, affiliation, family, and community appeals were negatively related with individualism; status appeals were negatively related to power distance.

Besides multi-country comparisons, there were also two-culture comparisons under Hofstede's (1991) theoretical framework, which reached higher precision in examining culture-specific differences in detail. Al-Olayan and Karande's (2000) two culture comparison was conducted between the US and the Arab culture. The cultural factors they took into consideration included individualism, collectivism, high/low context (Hall 1976), socio-economic and religious factors. Similar to Kalliny and

Gentry's (2007) observation, Al-Olayan and Karande (2000) pointed out that Arab culture is greatly influenced by religion. It is highly contextual and collectivistic. On the contrary, American culture is influenced by Christianity. It is individualistic and low in context. Through their content analysis, Al-Olayan and Karande (2000) disclosed insight of information and emotions in advertisement. Information content in Arab ads was more implicit than that in the American ads, and emotional appeals were more frequently used in Arab ads than explicit information was. Contrary to the findings in Javalgi, Cutler, and Malhotra's (1995) study, Al-Olayan and Karande (2000) found less price information in advertisements of a collective culture (the Arab world).

Studies in the old four dimensions (Hofstede, 1991) have made a lot of achievements in identifying cultural differences in advertising, but as pointed out in the previous part, only individualism/collectivism enjoys a sustaining and increasing popularity in the academic circle. This pair of relationship has been developed into a new four-dimension model. Being comparatively new, studies applying this theoretical development were most in the field of cross-cultural psychology. These studies were rather inspiring to marketing and advertising research (Shavitt et al., 2006). Soh and Leong (2002) cross-validated the 16-item attitude measurement (Triandis and Gelfand, 1998) with Chinese samples, and examined its construct validity by correlating it with Schwartz's 10 values (Schwartz, 1992) and Holland's six interest types. The results showed that vertical collectivism was strongly correlated with the conformity value; vertical individualism was strongly related with

the power value; horizontal collectivism was strongly related with the benevolence value; and horizontal individualism was strongly related with the self-direction value.

Although previous research revealed significant relationships between cultural orientations and cultural values, so far it is not clear whether those observed relationships can be found in advertisement. To fill this gap, the present study will examine the relationship between the cultural dimensions and ad appeals to cultural value with Chinese corporate websites and American corporate websites. The two specific cultural dimensions chosen in this present study is vertical collectivism and vertical individualism. Shavitt et al. (2006) pointed out that China was a vertical collective culture, and the US a vertical individualistic culture. They also (Shavitt et al., 2006) summarized the relationships between cultural values and cultural orientations from the perspective of consumer psychology. Based on their summary, the present study defines four types of cultural values: vertical individualism values (VI values: status, power, achievement, and others), vertical collectivism values (VC values: status, conformity, and others), horizontal individualism values (HI values: self-competence, self-direction, independence, and others), and horizontal collectivism values (HC values: benevolence and others). Therefore, the first two hypotheses are:

H1: More domestic American corporate websites than domestic Chinese corporate websites applies appeals to vertical individualism values (VI values).

H2: More domestic Chinese corporate websites than domestic American corporate websites applies appeals to vertical collectivism values (VC values).

Previous empirical findings showed that there were more appeals to status in a collective cultural than in an individual culture (Albers-Miller and Gelb, 1996; Al-Olayan and Karande, 2000; Javalgi et. al, 1995), but Shavitt et al. (2006) implied that there should not be much differences between vertical individualism and vertical collectivism in terms of status value. To clear up this academic confusion, the present study also tests the following hypothesis:

H3: Domestic Chinese corporate websites will apply more appeals to statues than domestic American corporate websites will.

Another observation of Shavitt et al. (2006) was that vertical individualism and vertical collectivism shared the status value but in different ways. People with vertical individual orientation value achieved status (higher status because of personal achievement) while people with collective orientation value ascribed status (higher status because of demographic differences). Achieved status refers to status gained by personal efforts and achievements. Ascribed status refers to status related with a person's family background or other factors related with demographics. The subtle differences between achieved status and ascribed status were captured by previous studies on international appeals in Chinese advertisement.

Appeals to international portrayals or symbols stand for higher social status because of its foreign nature. Zhou and Belk (2004) studied people's perception of international and local appeals. It used a reader-response approach to collect and analyze participant's' reaction to ads with either international appeals or local appeals. They used focus group and unstructured interview. Their analysis showed that global

appeals were read as symbols of beauty, status and cosmopolitanism. They explained that manzi (prestige face) factor drives Chinese viewers seeking global appeals. Wang (2003) also pointed out in his analysis of industrial cases that it was the underlying global factors that led to the success of advertisement. Testing international appeals will confirm the results found by Zhou and Belk (2004) and Wang (2003), and at the same time provided evidence to the distinction between vertical individualism and vertical collectivism:

H4: More domestic Chinese corporate websites than domestic American corporate websites will employ international appeals (a feature of ascribed status).

Related with the issue of degree of standardization, the present study also tests the following two hypotheses:

H5: Fewer American international corporate websites than domestic American corporate websites will use appeals to vertical individualism values (VI values).

H6: Fewer Chinese international corporate websites than domestic Chinese corporate websites will use appeals to vertical collectivism values (VC values).

3. Emotion, Information and Cultural Dimensions

Another issue in the present study is the relationship between emotion, information and cultural dimensions. Previous studies on these two relationships were mostly based on the old four-dimension theory (Hosftede, 1991), and high and low contextual theory (Hall, 1976). All of them revealed the same trend that more direct and expressive way of communication was more frequently found in an

individualistic culture than in a collective culture.

Cervellon and Duté (2000) explored differences in emotions between standardized advertisements and localized advertisements. Cervellon and Duté (2000) chose French and English Canadians as its research subjects. They conducted a content analysis on TV ads targeted to the two cultural groups. They compared 123 standardized advertisements and 182 culture-specific advertisements. The 182 culture-specific advertisements included two pools of advertisements. One pool contained French advertisements and the other contained English advertisements. These advertisements had at least one cultural specific element. The results showed that the frequencies of product information and basic positive emotions were equal in the three categories of advertisements. The frequencies of negative emotions and humor-based appeals were less in standardized advertisements than in culture-specific advertisements. Cervellon and Duté's (2000) results supported the idea that emotions have different sensitivity to cultural dimensions. Highly contextual emotions (negative emotions and humor-based appeals) are strongly correlated with cultural orientations.

Zhou et. al (2005) focused on the information format of TV commercials. They sampled from major TV channels of the US and China. They were mainly focusing on the format of visual communication, including visual story line, visual comparison, visual identification, pacing, subjective camera, and direct address as well as some content-related ad components such as group images and appeals to traditions and history. Drawing evidence from less complete visual story lines, less direct and visual

product comparison and late identification of brand names, we can conclude from this study that Chinese commercials more frequently made use of indirect ways of conveying message.

Okazaki's (2004) two-country comparison of product-based websites was a comprehensive analysis of cultural differences between Japan and the US in information content, creative strategies and cultural values. The author conducted a content analysis of 50 pairs of product-based Japanese corporate webpages in Japan and the US. The results showed that American society displayed more frequent usage of emotional/psychological appeals on its web sites than on the Japanese websites (Okazaki, 2004). In addition to Okazaki's (2004) findings, Al-Olayan and Karande (2000) found that emotional appeals were more preferred than direct information in Arab advertisements.

Taking Chinese cultural as a representative of collective culture and the US as individualistic culture, the present study empirically tests several hypotheses related with information and emotions:

H7: Domestic American corporate websites are more informative than domestic Chinese websites.

H8: More emotional appeals will be found on the sampled domestic American corporate websites than on the sampled domestic Chinese websites.

The following four hypotheses are to evaluate to what extent international corporations use standardized strategies in terms of emotional and informational appeals:

H9: Domestic American corporate websites are more informative than international American corporate websites.

H10: More emotional appeals will be found on the sampled domestic American corporate websites than on the sampled international American corporate websites.

H11: Domestic Chinese corporate websites are less informative than international Chinese corporate websites.

H12: Fewer emotional appeals will be found on the sampled international Chinese corporate websites than on the sampled domestic Chinese corporate websites.

IV. METHODOLOGY

1. Content Analysis

Content analysis has been widely used in analyzing cross-cultural differences (Albers-Miller and Gelb, 1996; Javalgi et. al, 1995; Kalliny and Gentry, 2007; Zhou et. al, 2005). Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996), Javalgi et. al (1995), and Kalliny and Gentry (2007) examined magazine advertisements. Zhou, et. al (2005) focused on TV commercials. Content analysis is also used to analyze Web content (Okazaki, 2004; Singh, Zhao and Hu, 2005). Singh et. al (2005) analyzed corporate websites; Okazaki (2004) studied product-based webpages; Fong and Burton (2006) analyzed user generated content on online discussion boards. The reason why so many scholars chose content analysis to study advertising content is that it is a systematic, objective and quantitative way of analyzing media content. Compared with other methods, content analysis is featured by systematic sampling that complies with the mathematic rules of probability. Content analysis develops a quantification system to code media content. In the ideal case, the coding process is objective, ruling out a researcher's personal bias. Since content analysis is quantitative, we can analyze relationships between variables by using statistic calculation.

2. Sampling

In order to eliminate the influence of industry types, only one type of product is

chosen in this study. A single product type comparison is not infrequent in international advertising research. Colvin, Heeler, and Thorpe's (1980) study was an early cross-cultural comparison of a single product type. It conducted a case study of the international advertising of Ford, an American car brand in the European market. Singh, Zhao and Hu (2005) selected only domestic corporate websites of electronics and automobiles to avoid industry effects. Following these studies, the present study chooses car as the single product category. The reason of choosing the car category is that it meets the required sampling size of the present study. Car can give enough cases of international brands and domestic brands in both the Chinese and American markets. Additionally, choosing the car category can reveal differences of two markets that are at different developmental levels. The US is a mature market for cars. It is consuming a large number of automobiles. China is a quickly expanding car market; it replaces Japan and becomes the second largest car market in the world (Nick, 2007).

To collect samples of websites of domestic Chinese companies, domestic American companies, and international companies in the Chinese and American markets, the first step is pooling Chinese car models, American car models, and international car models. The reason of choosing models as the entry point for sampling rather than brands is that model-based advertising is more product-oriented. Brands are larger categories which usually contain specific models. For example, there are 17 models under the brand of Toyota in the American market. Advertising for the brand Toyota is less flexible in execution and needs to maintain a uniformed

brand image. On the contrary, advertising for models are product-based advertising. Product-based advertising has more flexible execution and occupies a larger portion of advertising than brand advertising does. Therefore, the present study chose models to examine cultural differences.

There are two standards of selecting models. The first standard is whether it is a current brand in the market, and the second standard is whether it is advertised on corporate websites. To meet the two standards, only models that are listed on both popular websites of consumer vehicles and corporate websites will be selected into the sample. For cars in the Chinese market, a list of domestic car models and a list of international car models were composed from information on [www. sina.com.cn](http://www.sina.com.cn), a large portal website in China, and the corporate websites of car companies. Similarly, a list of domestic American car models and a list of foreign models sold in the American market were composed based on information from dealernet.com, an online car search engine, and corporate websites. It turns out that there are 23 domestic brands and 121 domestic models in the American market; 22 foreign brands and 248 foreign models in the American market. The Chinese market has 37 domestic brands and 175 domestic car models; 35 foreign brands and 236 foreign models. All the brands and the number of models under each brand are listed in tables 2 to 5, and the specific models are listed in Appendixes A to D.

Table 1: Models

Domestic Chinese models	Domestic American models	International Chinese models	International American models
175	121	236	248

Table 2: American Domestic Brands

	Frequency	Percent
Buick	3	2.5
Cadillac	11	9.1
Chevrolet	17	14.0
Chrysler	9	7.4
Dodge	17	14.0
Ford	17	14.0
GMC	6	5.0
Hummer	5	4.1
Jeep	7	5.8
Lincoln	5	4.1
Mercury	5	4.1
Pontiac	7	5.8
Saab	6	5.0
Saturn	6	5.0
Total	121	100.0

Each brand has 3 to 17 models. Chevrolet, Dodge, and Ford have the most models (17 models, 14%). Buick has the fewest models (3, 2.5%).

There are 22 foreign brands in the American market. They are listed in the following table.

Table 3: American Foreign Brands and Models

	Frequency	Percent
Acura	5	2.0
Audi	8	3.2
BMW	30	12.1
Honda	15	6.0
Hyundai	9	3.6
Infiniti	5	2.0
Isuzu	4	1.6
Jaguar	4	1.6
Kia	10	4.0
Land Rover	4	1.6
Lexus	9	3.6
Mazda	13	5.2
Mercedes-Benz	44	17.7
MINI	4	1.6
Mitsubishi	7	2.8
Nissan	14	5.6
Scion	3	1.2
Subaru	17	6.9
Suzuki	6	2.4
Toyota	17	6.9
Volkswagen	11	4.4
Volvo	9	3.6
Total	248	100.0

Mercedes-Benz has the most models (44, 17.7%), and Scion has the least (3, 1.2%).

For the Chinese market, there are 37 domestic brands. Beiqi Zhizao has the most models (17, 9.7%). Some of the brands only produce one model.

Table 4: Chinese Domestic Brands and Models

	Frequency	Percent
北京现代 Beijing Xiandai	4	2.3
北汽制造 Beiqi Zhizao	17	9.7
比亚迪 BYD	4	2.3
昌河铃木 Changhe Linmu	1	.6
昌河汽车 Changhe Auto	5	2.9
长城汽车 Changcheng Auto	9	5.1
长丰汽车 Changfeng Qiche	6	3.4
长丰扬子 Changfeng Yangzi	5	2.9
东风汽车 Dongfeng Auto	3	1.7
福迪汽车 Futian Auto	5	2.9
福田汽车 Futian Auto	1	.6
哈飞汽车 Hafei Auto	12	6.9
海马汽车 Haima Auto	4	2.3
华晨汽车 Huachen Auto	6	3.4
吉奥汽车 Gonow	8	4.6
吉利汽车 Jili Auto	6	3.4
江淮汽车 Jianghuai Auto	7	4.0
江铃汽车 Jiangling Auto	7	4.0
江南汽车 Jiannan Auto	3	1.7
力帆汽车 Lifan Auto	1	.6
南汽新雅途 Nanqi Xi Yan Tu	2	1.1
奇瑞汽车 Chery Auto	12	6.9
庆铃汽车 Qingling Auto	1	.6
上海华普 Shanghai Huapu	4	2.3
上海汽车 Shanghai Auto	1	.6
曙光汽车 Shuguang Auto	7	4.0
双环汽车 Shuanghuai Auto	3	1.7
天津一汽 Tianjin Yi Qi	4	2.3
天马汽车 Tianma Auto	1	.6
通用五菱汽车 Tongyong Wulin	4	2.3
一汽丰越 Yiqi Fengyue	2	1.1
一汽华利 Yiqi Chuali	1	.6
一汽吉林 Yiqi Jinlin	4	2.3
一汽轿车 Yiqi Jiaochē	5	2.9
一汽自由风 Yiqi Ziyoufeng	1	.6
中兴汽车 Zhongxing Auto	8	4.6
众泰汽车 Zhongtai Auto	1	.6
Total	175	100.0

Table 5: Chinese Foreign Brands and Models

	Frequency	Percent
Acura	3	1.3
Audi	6	2.5
BMW	16	6.8
Buick	6	2.5
Cadillac	5	2.1
Chevrolet	7	3.0
Chrysler	3	1.3
Citroen	8	3.4
Dodge	4	1.7
Ferrari	1	.4
FIAT	4	1.7
Ford	9	3.8
Honda	6	2.5
Hyundai	6	2.5
Jaguar	3	1.3
Jeep	3	1.3
Kia	5	2.1
Landrover	4	1.7
Mazda	3	1.3
Mercedes-Benz	20	8.5
MG	2	.8
Mini	2	.8
Misubishi	8	3.4
Nissan	10	4.2
Opel	5	2.1
Peugeot	9	3.8
Porshche	20	8.5
Saab	4	1.7
Subaru	5	2.1
Suzuki	2	.8
Toyota	14	5.9
Volkswagen	15	6.4
Volvo	7	3.0
Maserati	6	2.5
SsangYong	5	2.1
Total	236	100.0

For foreign brands in the Chinese market, there are 37 in total. Mercedes-Benz and Porshche have the most models (20, 8.5%). Ferrari is only selling one model in

the Chinese market.

The present study ran a random sampling from the lists of domestic Chinese websites, domestic American websites, international Chinese websites, and international American websites. 50 models were randomly selected from each list. In total, 200 models were selected into the content analysis. Webpages of all the 200 models were collected and coded between late December 2007 and early February 2008. URL links and the mhtml files of the webpages were restored. In case that some webpages cannot be restored because of technical reasons, screen shoots were taken instead.

3. Unit of Analysis

The unit of analysis is the product-based corporate webpage. The process of identifying a unit of analysis includes three steps. The first step is to open the corporate website. Take Camry as an example. Camry is a model of Toyota. The first step is to open Toyota's corporate website: <http://www.toyota.com/index.html>. The second step is to find out the product-based webpage for Camry. Under the menu of "Cars", you can find Camry. Click on "Camry", and then the webpage of Camry is opened up. This webpage is the product-based webpage that the present study analyzes; it is the unit of analysis.

The most important feature of a product-based webpage is that the content of the webpage is about a specific model. Following Okazaki's (2004) practice, coders only need to examine to the second level of hyperlinks if no relevant information is found

on the first page. First, coders code all the content on the webpage, but do not click the hyperlinks on this webpage. Second, if there is no relevant content on that webpage, coders will click on every link on the page, and code content on the hyperlinked webpages. Third, if coders still cannot find any relevant content after examining those hyperlinked webpages, then stop coding.

Take the following Camry's page as an example. You are going to code the content shown by the main menu bar, the slogan, the side bar, the shopping tool, the images, and text below the image. For example, the slogan of Camry "Commonly chosen. Uncommonly engineered." contains cultural ad appeals, and this webpage also has price information. Therefore, coders do not need to click links on this webpage. Otherwise, coders should click every link on that webpage. If no relevant content is found on those hyperlinked webpages, they will be instructed to stop coding.

The first reason for coding content on the first page is that only analyzing the first page could provide enough information for meaningful analysis (Hwang et al., 2003). The second reason is that doing this can highly improve the accuracy and efficiency of coding online contents (Okazaki, 2004; Ha & James, 1998). Last but not least, viewers usually stop at the first page of product-based webpage. Only a very small group of people who have high involvement will explore information beyond the first layer of product-based webpage. Analyzing the first page reveals the real effects of online advertising.

Websites are a multi-media way of advertising. There are texts, video, audio,

graphics, animation, banner ads, pop-up messages, etc on websites. Since the interests of the present study are advertising content, only media forms that contain enough verbal and visual messages will be coded. Following Okazaki's (2004) study, the present study will analyze textual information, video, audio, graphics and animation, but not banner ads and pop-up messages. The two forms are considered as tools catching viewer's attention, and do not have much content (Okazaki, 2004).

4. Coding Instrument

There are three parts in the coding instrument. The first part is cultural values. The present study examined values that are sensitive to cultural orientations. As described in the literature review part, there are four large coding categories of values: vertical individualism (VI values), horizontal individualism (HI values), vertical collectivism (VC values), and horizontal collectivism (HC values). Under each large category, there are subcategories. The definition of each sub-category is adopted from Schwartz's (1992) ten basic values and Shavitt's (2006) theoretical synthesis. In generally, VI values include achieved status, power, and achievements; VC values include ascribed status, harmony, and international appeals; HI values include self-competence, self-direction, and independence; HC values include benevolence.

Values representing vertical individualism are defined as values emphasizing inequality between people, and expressing the idea that I have better abilities or qualities than others do. According to Shavitt et al. (2006), status, power, and achievements best represent the vertical individualism dimension. Achievement is

defined as “personal success through demonstrating competence according to social standards (Schwartz & Rubel, 2005, p. 1011).” The operation definition of achievement is success of a product, a company, or personal success. To be specific, achievement value includes appeals that express the idea that “the vehicle is/I am outstanding” through demonstrating the competence of a vehicle. Adjectives or adverbs that describe general quality, for example good, outstanding, etc or the superlative forms of those words belong to this category.

Schwartz and Rubel (2005) defined power as “social status and prestige, control or dominance over people and resources (p. 1010).” According to the definition, social status is a sub-category of power. However, previous studies in international advertising treated appeals to social status as an independent category (e.g. Albers-Miller & Gelb, 1996; Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Javalgi, Cutler & Malhotra, 1995; Okazaki, 2004; Zhang & Gelb, 1996; Zhou & Belk, 2004). Appeals to social status refer to ad content that depicts higher social ranks, luxurious life, and prestige. Therefore, in the present study, power is reduced to “control or dominance over people and resources (Schwartz & Rubel, 2005, p. 1010).” Its operation definition is products or people that are dominant, controlling others. The words that are used to express this value are dominant, dominating, control, leader, etc.

Values representing vertical collectivism based on inequality, stressing interdependence between people of different social ranks or the privilege of collective values over individual (Shavitt et al., 2006). Conformity/harmony and ascribed status best present the vertical collectivism orientation (Shavitt et al. 2006). According to

Shavitt et al. (2006), conformity has the same meaning as harmony does. Conformity/harmony is defined as “restraint of actions, inclinations, and impulses likely to upset or harm others and violate social expectations or norms (Schwartz & Rubel, 2005, p. 1011).” Harmony value in advertisement is operationalized as appeals to good relationship with other people and appeals to harmonious atmosphere.

VC values overlap with VI values on social status values (Shavitt et al. 2006). According to the four-dimensional cultural orientation theory, status value will not be sensitive to the difference between VC and VI cultures. In order to test this prediction, the present study coded status value which is generally defined as higher social ranks, luxurious life, and prestige.

Shavitt et al. (2006) suggested that VC and VI values are different on sub-categories of status value. There are two sub-categories under the status value, namely achieved and ascribed social status, and each of the above two cultural dimensions is featured by one of these two status values (Shavitt et al, 2006). According to previous research (Shavitt et al, 2006), international appeals embody ascribed status. More international appeals signify a strong inclination to VC orientation. Therefore, international appeals are coded to test this sub-category theory. International appeals refer to events, sites, or people which do not belong to the local place. Non-Chinese events, sites, or people in Chinese advertisements ads (including domestic Chinese ads and international ads in the Chinese market) are international appeals. American events, sites, or people in Chinese ads (including domestic Chinese ads and international ads in the Chinese market) are also international appeals.

Chinese events, sites, or people in Chinese ads (including domestic Chinese ads and international ads in the Chinese market) are local appeals, not international appeals. Similarly, non-American events, sites, or people in American ads (including domestic American ads and international ads in the US market) are international appeals. Chinese events, sites, or people in American ads (including domestic American ads and international ads in the US market) are also international appeals. American events, sites, or people in American advertisements (including domestic American ads and international ads in the US market) are local appeals, not international appeals.

Values representing horizontal individualism emphasize equality between people, and embody the idea that I am who I am, and my ego is the same as others' (Shavitt et al., 2006). Self-direction, independence, and self-competence are featured values of horizontal individualism. Self-direction refers to independence of thought and action (Shavitt et al. 2006). Choosing, creating, exploring activities are examples of self-direction. Independence means not relying on another or others. Pilot coding reveals that the semantic overlap between self-direction and independence leads to strong correlation between appeals to self-direction and independence. Therefore, the two values are put into one coding category "self-direction/independence." This category is operationally defined as independent thought or action of people or personified products, such as choosing, creating, exploring activities or such independent thought or action with the assistance of a vehicle. Self-competence refers to personal abilities of doing something. It is operationally defined as product's abilities or personal abilities of doing something that are not based on any objective

evaluation.

Appeals to horizontal collectivism are based on equality, placing importance on interdependence between people who are equal and similar (Li & Aksoy 2007). Horizontal collectivism is strongly related with benevolence value (i.e., preserving and enhancing the welfare of people to whom one is close). Benevolence value is operationalized as products or people that can preserve and enhance the welfare of people to whom one is close, for example families, friends, colleagues, etc, through the product. Specific examples of benevolence value include appeals to family, friendship, companionship, etc.

The following table summarizes cultural orientations and cultural value categories used in coding.

Table 6: Cultural Values

VI Values	VC Values	HI Values	HC Values
Status (general)	Status (general)	Self-direction/Independence	Benevolence
Power	Conformity/Harmony	Self-competence	
Achievement	International Appeals		

Each category has two values, 0 and 1. When a cultural value is used on a website, the value of that cultural value is 1. If there is on instance of a cultural value, its value is 0. In case that the coder is not sure whether a cultural value is applied, 0 will be applied.

The second part of the coding instrument is emotions. In coding, coders are required to differentiate emotions inherent to the advertisement and perceived

emotions of viewers. The same practice was followed by Aasker, Stayman, and Vezina's (1988) study on 31 emotional categories. Pilot coding revealed that the distinction between emotional types in inherent emotions is quite blurring. Therefore, only 7 basic emotional types are selected. The selection is based on previous studies on emotions (Zeitlin and Westwood, 1986; Havlena, Holbrook, and Lehmann, 1989; Huang, 1998; Cervellon and Dube, 2000). The seven types include four positive emotions and three negative emotions. Four positive emotions are happiness, love, humor, and relaxation. Three negative emotions are sadness, anger, and fear. Like cultural values, each emotional type has two values, 1 or 0. 0 stands for non-presence of an emotional appeals or when the coder cannot tell which emotional category is used.

The coding of information is adapted from Okazaki's (2001; 2004) coding schema, which is originated in Resnik and Sterns' (1977) information classification system. 12 information cues were coded. They were price/value, shape, accessories, safety, quality, performance, guarantees, availability, special offers, independent research, company research, and new ideas. When an informational cue appears, the value of 1 is assigned. When an informational cue does not appear or cannot be classified into any of the informational categories, value 0 is assigned. See Appendix E for examples of coding categories.

5. Reliability

A single coder coded all websites. The coder is bilingual in Chinese and English.

Since only one coder was coding, two rechecks have been done after the coding with certain time interval. When there is only one coder, intra-coder reliability is used to evaluate the coding schema (Holsti, 1969). To compute intra-coder reliability, 20% of the samples, 40 cases in total were recoded. 10 cases were selected from each type of websites. The first three cases, the three cases in the middle, and the last four cases of each type of websites are selected. Intra-coder reliability should be higher than 80%. The following table shows the intra-coder reliabilities of each variable. All of them are above 80%.

Table7: Intra-Coder Reliability

Ad Appeals	Intra-coder reliability
Cultural Values	
	Status 100%
	Power 97.5%
	Achievement 92.5%
	Harmony 100%
	Self-direction/Independence 100%
	Self-competence 92.5%
	Benevolence 97.5%
	International appeals 100%
Emotional Appeals	
	Happy 92.5%
	Love 97.5%
	Humor 100%
	Relax 97.5%
	Sad 100%
	Anger 100%
Information Content	
	Price 95%
	Shape 92.5%
	Component 90%
	Safe 87.5%
	Quality 90%
	Performance 90%
	Guaranty 92.5%
	Availability 85%
	Special Offer 95%
	Independent Research 95%
	Company Research 97.5%
	New Ideas 100%

V. RESULTS

To test the hypotheses proposed in the present study, stepwise discrimination analysis was used. Stepwise discriminant analysis determines which predictive variables out of an array of variables can differentiate a priori categories, and to which degree these a priori categories are different from each other (McLaughlin, 1980; Williams & Monge 2001). This method is especially useful when researchers want to select some subset of variables that can classify memberships (McLaughlin, 1980). In stepwise discriminant analysis, the dependent variable is categorical, and independent variables can be either categorical or continuous (Williams & Monge 2001). In the present study, the pre-determined categories are the four types of websites, domestic Chinese websites, domestic American websites, international Chinese websites, and international American websites. Each time, two types of websites are subjected to stepwise discriminant analysis on cultural values, informational cues, and emotional appeals, in order to test whether the two types of websites are statistically different on any of the independent variables.

The first part of analysis is cultural values. 225 cultural values were found in 200 corporate websites. The total number of cultural values in domestic and international American websites is 88. Domestic Chinese websites have 70 cultural values, domestic American websites contain 45 cultural values, international Chinese websites have 67 cultural values, and international American websites apply 43

cultural values. More cultural values have been observed with Chinese websites than with American websites.

Table 8: Frequencies of Cultural Values

	Cultural values	Domestic Chinese Webpages	Domestic American Webpages	International Chinese Webpages	International American Webpages
VI values	84	22	25	20	17
	Status	12 (24%)	11 (22%)	14 (28%)	7 (14%)
	Power	1 (2%)	3 (6%)	4 (8%)	3 (6%)
	Achievement	9 (18%)	11 (22%)	2 (4%)	7 (14%)
VC values	77	28	11	29	9
	Status	12 (24%)	11 (22%)	14 (28%)	7 (14%)
	Harmony	2 (4%)	0	3 (6%)	0
	International Appeals	14 (28%)	0	12 (24%)	2 (4%)
HI values	45	7	8	14	16
	Self-direction	5 (10%)	1 (2%)	3 (6%)	4 (8%)
	Self-competence/In dependence	2 (4%)	7 (14%)	11 (22%)	12 (24%)
HC values	19	13	1	4	1
	Benevolence	13 (26%)	1 (2%)	4 (8%)	1 (2%)
Total	225	70	45	67	43

The stepwise discrimination analysis shows that the difference between domestic Chinese websites and domestic American websites are moderate but statistically significant. The p-value of chi-square is lower than .000, and therefore the two categories are significantly different. Wilks' Lambda (.742) indicates that the mean

difference between the two types of websites is not very big. The group difference has moderate relationship with the canonical function (canonical correlation = .503). The variables that affect the observed difference between the two types of websites are international appeals, appeals to benevolence, and appeals to harmony. The standardized canonical discriminant function coefficients show that international appeals has the largest contribution to the difference between the two types of websites ($r=.723$), benevolence value has moderate contribution ($r=.576$), and harmony has low correlation with the canonical function ($r=.403$).

The frequency table tells us that on the side of domestic Chinese websites, 14 of them have international appeals, 2 have harmony value, and 13 have benevolence value. On the side of the American websites, none of them uses international appeals and harmony; the number of websites applying benevolence is 1. Another way to look at the results is the composition of cultural values of each sampled category. First, among 70 cultural values found in domestic Chinese websites, 20% are international appeals, 2.9% are harmony, and 18.6% are benevolence. Second, among 45 cultural values found in domestic American websites, only 2.2% are benevolence values, and there is no harmony value or international appeals in domestic American websites. Looking at the frequencies of each cultural value, we can see that domestic American websites have much less benevolence value than domestic Chinese websites do, and American websites do not contain harmony and international appeals.

According to the result of the discrimination analysis, none of the IV values (status, power, and achievement) have been entered into the analysis. That means

none of these values are significant in differentiating domestic Chinese websites from domestic American websites. Therefore, hypothesis 1 is denied. The difference between the domestic Chinese samples and the domestic American samples is not statistically significant. In other words, appeals to status, power, and achievement cannot predict which category an online advertisement belongs to.

Hypothesis 2 is partially supported. Two VC values, international appeals and harmony value are entered into the stepwise discriminant analysis. International appeals stand for ascribed status, which belongs to vertical collective orientation. The results indicate that international appeals are the strongest factor in differentiating domestic Chinese websites from domestic American websites. Harmony value only has slight influence on the difference between the two categories. The results indicate definite but small relationship between harmony and culture category.

Besides VC values, benevolence value is also significant across the two types of websites. Benevolence is a horizontal collective value; it is only sensitive to horizontal collective orientation. The present study, however, found that it is a feature of Chinese culture. A reasonable explanation is that Chinese culture is also a horizontal culture. This is in line with Chen, Meindl, and Hunt's (1997) observation that Chinese culture has features of both vertical collectivism and horizontal collectivism.

According to the four-dimensional cultural theory, without differentiating achieved status and ascribed status, status value is not sensitive to the difference between vertical cultures. Results of the stepwise discrimination analysis are in line

with the theoretical prediction. Status value is not selected into the analysis, and therefore does not show significant difference between Chinese culture representing vertical collectivism and American culture representing vertical individualism. Consequently, hypothesis 3 is denied, and hypothesis 4 is retained.

Table 9: Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Harmony, Benevolence, and International Appeals

	Function 1
Harmony	.403
Benevolence	.576
International appeals	.723

Table 10: Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Domestic Chinese and US Websites

Cultural Values	Domestic Chinese	Domestic US	Function 1
Status	17.1%	24.4%	.125
Power	1.4%	6.7%	.023
Achievement	12.9%	24.4%	-.024
Harmony	2.9%	0	.245*
International Appeals	20%	0	.748*
Self-direction	7.1%	2.2%	.085
Self-competence/Independence	2.9%	15.6%	-.014
Benevolence	18.6%	2.2%	.625*
Eigenvalue=.384			
Canonical Correlation=.508			
Wilks' Lambda=.742			
Chi-square=28.793**			

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of cultural values found in domestic Chinese samples is 70.

Total number of cultural values found in domestic US samples is 45.

Hypothesis 5 is testing the standardization degree of international websites in the

American auto market. The discriminant analysis shows that there is no significant difference between domestic American websites and international American websites. None of the VI cultural values is qualified for the discriminant analysis; no canonical function is found. In other words, international American websites are similar with domestic American websites. International American websites apply localized advertising strategies, and therefore their standardization degree is near zero.

Table 11: Correlations with the Canonical Function of American Websites

Cultural Values	Domestic US	International US
Status	17.1%	16.3%
Power	1.4%	7.0%
Achievement	12.9%	16.3%
Harmony	2.9%	0
International Appeals	20%	4.7%
Self-direction	7.1%	9.3%
Self-competence/Independence	2.9%	28.0%
Benevolence	18.6%	2.3%

Total number of cultural values found in domestic US samples is 45.

Total number of cultural values found in international US samples is 43.

Similar with online advertisements in American car market, the Chinese international corporate websites also use localized advertising strategies. The discriminant analysis did not select any of the VC values (status, harmony, or international appeals). Therefore, hypothesis 6 is denied.

Table 12: Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Achievement, Self-Competence, and Benevolence

	Function 1
Achievement	.662
Self-competence	-.711
Benevolence	.522

The conclusion that international Chinese websites apply complete localized strategies cannot come naturally from the rejection of hypothesis 6. Achievement, a VI value, self-competence, a HI value, and benevolence, a HC value are selected into the stepwise analysis between domestic Chinese corporate websites and international Chinese corporate websites. The standardized canonical correlations show that all the three values have substantial relationship with the canonical function (the correlations of achievement, self-competence, and benevolence are .662, -.711, and .522). Chi-square of the canonical function is statistically significant ($p < .000$). Canonical correlation shows definite but low relationship (.431) between the group difference and the canonical function. Since Wilks' Lambda is .814, and Eigen value is .229, mean difference between the two categories is slight. The results of the discriminant analysis indicate that international corporate websites apply different advertising strategies in the Chinese market from domestic Chinese websites.

From the frequency table and the unstandardized correlation table, we can see that domestic Chinese websites contain nine achievement values (12.9%), two self-competence/independence values (2.9%), and thirteen benevolence values (18.6%), while international Chinese websites contain two achievement values (3.0%), eleven self-competence/independence values (16.4%), and four benevolence values

(6.0%). The international samples apply more self-competence/independence value (HI), and much less achievement value (VI) and benevolence value (HC) than the domestic samples do.

The standardization degree of international Chinese corporate websites is an intricate one. On one hand, they are localized on VC values. On the other hand, their advertising strategies are different from the domestic samples on self-competence/independence, achievement, and benevolence values. A logical explanation could be that international Chinese corporate websites apply a combination of standardized strategies and localized strategies.

Table 13: Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Chinese Websites

Cultural Values	Domestic Chinese	International Chinese	Function 1
Status	17.1%	20.9%	.199
Power	1.4%	6.0%	.086
Achievement	12.9%	3.0%	.480*
Harmony	2.9%	4.5%	-.225
International Appeals	20%	18.0%	.155
Self-direction	7.1%	4.5%	-.150
Self-competence/Independence	2.9%	16.4%	-.581*
Benevolence	18.6%	6.0%	.516*
Eigenvalue=.299			
Canonical Correlation=.431			
Wilks' Lambda=.814			
Chi-square=19.864**			

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of cultural values found in domestic Chinese samples is 70.

Total number of cultural values found in international Chinese samples is 67.

Cultural differences on information are another important part of the present study. The statistical analysis shows that 866 informational cues were identified in 200 corporate websites. American websites have more informational cues than Chinese websites do. Domestic American websites contain 251 informational cues, and the number of international American websites is 264. Domestic Chinese websites have 164 informational cues, and international Chinese websites contain 187 informational cues.

Table 14: Frequencies of Information Content

Information Content	Domestic Chinese	Domestic US	International Chinese	International US
Price	9	47	18	45
Shape	37	50	46	48
Accessories	13	34	10	36
Safe	27	25	29	27
Quality	8	4	14	0
Performance	32	34	43	40
Guarantee	4	29	0	11
Available	27	48	22	43
Special Offer	0	0	0	1
Independent Research	3	10	4	9
Company Research	4	0	1	0
New Ideas	0	0	0	4
Total	164	251	187	264

A stepwise discriminant analysis was run for domestic Chinese websites and domestic American websites. The results show that domestic Chinese websites substantially differ from domestic American websites. The discrimination scores is strongly correlated with the two types of websites (canonical correlation= .837). Wilks' Lambda (.300) and the value of chi-square (115.619) indicate that the means of

the two types of websites are greatly different. Therefore, hypothesis 7 is fully supported.

Variables that were selected into the stepwise analysis are price, shape, accessories, and guarantee. Price is the major factor in the discrimination; it has the largest correlation with the canonical function. Guarantee, shape, and accessories only have moderate or small correlations with the discrimination function. From the frequency table, only nine Chinese websites give price information while as many as 47 out of 50 domestic American websites give price information. Domestic Chinese websites consistently provide less information of price, shape, accessories, and guarantee than domestic American websites do.

Table 15: Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Domestic Chinese and US Websites

	Function 1
Price	.811
Shape	.297
Accessories	.301
Guarantee	.476

Table 16: Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function

Information Content	Domestic Chinese	Domestic US	Function 1
Price	5.5%	18.7%	.779*
Shape	22.6%	20.0%	.274*
Accessories	7.9%	13.5%	.304*
Safe	16.5%	10.0%	.179
Quality	4.9%	1.6%	.072
Performance	19.5%	13.5%	.009
Guarantee	2.4%	11.6%	.411*
Available	16.5%	19.1%	.339
Special Offer	0	0	0
Independent Research	1.8%	4.0%	.095
Company Research	2.4%	0	.034
New Ideas	0	0	0
Eigenvalue=2.335			
Canonical Correlation=.837			
Wilks' Lambda=.300			
Chi-square=115.619**			

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of information content items found in domestic Chinese samples is 164.

Total number of information content items found in domestic American samples is 256.

Hypothesis 9 is testing the standardization degree of international American websites. The results of stepwise discriminant analysis show that only information of guarantee is different on the two types of websites. Wilks's Lambda (.865) and canonical correlation (.367) indicate that the explanatory power of guarantee for the mean differences between the two types of websites is small. The frequency table shows that domestic American websites provide 29 guarantee information cues while only 11 international American websites have guarantee information. Domestic American websites provide more guarantee information cues than international American websites do. Based on these results, hypothesis 9 is partially supported:

domestic samples are only slightly more informative than international samples. In other words, the standardization degree of international American websites is quite low.

Table 17: Standardized Canonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Guarantee

	Function 1
Guarantee	1.000

Table 18: Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of American Websites

Information Content	Domestic US	International US	Function 1
Price	18.7%	17.0%	-0.94
Shape	20.0%	18.2%	-.089
Accessories	13.5%	13.6%	.017
Safe	10.0%	10.2%	.288
Quality	1.6%	0	.192
Performance	13.5%	15.2%	.125
Guarantee	11.6%	4.2%	1.0*
Available	19.1%	16.3%	.210
Special Offer	0	0.0	-.094
Independent Research	4.0%	3.4%	.180
Company Research	0	0	0
New Ideas	0	1.5%	-.101
Eigenvalue=.156			
Canonical Correlation=.367			
Wilks' Lambda=.865			
Chi-square=14.140**			

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of information content items found in domestic American samples is 256.

Total number of information content items found in international American samples is 266.

The stepwise discrimination analysis for domestic Chinese websites and international

Chinese websites shows that the two types of websites are slightly different. The canonical correlation is low (.367), and Wilks' Lambda (.859) indicates that the two types of websites does not differ from each other very much. The standardized canonical coefficients show that two independent variables, shape and performance are significantly different across the two types of websites. Both of them have a strong correlation with the canonical function. From the frequency table of information content, we can see that international Chinese websites give more information of shape and performance than domestic ones do. Therefore, hypothesis 11 is supported. International Chinese websites provided more information than domestic Chinese websites. Specially, international Chinese websites provide more shape and performance information.

Table 19: Correlation with Canonical Function of Shape and Performance

	Function
	1
Shape	.780
Performance	.813

Table 20: Unstandardized Correlations with the Canonical Function of Chinese

Websites

Information Content	Domestic Chinese	International Chinese	Function 1
Price	5.5%	9.6%	.028
Shape	22.6%	24.6%	.608*
Accessories	7.9%	5.3%	.008
Safe	16.5%	13.9%	-.006
Quality	4.9%	7.5%	-.017
Performance	19.5%	23.0%	.647*
Guarantee	2.4%	0	-.063
Available	16.5%	11.8%	-.173
Special Offer	0	0	0
Independent Research	1.8%	2.1%	-.179
Company Research	2.4%	0.1%	-.026
New Ideas	0	0	0
Eigenvalue=.165			
Canonical Correlation=.376			
Wilks' Lambda=.859			
Chi-square=.001**			

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.00

Total number of information content items found in domestic Chinese samples is 164.

Total number of information content items found in international Chinese samples is 187.

The last part is emotional appeals. Only 60 emotional appeals are found. No incidence of humor is found, and there are a few love and relaxation appeals. None of these websites apply negative emotional appeals (no appeals to sadness and anger). Most of the websites use appeals to happiness.

Table 21: Frequencies for Emotional Appeals

Emotions	Domestic Chinese	Domestic US	International Chinese	International US
Happy	14	11	21	10
Love	0	2	0	2
Humor	0	0	0	0
Relaxation	2	0	1	1
Sadness	0	0	0	0
Anger	0	0	0	0
Total	16	13	21	10

The stepwise analysis shows that there is no significant difference between domestic Chinese websites and domestic American websites, domestic Chinese websites and international Chinese websites, and domestic American websites and international American websites on emotional appeals. Therefore, hypotheses 8, 10 and 12 are objected. Statistically, domestic Chinese websites do not contain more emotional appeals than domestic American websites do. Therefore, emotional appeals are not sensitive to cultural orientations. International Chinese websites and domestic Chinese websites do not apply different strategies in using emotional appeals according to the statistics. International American websites and domestic American websites do not differ on emotional strategies, either. Since no difference is found between all the four types of websites, it is not clear whether standardization strategies or localization strategies have been used. A possible and logical explanation could be that in terms of emotional appeals, basic and universal emotion like happiness is prevailing in many cultures.

Table 22: Percentages of Emotional Appeals of Domestic Websites

Emotions	Domestic Chinese	Domestic US
Happy	87.5%	84.6%
Love	0	15.4%
Humor	0	0
Relaxation	12.5%	0
Sadness	0	0
Anger	0	0

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of emotional appeals found in domestic Chinese samples is 16.

Total number of emotional appeals found in domestic American samples is 13.

Table 23: Percentages of Emotional Appeals of Chinese Websites

Emotions	Domestic Chinese	International Chinese
Happy	87.5%	95.5%
Love	0	0
Humor	0	0
Relaxation	12.5%	4.5%
Sadness	0	0
Anger	0	0

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of emotional appeals found in domestic Chinese samples is 16.

Total number of emotional appeals found in international Chinese samples is 22.

Table 24: Percentages of Emotional Appeals of American Websites

Emotions	Domestic US	International US
Happy	84.6%	76.9%
Love	15.4%	15.4%
Humor	0	0
Relaxation	0	7.7%
Sadness	0	0
Anger	0	0

*variables that are used in the stepwise discriminant analysis and the canonical functions.

**P<.000

Total number of emotional appeals found in domestic American samples is 13.

Total number of emotional appeals found in international American samples is 10.

VI. DISCUSSION

There are two major purposes of the present study. The first one is to test the theory of four-dimensional cultural orientations with online advertisements. The four-dimensional cultural orientation theory is developed from Hofstede's (1991) cultural dimensions. Previous studies in cross-cultural psychology (Shavitt et al., 2006; Soh and Leong 2002; Triandis and Gelfand, 1998) have found significant relationships between the four cultural dimensions and cultural values. The present study reveals that online advertisements reflect cultural differences as traditional media do. The differences speak out on cultural values and informational cues. The degree of differences is moderate. Emotional appeals do not show differences across cultures.

Cultural values only have a moderate relationship with cultural orientations in online advertisement. VC values are more sensitive to cultural differences than VI values are. Chinese online advertising is moderately different from American online advertising on international appeals and harmony values. On all VI values, domestic Chinese websites and domestic American websites do not show statistically significant differences.

Of the two VC values that are sensitive to cultural orientation, international appeals are the most sensitive. It turns out that Chinese culture prevalingly prefers international scenes, images, or faces. This result is in line with Zhou and Belk's

(2004) focus group interview as well as Wang's (2003) observation of several industrial cases. Zhou and Belk's (2004) theory is manzi (prestige face) factor, and the theory of present study is cultural orientation. The two theories agree with each other: international appeals enjoy popularity in Chinese culture.

International appeals also reveal that status value has different connotations in Chinese culture and American culture. According to Shavitt et al. (2006), status in American culture refers to higher social rank gained through personal efforts or achievements while status in Chinese culture refers to higher social ranks because of demographic features. As Zhou and Belk (2004) pointed out, people read international appeals as higher status because of their global nature, a demographic feature. The results of the present study confirm that international appeals are more popular in Chinese advertisements, and international appeals are proven to be a valid index for VC orientation. Moreover, the theoretical proposal that there are two sub-categories under status value is verified with empirical evidence from the present study.

The results from the present study also provide evidence to Shavitt et al.'s (2006) theory that there should not be many differences between vertical individualism and vertical collectivism in terms of status value. Different from previous empirical findings which showed that there were more appeals to status in a collective cultural than in an individual culture (Albers-Miller and Gelb, 1996; Al-Olayan and Karande, 2000; Javalgi et. al, 1995), the rejection of hypothesis 3 and retaining of hypothesis 4 show that status value defined in general sense is not sensitive to the distinction between vertical collectivism and vertical individualism. As the four-orientation

cultural theory points out, VC culture and VI culture are both vertical orientations. Without specifying the sub-categories of status, the status value as a vertical indicator could not tell the difference between two vertical orientations.

The present study also indicates that horizontal collectivism and vertical collectivism orientations are not necessarily exclusive within one culture. In the present study, benevolence value appears in Chinese advertisement more frequently than in American advertisement. Benevolence value is correlated with horizontal collectivism (Shavitt et al., 2006). In other words, Chinese advertisements also have features of horizontal collectivism. Chinese culture is a combination of VC orientation and HC orientation. Similar conclusion was also reached in Chen, Meindl, and Hunt's (1997) study. Although so far it is not clear how the four-orientation cultural theory can explain this phenomenon, future studies can explore how the two cultural orientations constitute Chinese culture, and answer questions like which one is more prominent, and whether there are other cultures that are also composed of more than one cultural orientation. Such study can help to improve the theoretical framework of the four-dimensional culture theory.

Another important part of the cultural comparison is emotional appeals and informational cues. As theories predict American culture applies much more information cues in advertisement than Chinese culture. According to the result, Chinese websites contain 164 information cues, and American websites have 251 information cues. This result is also in line with previous studies in information content on traditional media which are under the theory of high and low contexts

(Alberts-Miller and Gelb, 1996; Al-Olayan and Karande, 2000). Among all information cues, price is one of the most frequently discussed information features in cross-cultural advertising comparison. The present study found that price is more frequent in American culture than in Chinese culture, a major eastern culture. The same difference between western culture and eastern culture was also found in Alberts-Miller and Gelb's (1996) and Al-Olayan and Karande's (2000) studies on American advertisement and Arabic advertisement. The theories of high and low context as well as the cultural dimensional theory turn out to be making the same prediction.

Given that the specific product type in question is consumer cars, which are high-involvement products, it is not surprising that on both type of websites, over 100 information cues have been found. Compared with informational appeals, the number of emotional appeals is much smaller, no more than 22 in each pool of samples. In the present study, no relationship is found between emotional appeals and cultural orientation. American online advertisements do not statistically have more emotional appeals than Chinese online advertisements do. All four categories are high on appeals to happiness. This does not necessarily mean that the cultural dimensional theory fails. As pointed out in Cervellon and Duté's (2000) study, basic emotions are more frequently in advertisement, especially happiness. It might be that basic emotions are universal in every culture. Oyserman et. al (2002) pointed that only highly contextual emotion has moderate relationship with cultural orientation. Apparently, basic emotions are not highly-contextual. Therefore, like the theory

predicts, the relationship between emotions and cultural orientation is quite small or no relationship would even show.

For the purpose of eliminating the contamination of international websites, the present study only compared domestic websites in analyzing cultural differences. Consequently, the results are based on a pure domestic-domestic advertisement comparison. Another advantage of making distinction between domestic websites and international websites is that it sets baselines for the evaluation of standardization degree.

To assess the standardization degree of online car advertisement in the Chinese and American market, international online advertisements on each market are compared to its domestic advertisements. International Chinese websites are compared with domestic Chinese websites, and international American websites are compared with domestic American websites.

Thinking that the cost of online advertising is much less than advertisements on traditional media, we are expecting that more localization and less standardization will be found in online environment for the sake of better communication with the local market. The results confirm the prediction. International American website use highly localized strategies, and the standardization degree is very low. International American websites are completely localized on cultural values; only information of guarantee shows frequency difference from domestic websites. No evidence supports standardization strategies in emotional appeals, either.

In contrary to American online advertising, a combination of localization

strategies and standardization strategies are applied on international Chinese websites. Although no frequency difference is found on all VC values, differences on achievement (a VI value), self-competence (a HI value), and benevolence (a HC value) do indicate the existence of non-localized factors on international Chinese websites. The benevolence value is of special interests. As pointed out in the previous analysis, none of the VC values are significantly different on online advertisements of VC and VI orientations, but benevolence value appears in domestic Chinese websites more frequently than in domestic American websites. Therefore, benevolence value is a feature of Chinese advertisements, though it is not a VC value. Then, a subsequent conclusion is that international Chinese websites are localized on VC values but not localized on benevolence values. In addition, the standardization degree of information content is high on international Chinese websites. International Chinese online advertisements are more informative than domestic online advertisement. They provide more information of shape and performance. Since no difference is found between all the four types of websites, it is not clear whether standardization strategies or localization strategies have been applied to emotional cues. This may be another sub-effect of basic emotions. Generally speaking, the localization degree of international Chinese websites is lower than international American websites.

In conclusion, according to the findings here, Chinese online advertisements and American online advertisements are different in terms of cultural values and information content; they belong to two types of culture. The relationship between the four cultural orientations and cultural values exists in the context of online advertising.

Cultural orientation can predict difference of information content as well. Because of the universality of basic emotions, there is no difference on emotional appeals in online advertisements. The results on standardization revealed that online advertisements apply high degree of localization, and a combination of localization strategies and standardization strategies is a common practice in online advertisement. Moreover, the localization degree of the American car market is higher than the Chinese car market. The empirical findings lend support to the contingent theory of standardization; it better captures standardization and localization strategies in real advertisement.

VII. LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE RESEARCH

The present study only uses one product type; future study can examine other product types. First, the present study did not find significant difference on the achievement value. There is not a ready answer for this phenomenon in the four-cultural-orientation theory. One possibility is that since owning car is considered a symbol of achievement in both countries, advertisements emphasize achievement values in both markets. Future study could explore whether the same phenomenon can be observed with a different product types. Second, car is a high-involvement product category; looking at the effects of cultural orientation on low-involvement products could be a very valuable direction for future studies. As Ahmed, Johnson, and Boon (2004) pointed out that low-involvement products and high-involvement product influence people's perception of advertisement in different ways. People process information related with high-involvement product through the halo effect, and people process information related with low-involvement product through the summary effect. Future study can verify whether this distinction affect cultural affiliation reflected in advertisements.

The issue of information cues is far from clear. Okazaki (2004) found price, performance, component, and guarantees are statistically different across two types of culture. Interestingly, in his study Japanese websites are little more informative than American websites. There are more price information and company research in Japanese websites, and the total number of information cues is slightly more than American websites. Javalgi, Cutler, and Malhotra (1995) also came to the same result

on price. It seems that information is beyond merely cultural orientation; it might be more country-specific. Future studies could conduct more in-depth and detailed research on information content and cultural affiliation, and establish factors that really play in.

References:

- 2007 Guide to China's Auto Market. (2007, May 14). *Automotive News Europe*, 3.
- Aasker, D. A., Stayman, D. M., & Vezina, R. (1988). Identifying Feelings Elicited by Advertising. *Psychology & Marketing*, 5, 1-16.
- Ahmed, Z., Johnson, J. P. & Boon, L. C. (2004). Does country of origin matter for low-involvement products? *International Marketing Review*, 21 (1), 102-120.
- Albers-Miller, N. & Gelb, B. (1996). Business Advertising Appeals as a Mirror of Cultural Dimensions: A Study of Eleven Countries. *Journal of Advertising*, 25 (4), 57-70.
- Allen, K. (2007). Media: Online Advertising Share Overtakes Newspaper: Britain Ahead of US in Rush to Reach Broadband Nation Spending Grows Overall but TV revenues fall. *The Guardian*, March 28, 30.
- Al-Olayan, F. & Karande, K. (2000). A Content Analysis of Magazine Advertisements from the United States and the Arab World. *Journal of Advertising*, 29(3), 69-82.
- Andrew, J. (2007). Online Ad Spending Proves Bigger than Thought. *The Dominion Post*, October 10, 1.
- Batra, R., & Holbrook, M. B. (1990). Developing a Typology of Affective Responses to Advertising. *Psychology and Marketing*, 7, 11-25.
- Bosman, J. (2006). Paper's Online Ads Outpace Print. *The International Herald Tribune*, June 7, 24.
- Cervellon, M.-C. & Duté, L. (2000). Standardization Versus Cultural Adaptation in Food Advertising: Insights from a Two-Culture Market. *International Journal of Advertising*, 19, 429-447.

Chen, C. C., Meindl, J. R. , & Hunt, R. G. (1997). Testing the Effects of Vertical and Horizontal Collectivism: A Study of Reward Allocation Preferences in China. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 28(1), 44-70.

Colvin, M., Heeler, R., and Thorpe, J. (1980). Developing International Advertising Strategy. *Journal of Marketing*, 44(3), pp. 73-79.

Edell, J. A. & Burke, M. C. (1987). The Power of Feelings in Understanding Advertising Effects. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14, 421-433.

Fong, J., and Burton, S. (2006). Electronic Word-of-Mouth: A Comparison of Stated and Revealed Behavior on Electronic Discussion Boards. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, 6 (2), 61-70.

Gouvenia, V. V., Clemente, M., & Espinosa, P. (2003). The Horizontal and Vertical Attributes of Individualism and Collectivism in a Spanish Population, *Journal of Social Psychology*, 143(1), 43-63.

Ha, L. & James, E. L. (1998). Interactivity Reexamined: A Baseline Analysis of Early Business Web Sites. *Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media*, 42(4), 457-469.

Hall, E. T. (1976). *Beyond culture*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday & Company.

Harris, G. (1994). International Advertising Standardization: What do the Multinationals Actually Standardized? *Journal of International Marketing*, 2(4), 13-30.

Hofstede, G. (1980). *Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-Related Values*. Beverly Hill, CA: Saga Publication.

Hofstede, G. (1991). *Cultures and Organizations: Software of the Mind*. London: McGraw-Hill.

Holsti, O. (1969). *Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Huang, M. (1998). Exploring a New Typology of Advertising Appeals: Basic Versus Social, Emotional Advertising in a Global Setting. *International Journal of Advertising*, 17, 145-168.

Huang, M. (2001). The Theory of Emotions in Marketing. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 16 (2), 239-247.

Hwang, J. S., McMillan, S. J. and Lee, G. (2003). Corporate Web Sites as Advertising: An Analysis of Function, Audience, and Message Strategy. *Journal of Interactive Advertising* 3(2), online at: <http://jiad.org>, accessed 4 June 2003.

Javalgi, R., Cutler, B. D. and Malhotra, N. K. (1995). Print Advertising at the Component Level: A Cross-Cultural Comparison of United States and Japan. *Journal of Business Research*, 34(2), 117-124.

Kalliny, M. & Gentry, L. (2007). Cultural Values Reflected in Arab and American Television Advertising. *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 29(1), 15-32.

Lakoff, G. (1987). *Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal about the Mind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lang, A. (2000). The Limited Capacity Model of Mediated Message Processing. *Journal of Communication*, Winter, pp.46-71.

Laroche, M., Kirpalani, V. H., Pons, F., & Zhou, L. (2001). A Model of Advertising Standardization in Multinational Corporations. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 32 (2), 249-266.

Li, F. & Aksoy, L. (2007). Dimensionality of Individualism-Collectivism and Measurement Equivalence of Triandis and Gelman's scale. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 21(3), 313-329.

McLaughlin, M. L. (1980). Chapter 6. Discriminant Analysis in Communication Research. In P. R. Monge & J. N. Cappella (Eds.), *Multivariate Techniques in Human Communication Research*, (pp. 175-204). Beverly Hills, Calif.: Sage.

Nelson, M. R., & Shavitt, S. (2002). Horizontal and Vertical Individualism and Achievement Values: A Multimethod Examination of Denmark and the United States. *Journal of Cross-cultural Psychology*, 33(5), 439-458. (Paper Copy)

Nick, C. (2007). Long road ahead for Chinese cars. *The Dominion Post* (Wellington, New Zealand), Januray 30, 5.

Okazaki, S. (2004). Does Culture Matter?: Identifying Cross-National Dimensions in Japanese Multinationals' Product-based Websites. *Electronic Markets*, 14(1), 58-69.

Oyserman, D., Coon, H. M., & Kemmelmeier, M. (2002). Rethinking Individualism and Collectivism: Evaluation of Theoretical Assumptions and Meta-analyses. *Psychological Bulletin*, 128, 3-72.

Perez, B. (2006). China Online Advertising Hits 1.5b Yuan; Analysts Believe Market Has Much Room to Grow as Nissa, Founder and Coke Splurge. *South China Morning Post*, September 12, 9.

Plutchik, Robert. (1980). *Emotion: A Psychoevolutionary Synthesis*. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers.

Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring the Cultural Values Manifest in Advertising. *Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, James H. Leigh and Claude R. Martin, Jr., eds., Ann Arbor: Graduate School of Business, Division of Research, University of Michigan, 71-92.

Quah, M. (2007). Websites Enhance Communication. *The Business Times Singapore*, May 22, Special Focus.

Resnik, A. & Stern, B. L. (1977). An Analysis of Information Content in Television Advertising, *Journal of Marketing*, 41(1), 50-3.

Richins, M. L. (1997). Measuring Emotions in the Consumption Experiences. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 24, 127-146.

Sak, O. & Shaw, J. J. (1999). Standardized International Advertising: Some Research Issues and Implications. *Journal of Advertising Research*, November/December, 19-24.

Samiee, S., Jeong, I., Hyeon, J., & Tai, S. (2003). Advertising Standardization in Multinational Corporations: The Subsidiary Perspective. *Journal of Business Research*, 56, 613-626.

Schwartz, S. H. (1992). Universals in the Structure and Content of Values: Theoretical Advances and Empirical Tests in 20 Countries. In M. P. Zanna (Ed.), *Advances in experimental social psychology* (Vol. 25, pp. 1-65). Orlando, FL: Academic Press.

Schwartz, S. H. & Rubel, T. (2005). Sex Differences in Value Priorities: Cross-cultural and Multimethod Studies. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 89(6), 101-1028.

Scott, W. A. (1955). Reliability of Content Analysis: The Case of Nominal Scale Coding, *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 17, 321-325.

Shavitt, S., Lalwani, A. K., Zhang, J., & Torelli, C. J. (2006). The Horizontal/Vertical Distinction in Cross-cultural Consumer Research. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 16 (4), pp.325-356. (Paper Copy)

Singh, N., Zhao, H., & Hu, X. (2005). Analyzing the Cultural Content of Web Sites: A Cross-National Comparison of China, India, Japan, and US. *International Marketing Review*, 22(2), 129-146.

Soh, S., & Leong, F. T. (2002). Validity of Vertical and Horizontal Individualism and Collectivism in Singapore: Relationship with Values and Interests. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 33(1), 3-15. (Paper Copy)

Teahen, J. (2007). Imports Take Control of U.S. Market. *Automotive News*, August 6, 43.

Triandis, H. C., Chen, X. P., & Chan, D. K. (1998). Scenarios for the Measurement of Collectivism and Individualism. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 74(1), 118-128. (Paper Copy)

Triandis, H. C. & Gelfand, M. J. (1998). Converging Measurement of Horizontal and Vertical Individualism and Collectivism. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 74(1), 118-128.

Wang, J. (2003). Framing Chinese Advertising: Some Industry Perspective on the Production of Culture. *Continuum: Journal of Media & Cultural Studies*, 17(3), pp. 247-260.

Williams, F. & Monge, P. (2001). *Reasoning With Statistics: How to Read Quantitative Research*. Belmont, CA: Thomson Higher Education.

Yu, N. (1995). Metaphorical Expressions of Anger and Happiness in English and Chinese. *Metaphor and Symbolic Activity*, 10 (2), 59-92

Zeitlin, D. & Westwood, R. A. (1986). Measuring Emotional Response. *Journal of Advertising Research*, Oct/Nov, 34-44.

Zhou, N. & Belk, R. W. (2004). Chinese Consumer Readings of Global and Local Advertising Appeals. *Journal of Advertising*, 33(3), 63-76.

Zhou, S., Zhou, P., & Xue, F. (2005). Visual Differences in U.S. and Chinese television Commercials. *Journal of Advertising*, 34 (1), pp. 111-119.

APPENDIX A: AMERICAN DOMESTIC BRANDS AND

MODELS

Brand	Models	Brand	Models
Chevrolet	Malibu Sedan	Dodge	Avenger
Chevrolet	Aveo 5	Dodge	Caravan
Chevrolet	Aveo Sedan	Dodge	Grand Caravan
Chevrolet	Cobalt Coupe	Dodge	Durango
Chevrolet	Cobal Sedan	Dodge	Nitro
Chevrolet	Impala	Dodge	Dakota
Chevrolet	Corvette	Dodge	RAM 1500
Chevrolet	Avalanche	Dodge	RAM 2500
Chevrolet	Colorado	Dodge	RAM 3500
			RAM 3500 HD
Chevrolet	Silverado	Dodge	Chassis CAB
Chevrolet	Equinox	Dodge	Sprinter
			Ram4500 HD Chassis
Chevrolet	HHR	Dodge	CAB
			Ram5500 HD Chassis
Chevrolet	Suburan	Dodge	CAB
Chevrolet	Tahoe	Jeep	Wrangler
Chevrolet	Traiblazer	Jeep	Patriot
Chevrolet	Express	Jeep	Liberty
Chevrolet	Uplander	Jeep	Compass
Buick	Enclave	Jeep	Wrangler Unlimited
Buick	LaCrosse	Jeep	Commander
Buick	Lucerne	Jeep	Grand Cherokee
Pontiac	G5	Mercury	Milan
Pontiac	G6	Mercury	Mariner
Pontiac	G8	Mercury	Sable
Pontiac	Solstice	Mercury	Mountaineer
Pontiac	Grand Prix	Mercury	Grand Marquis
Pontiac	Torrent	Chrysler	300
Pontiac	Vibe	Chrysler	Crossfire
GMC	Sierra	Chrysler	PT Cruiser
GMC	Canyon	Chrysler	Sebring Sedan
GMC	Envoy	Chrysler	Town & Country
GMC	Yukon	Chrysler	Chrysler Aspen

GMC	Acadia	Chrysler	Pacifica
GMC	Savana	Chrysler	PT Cruiser
Saturn	Sky	Chrysler	Sebring Convertible
Saturn	Ion Quad Coupe	Saab	9-3 Sport Sedan
Saturn	Ion Sedan	Saab	9-3 Convertible
Saturn	Aura	Saab	9-3 Sportcombi
Saturn	Vue	Saab	9-5 Sedan
Saturn	Outlook	Saab	9-5 Sportcombi
Hummer	H2	Saab	9-7X SUV
Hummer	H2-SUT	Lincoln	Lincole MKX
Hummer	H3	Lincoln	Lincole MKZ
Hummer	H3-ALPHA	Lincoln	Navigator
Hummer	H3X	Lincoln	Mark LT
Cadillac	CTS	Lincoln	Town Car
Cadillac	STS	Ford	Focus
Cadillac	DTS	Ford	Fusion
Cadillac	XLR Roadster	Ford	Mustang
Cadillac	SRX Crossover	Ford	Taurus
Cadillac	CTS-V	Ford	Edge
Cadillac	STS-V	Ford	Taurus X
Cadillac	XLR-V	Ford	Escape
Cadillac	Escalade	Ford	Sport Trac
Cadillac	ESV	Ford	Escape Hybrid
Cadillac	EXT	Ford	Explorer
		Ford	Expedition
		Ford	Ranger
		Ford	F-150
		Ford	Super Duty 250
		Ford	Super Duty 350
		Ford	Super Duty 450
		Ford	E-series

APPENDIX B: AMERICAN INTERNATIONAL BRANDS AND MODELS

Brand	line-up	models
Acura	MDX	
Acura	RDX	
Acura	RL	
Acura	TL	
Acura	TSX	
Audi	Q7	
Audi	R8	
Audi	TT	
Audi	A3	
Audi	A4	
Audi	A5	
Audi	A6	
Audi	A8	
BMW	3 Series	328i Sedan
BMW	3 Series	328xi Sedan
BMW	3 Series	335i Sedan
BMW	3 Series	335xi Sedan
BMW	3 Series	328i Sports Wagon
		328xi Sports
BMW	3 Series	Wagon
BMW	3 Series	328i Coupe
BMW	3 Series	328xi Coupe
BMW	3 Series	335xi Coupe
BMW	3 Series	328i Convertible
BMW	3 Series	335i Convertible
BMW	5 Series	528i Sedan
BMW	5 Series	528xi Sedan
BMW	5 Series	535i Sedan
BMW	5 Series	535xi Sedan
BMW	5 Series	550i Sedan
BMW	5 Series	535i Sports Wagon
BMW	6 Series	650i Coupe
BMW	6 Series	650i Convertible
BMW	7 Series	750i Sedan
BMW	7 Series	750Li Sedan
BMW	7 Series	760Li Sedan

BMW	X3 SAV	X33.0si SAV
BMW	X5 SAV	X53.0si SAV
BMW	X5 SAV	X54.8i SAV
BMW	M	M5 Sedan
BMW	M	M6 Coupe
BMW	M	M6 Convertible
BMW	M	Z4 M Coupe
BMW	M	Z4 M Roadster
Honda	Accord Coupe	
Honda	Accord Sedan	
Honda	Civic Coupe	
Honda	Civic GX	
Honda	Civic Hybrid	
Honda	Civic Sedan	
Honda	Civic Si Coupe	
Honda	Civic Si Sedan	
Honda	CR-V	
Honda	Element	
Honda	Fit	
Honda	Odyssey	
Honda	Pilot	
Honda	Ridgeline	
Honda	S2000	
Hyundai	Accent	
Hyundai	Elantra	
Hyundai	Sonata	
Hyundai	Azera	
Hyundai	Tiburon	
Hyundai	Tuscon	
Hyundai	Santa FE	
Hyundai	Veracruz	
Hyundai	Entourage	
Infiniti	G group	
Infiniti	G sedan	
Infiniti	M	
Infiniti	FX	
Infiniti	QX	
Jaguar	X	
Jaguar	XJ	
Jaguar	XK	
Jaguar	S-Type	
Kia	Sedona	
Kia	Sorento	
Kia	Sportage	

Kia	Rondo	
Kia	Amanti	
Kia	Optima	
Kia	Spectra	
Kia	Spectras	
Kia	Rio	
Kia	Rio5	
Land Rover	Range Rover	
	Range Rover	
Land Rover	Sport	
Land Rover	LR3	
Land Rover	LR2	
Lexus	GS	
Lexus	ES	
Lexus	IS	
Lexus	SC	
Lexus	LX	
Lexus	GX	
Lexus	RX	
Lexus	LS	
Lexus	GS Hybrid	
Mazda	Mazda A3	4-Door
Mazda	Mazda A3	5-Door
Mazda	Mazda A3	MazdaSpeed3
Mazda	Mazda A5	
Mazda	Mazda A6	Sports Sedan
Mazda	Mazda A6	5-Door
Mazda	Mazda A6	Sport Wagon
Mazda	MX-5	Miata
Mazda	RX-8	
Mazda	CX-7	
Mazda	CX-9	
Mazda	Tribute	
Mazda	B-Series	
Mercedes-Benz	C-Class	C300 Sport Sedan
		C300 Luxury
Mercedes-Benz	C-Class	Sedan
Mercedes-Benz	C-Class	C350 Sport Sedan
		E320 Bluetec
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	Sedan
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	E350 Sedan
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	E550 Sedan
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	E63 AMG Sedan
Mercedes-Benz	S-Class	S550Sedan

Mercedes-Benz	S-Class	S600DSedan
Mercedes-Benz	S-Class	S63 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	S-Class	S65 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	CLK350 Coupe
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	CLK550 Coupe
Mercedes-Benz	CLS-Class	CLS550 Coupe
Mercedes-Benz	CLS-Class	CLS63 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	CL-Class	CL550
Mercedes-Benz	CL-Class	CL600
Mercedes-Benz	CL-Class	CL63 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	CL-Class	CL65 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	M-Class	ML350 SUV
Mercedes-Benz	M-Class	ML320 CDI SUV
Mercedes-Benz	M-Class	ML550 SUV
Mercedes-Benz	M-Class	ML63AMG
Mercedes-Benz	R-Class	R320 CDI
Mercedes-Benz	R-Class	R350 2WD
Mercedes-Benz	R-Class	R350
Mercedes-Benz	GL-Class	GL320 CDI SUV
Mercedes-Benz	GL-Class	GL450 SUV
Mercedes-Benz	GL-Class	GL 550 SUV
Mercedes-Benz	G-Class	G500 SUV
Mercedes-Benz	G-Class	G55 AMG
		E350 4Matic
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	Wagon
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	E63 AMG Wagon
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	CLK350 Cabriolet
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	CLK550 Cabriolet
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	CLK63 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	SLR-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	SLK-Class	SLK280 Roadster
Mercedes-Benz	SLK-Class	SLK350 Roadster
Mercedes-Benz	SLK-Class	SLK55 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	SL-Class	SL550 Roadster
Mercedes-Benz	SL-Class	SL600 Roadster
Mercedes-Benz	SL-Class	SL55 AMG
Mercedes-Benz	SL-Class	SL65 AMG
MINI	Cooper	
MINI	Cooper S	
	Cooper	
MINI	Convertible	
	Cooper S	
MINI	Convertible	
Mitsubishi	Lancer	

Mitsubishi	Eclipse	
Mitsubishi	Eclipse Spyder	
Mitsubishi	Lancer Evolution	
Mitsubishi	Outlander	
Mitsubishi	Endeavor	
Mitsubishi	Raider	
Nissan	Versa	
Nissan	Sentra	
Nissan	Sentra SE-R	
Nissan	Altima	
Nissan	Altima Coupe	
Nissan	Marine	
Nissan	Z	
Nissan	Quest	
Nissan	Rogue	
Nissan	Xterra	
Nissan	Pathfinder	
Nissan	Armanda	
Nissan	Frontier	
Nissan	Titans	
Scion	XB	
Scion	TC	
Scion	XD	
Subaru	Tribeca	
Subaru	Tribeca Limited	
Subaru	Outback	Outback
Subaru	Outback	Outback 2.5i
		Outback 2.5XT
Subaru	Outback	Limited
		Outback 3.0 R. L.
Subaru	Outback	L. Bean Edition
Subaru	Legacy	Legacy 2.5i
		Legacy 2.5GT
Subaru	Legacy	Limited
Subaru	Legacy	Legacy GT spec. B
		Legacy 3.0 R
Subaru	Legacy	Limited
Subaru	Forester	Forester 2.5 X
Subaru	Forester	Forester 2.5XT
Subaru	Impreza	Impreza 2.5i
		Impreza Outback
Subaru	Impreza	Sport
		Impreza-WRX
Subaru	Impreza-WRX	4-Door

		Impreza-WRX
Subaru	Impreza-WRX	5-Door
Subaru	Impreza-WRX	Impreza-WRX STI
Suzuki	Reno	
Suzuki	Forenza	
Suzuki	Forenza Wagon	
Suzuki	SX4 Sport	
Suzuki	Grand Vitara	
Suzuki	SX4 Crossover	
Toyota	Avalon	
Toyota	Camry	
Toyota	Camry Solava	
Toyota	Corolla	
Toyota	Matrix	
Toyota	Yaris	
Toyota	4 Runner	
Toyota	FJ Cruiser	
Toyota	High Lander	
Toyota	Rav4	
Toyota	Sequoia	
Toyota	Sienna	
Toyota	Camry Hybrid	
	Highlander	
Toyota	Hybrid	
Toyota	Prius	
Toyota	Tacoma	
Toyota	Tundra	
Volkswagen	Jetta	
Volkswagen	Passat	
Volkswagen	Nes Beetle	
Volkswagen	Rabit	
Volkswagen	Eos	
	New Beetle	
Volkswagen	Convertible	
Volkswagen	GLI	
Volkswagen	GLI MKV	
Volkswagen	R32	
Volkswagen	Passat Wagon	
Volkswagen	Touareg 2	
Volvo	S40	
Volvo	S60	
Volvo	S80	
Volvo	V50	
Volvo	V70	

Volvo	XC70
Volvo	XC90
Volvo	C30
Volvo	C70
Isuzu	ascender
	i-290 extended
Isuzu	cab
	i-370 extended
Isuzu	cab
Isuzu	i-370 crew cab

APPENDIX C: CHINESE DOMESTIC BRANDS AND MODELS

Brand	Models	Brand	Models
北汽制造	路霸 S100	江淮汽车	瑞鹰
北汽制造	路霸 S100T	江淮汽车	宾悦
北汽制造	骑士 2	江铃汽车	陆风风尚
北汽制造	骑士 2.3	江淮汽车	瑞风 祥和
北汽制造	212 越野小车	江淮汽车	瑞风 I
北汽制造	战旗越野小车	江淮汽车	彩色之旅
北汽制造	战旗 2024	江淮汽车	穿梭系列
北汽制造	战旗 2023	江淮汽车	江淮皮卡
北汽制造	角斗士	江铃汽车	福特全顺
北汽制造	212 系列	江铃汽车	JMC 宝典
北汽制造	6460 系列	江铃汽车	JMC 凯运
北汽制造	陆铃皮卡	江铃汽车	JMC 轻卡
北汽制造	陆铃 SUV	江铃汽车	JMC 宝威
北汽制造	陆铃皮卡教练车	江铃汽车	JMC 运霸
北汽制造	陆铃 SUV 教练车	江南汽车	江南奥托
北汽制造	平顶	江南汽车	江南风光
北汽制造	中顶	江南汽车	江南精灵
比亚迪	F3	力帆汽车	力帆 520
比亚迪	F3R	新雅途	新雅途
比亚迪	F6	新雅途	新雅途·优尼柯
比亚迪	F8	奇瑞汽车	旗云
昌河汽车	福瑞达	奇瑞汽车	东方之子
昌河汽车	爱迪尔	奇瑞汽车	QQ3
昌河汽车	爱迪尔 II	奇瑞汽车	QQ6
昌河汽车	昌河骏马	奇瑞汽车	瑞虎
昌河汽车	昌河新单双排	奇瑞汽车	奇瑞 A5
北京现代	sonata 御翔	奇瑞汽车	旗云
北京现代	索那塔	奇瑞汽车	奇瑞 A1
北京现代	伊兰特	奇瑞汽车	东方之子
北京现代	途胜	奇瑞汽车	东方之子 Cross
昌河铃木	浪迪	奇瑞汽车	开瑞 3
长城汽车	哈弗 CUV	奇瑞汽车	瑞麟 2
长城汽车	哈弗·派	庆铃汽车	竞技者
长城汽车	赛弗 SUV	上海汽车	荣威 750
长城汽车	赛影 SUV	上海华普	海迅两厢/三厢
长城汽车	赛骏 SUV	上海华普	海域两厢/三厢

长城汽车	风骏皮卡	上海华普	海尚
长城汽车	迪尔皮卡	上海华普	海锋
长城汽车	赛铃皮卡	曙光汽车	挑战者
长城汽车	赛酷皮卡	曙光汽车	领航者
长丰扬子	飞铃皮卡	曙光汽车	翱龙
长丰扬子	飞扬皮卡	曙光汽车	大柴神
长丰扬子	福铃皮卡	曙光汽车	小柴神
长丰扬子	飞铃 SUV	曙光汽车	法萨特 NCV
长丰扬子	飞扬 SUV	曙光汽车	旗胜 cuv
长丰汽车	猎豹飞鹰系列	双环汽车	S-RV
长丰汽车	CFA2030 系列	双环汽车	SCEO
长丰汽车	CFA6473 系列	双环汽车	小贵族
长丰汽车	CJY6470 系列	天津一汽	威资
长丰汽车	CS6	天津一汽	夏利 N3
长丰汽车	帕杰罗系列	天津一汽	威乐
东风汽车	东风小王子	天津一汽	威志
东风汽车	天籁	天马汽车	天马英雄
东风汽车	骊威	一汽丰越	陆地巡洋舰
福田汽车	蒙派克 MP-X	一汽丰越	普锐斯
福田汽车	探索者 II	一汽华利	幸福使者
福田汽车	探索者 III	一汽吉林	森雅
福田汽车	小超人	一汽吉林	福星
福田汽车	雄狮	一汽吉林	AV6
福田汽车	飞越	一汽吉林	CA6360
哈飞汽车	哈飞赛豹 II	一汽轿车	明仕
哈飞汽车	哈飞赛豹 III	一汽轿车	世纪星
哈飞汽车	哈飞赛马	一汽轿车	红旗旗舰
哈飞汽车	哈飞路宝	一汽轿车	奔腾
哈飞汽车	哈飞民意 M408	一汽轿车	HQ3
哈飞汽车	哈飞民意	一汽轿车	一汽自由风 MPV
哈飞汽车	哈飞新中意	众泰汽车	众泰 2008
哈飞汽车	哈飞中意	通用五菱汽车	五菱鸿途
哈飞汽车	哈飞普面	通用五菱汽车	五菱兴旺 (6360)
哈飞汽车	哈飞民意一排半	通用五菱汽车	五菱小旋风
哈飞汽车	哈飞锐意	通用五菱汽车	五菱之光
哈飞汽车	哈飞单双排	吉奥汽车	凯睿
海马汽车	普力马	吉奥汽车	GS50
海马汽车	福美来	吉奥汽车	帅舰
海马汽车	海马 3	吉奥汽车	奥腾
海马汽车	海福星	吉奥汽车	伊美
中兴汽车	无限	吉奥汽车	猛将旅
中兴汽车	威虎	吉奥汽车	财运
中兴汽车	厂铃皮卡	吉奥汽车	GX6
中兴汽车	旗舰 (汽油)	吉利汽车	吉利金刚

中兴汽车 旗舰·鑫皮卡
中兴汽车 旗舰 A5
中兴汽车 驰野·鑫精英
中兴汽车 旗舰厢式车
华晨汽车 金杯海狮
华晨汽车 金杯阁瑞斯
华晨汽车 金杯锐驰
华晨汽车 尊驰
华晨汽车 骏捷
华晨汽车 中华酷宝

吉利汽车 美日
吉利汽车 美人豹
吉利汽车 豪情
吉利汽车 自由舰
吉利汽车 远景

APPENDIX D: CHINESE INTERNATIONAL BRANDS AND MODELS

Brand	line-up	models
Toyota	Crown	
Toyota	Reiz	
Toyota	Camry	
Toyota	Corolla	
Toyota	Corolla EX	
Toyota	Prius	
Toyota	Vios	
Toyota	Land Cruiser	
Toyota	Land Cruiser Prado 2.7l	
Toyota	Highlander	
Toyota	Rav4	
Toyota	Previa	
Toyota	Hiace	
Toyota	Coaster	
MG	MG 7	
MG	Mg TF	
Mercedes-Benz	C-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	E-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	S-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	CLK-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	CLS-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	SLK-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	SL-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	R-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	M-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	GL-Class	
Mercedes-Benz	AMG	
Mercedes-Benz	Actros	
Mercedes-Benz	Axor	
Mercedes-Benz	Atego	
Mercedes-Benz	Econic	
Mercedes-Benz	唯雅诺	
Mercedes-Benz	马可波罗	
Mercedes-Benz	凌特	
Mercedes-Benz	威霆	
Mercedes-Benz	威雷	

Hyundai	现代美佳
Hyundai	新酷派
Hyundai	雅尊
Hyundai	雅科士
Hyundai	新胜达
Hyundai	维拉克斯
Ford	S-Max
Ford	致胜
Ford	福克斯三厢
Ford	福克斯两厢
Ford	蒙迪欧
Ford	嘉年华
Ford	翼虎
Ford	林肯领航员
Ford	全顺
Suzuki	GR and Vitara
Suzuki	Jimny
Honda	Accord
Honda	City
Honda	Odessey
Honda	Fit
Honda	CR-V
Honda	Civic
Kia	Opirus
Kia	New Carens
Kia	Sorento
Kia	VQ
Kia	Sportage
Nissan	Livina 骊威
Nissan	350Z
Nissan	Geniss 骏逸
Nissan	Sypphy 轩逸
Nissan	TIIDA 骐达
Nissan	TIIDA 颐达
Nissan	Teana 天籁
Nissan	Quest 贵士
Nissan	Paladin 帕拉丁
Nissan	Pick-up 皮卡
Misubishi	Galant
Misubishi	Lancer
Misubishi	Pajero
Misubishi	Pajero Sport
Misubishi	Outlander

Misubishi	Grandis
Misubishi	Lancer Evolution IX
Misubishi	Outlander EX
FIAT	西耶耶
FIAT	派力奥
FIAT	周末风
FIAT	派郎
Volkswagen	辉腾
Volkswagen	途锐
Volkswagen	新甲克虫
Volkswagen	GTI
Volkswagen	帕萨特
Volkswagen	新宝来
Volkswagen	高尔夫
Volkswagen	捷达
Volkswagen	桑塔纳
Volkswagen	高尔
Volkswagen	波罗
Volkswagen	开迪
Volkswagen	途安
Volkswagen	速腾
Volkswagen	迈腾
Cadillac	CTS
Cadillac	SRX
Cadillac	XLR
Cadillac	Escalade
Cadillac	SLS
Buick	LaCROSSE 君越
Buick	Regal 君威
Buick	Excele 凯越
Buick	凯越旅行车
Buick	GL82.5/陆尊
Buick	Park Avenue 林荫大道
Chevrolet	景晨 Epica
Chevrolet	乐风 Lova 标准版
Chevrolet	乐风 Lova 活力版
Chevrolet	乐骋 Aveo
Chevrolet	新赛欧 Sail
Chevrolet	新赛欧 S.RV
Chevrolet	科帕奇 Captiva
Saab	9-5 运动型轿车
Saab	9-3 运动型轿车
Saab	9-3 敞篷车
Saab	9-3 多功能五门运动轿车

Audi	A3 Sporback	
Audi	A4	
Audi	A6L	
Audi	A8	
Audi	Audi Q7	
Audi	TT	
BMW	3 Series	四门轿车
BMW	3 Series	双门轿跑车
BMW	3 Series	敞篷跑车
BMW	5 Series	Li
BMW	5 Series	长车轴距版
BMW	6 Series	双门轿跑车
BMW	6 Series	敞篷轿跑车
BMW	7 Series	四门轿车
BMW	7 Series	individual 四门轿车
BMW	7 Series	30 周年纪念版
BMW	X3	
BMW	X5	
BMW	Z4	双门跑车
BMW	Z4	敞篷跑车
BMW	M	M5
BMW	M	M6
Porshche	Boxster	
Porshche	Boxster S	
Porshche	Cayman	
Porshche	Cayman S	
Porshche	Cayenne	
Porshche	Cayenne S	
Porshche	Cayenne Turbo	
Porshche	911 Carrera	
Porshche	911 Carrera S	
Porshche	911 Carrera Cabriolet	
Porshche	911 Carrera S Cariolet	
Porshche	911 Carrera 4	
Porshche	911 Carrera 4S	
Porshche	911 Carrera 4 Cabriolet	
Porshche	911 Crrera 4S Cabriolet	
Porshche	911 Targe 4	
Porshche	911 Targe 4S	
Porshche	911 Turbo	
Porshche	911 GT3	
Porshche	911 GT3 RS	
Peugeot	东风标致 206	
Peugeot	新东风标致 307	

Peugeot	206cc
Peugeot	307cc
Peugeot	307sw
Peugeot	407
Peugeot	407sw
Peugeot	coupe407
Peugeot	607
Ferrari	GT
Jaguar	XK
Jaguar	XJL
Jaguar	S-Type
Chrysler	大捷龙
Chrysler	PT 漫步者
Chrysler	300C
Jeep	大切诺基
Jeep	指挥官
Jeep	指南者
landrover	路虎揽胜
landrover	路虎揽胜运动版
landrover	路虎发现 3
landrover	路虎神行者 2 代
玛莎拉蒂	Quattroporte 总裁系列
玛莎拉蒂	CranTurismo
玛莎拉蒂	GranSport 双门跑车
玛莎拉蒂	GranSport 敞篷跑车
玛莎拉蒂	Coupe 双门跑车
玛莎拉蒂	MC 12
Dodge	凯领
Dodge	酷搏
Dodge	锋哲
Dodge	蝰蛇
Mazda	3
Mazda	6
Mazda	RX-8
Mini	Mini Cooper
Mini	Mini cooper cabrio
opel	Vectra
opel	Astra
opel	Astra GTC
opel	Zafira
opel	Twintop
Acura	RL
Acura	TL
Acura	MDX

双龙	雷斯特 II
双龙	享御 08
双龙	爱腾
双龙	路帝
双龙	新主席
Subaru	Tribeca
Subaru	Legacy
Subaru	Outback
Subaru	Forester
Subaru	Impreza
Volvo	S40
Volvo	V
Volvo	XC
Volvo	C30
Volvo	S80
Volvo	XC90
Volvo	C70
Citroen	富康
Citroen	爱丽舍
Citroen	C2
Citroen	萨拉毕加索
Citroen	凯旋
Citroen	C4
Citroen	C5
Citroen	C6

APPENDIX E: EXAMPLES OF THE CODING CATEGORIES

Cultural values:

- 6-1. Status: XXX stirs the soul with dominating V-8 power, **luxurious** wood ...
- 6-2. Power: XXX stirs the soul with **dominating V-8 power, luxurious** wood ...
- 6-3. Achievement: **It is nothing ordinary.**
- 6-4. Harmony: **Zhong Yong** (Chinese). English translation: **doctrine of golden mean.** Doctrine of golden mean is from one of *the Four Books of Confucianism* that were composed around 450 BC. It refers to actions in due degree, which can ensure the state of harmony.
- 6-5. Self-direction: XXX is **an adventure machine** designed to the exact specifications of those families who are on the move, all the time.
- 6-6. Self-competence: XXX is **the most flexible vehicle.**
- 6-7. Benevolence: (image of family)



- 7. International appeal: XXX represents real **European fashion.**

Emotion:

- 8-1. Happy:



8-2. Love:



8-4. Relax: XXX is up for anything but the ordinary, whether it's a **weekend in search of the perfect wave or a long journey up the mountain in search of fresh powder.**

Information:

9-1: Price:

\$34,150 MSRP [1]

\$45,225 MSRP [1]

\$52,375 MSRP [1]

9-2. Shape:



9-3. Accessories: available radio, GPS, MP3 compatibility, etc.

9-4. Safety: XXX has innovative active **safety system.**

9-5. Quality: uses long-life coolant, designed to last for five years or 150,000 miles.

9-6. Performance: 34 highway miles per gallon

9-8. Availability:

FIND A DEALER

9-9. Special offer: Special offers now available on the following models.

9-10. Independent research: Received **five-star rating** in all five categories (Star rating are part of the U.S. Department of Transportation).

9-11. Company research: **Best seller for 10 years**

9-12. New idea: XXX has **innovative** active safety system.