



SARAH SMITH

GOVERNMENT & NGO EFFORTS TO SUPPRESS SEXUAL EXPLOITATIONS

Introduction

The topic being addressed, continued existence of sexual exploitation and trafficking, is of crucial importance to the researcher due to a significant lack of research about what works and what does not work to reduce the prevalence of these human rights concerns. With the developed world and the United Nations accepting that this practice is wrong and should be stopped, why do developing countries still allow trafficking and exploitation within state borders to happen?

By performing a comparative policy analysis and examining two case studies, this research aims to determine whether a government entity or a nongovernmental organization (NGO) is better equipped to ameliorate the factors that lead to human trafficking. It is the hope of this researcher that by investigating this research question, sustainable improvement will be made in eliminating exploitation in developing countries. The research question for this thesis is, "In developing countries, are governmental efforts to stop sex trafficking and exploitation within the country's borders more successful than the attempts of nongovernmental organizations?"

Human trafficking is a topic of major importance in the field of political science. The existing literature on the subject of trafficking and exploitation within a country is lacking. The topic is of general importance to society because women and girls play an important role in the political and economic development of countries. One step in reaching value for females is to stop human trafficking that

inevitably dehumanizes women. This research aims to understand how a country can fix this issue. Most research on trafficking has an international focus, meaning that there is very little research on how to fix the issue within a country. However, this is still a big gap that needs to be addressed. Lehti and Aromaa (2006) estimate who there are close to 2.2 million women and girls trafficked for exploitation each year that never cross international borders. The researcher contends that it is important to know if specific strategies employed by NGOs are working.

Related literature will first be examined to identify where the research on this topic stands currently and to identify where the gaps exist. Defining the terms of sexual exploitation and trafficking, addressing the prevalence of the issue, investigating why the problem persists, and then looking at international and national efforts to combat it will be the structure of this literature review. Next, an argument for whether NGOs or the government is better suited to address sex trafficking and exploitation will be articulated. After the argument, an explanation for the methodology employed in testing the argument will be presented. Finally, the paper will study two cases to determine the validity of the argument.

Consulting the Literature

Definitions

To fully evaluate the issue of human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, it is necessary to define the terms that will be discussed. The literature refers to sexual exploitation and sex trafficking equally, many times using the terms synonymously. Some authors, including Kara (2009), break down the steps of sex trafficking and point to this act as crucial to understanding and halting the sexual exploitation of females. The steps include acquisition, movement, and exploitation. During the acquisition phase, girls are lured in by one of five methods: deceit about employment opportunities or false marriages, sale by family members, abduction, romance or seduction, and recruitment by other victims of sex trafficking. While acquisition and movement are important steps, exploitation is the key point discussed as well as where the analysis turns. In sum, Kara (2009) makes the

distinction between sex trafficking and sexual exploitation by listing the exploitation as a particular phase of trafficking.

The United States Department of State defines human trafficking as an umbrella topic over sex trafficking. According to the U.S. Department of State, sex trafficking occurs when a “commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age.” Additionally, the report states that the person being trafficked does not have to be physically transported to fall under this definition. Guinn (2008) notes that most of this type of sexual exploitation happens within a country and even exists within the definition when a child still lives with parents or relatives.

The United Nations defines sexual exploitation as “any actual or attempted abuse of a position of vulnerability, differential power, or trust, for sexual purposes.” To alleviate confusion in this paper, a common definition will be established. The United Nations’ standard for defining sexual exploitation and trafficking is utilized by countries across the world and therefore will provide the framework for conceptualizing the problem in this paper.

Prevalence and Accuracy Issues

Given the prevalence of sexual exploitation that occurs within country borders, it is important to fill the void that research has left in this field of study. Lehti and Aromaa (2006) use data from the U.S. Department of State to extrapolate and find the estimated number of women and girls trafficked within a country each year for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The figure given by the authors is between 1.5 and 3.7 million women and girls a year. Kara (2009), when giving an estimate of the number trafficked for sex within state borders, also uses the U.S. Department of State’s figures. The broad range in estimated numbers is due to the issues that are discussed in the following paragraph. From this number and other estimates, the author derives the amount of profits made in the industry. The author states that in 2007, the average weighted purchase price of a sex slave was \$1,895 and the revenue from trafficked sex slaves was \$51.3 billion.

Parrot and Cummings (2008) explain that actual figures of women and girls affected are hard to produce due to four main issues: reporting is often incomplete due to a fear of retaliation, cultural expectations, a lack of resources, and little trust in the justice system. Victims often fear retaliation from the brothel keepers if they find out before action is taken. Even if a victim successfully gets away from the exploiter, there is always a risk that the perpetrator will harm the victim's family. Cultural expectations can include something as simple as women living in a male dominated culture with the inability to speak out. Victims are usually paid very little for their services, so they are unable to save enough money to pay for the resources necessary to get out of the situation. Finally, victims do not have faith in the justice system because they have not seen it work in the past.

Persistence of Problem

Kara (2009) identifies a few reasons, in addition to the definition, that sex trafficking still persists. These include corruption in law enforcement and judicial systems, lack of international work in investigating crimes, not enough protection for those being trafficked, and ineffective laws with an economic impact on the traffickers. Police frequent the same brothels while off duty that they are tasked with patrolling while on duty. Many officers have not received the training necessary to identify problems or solutions to get women out of exploitive situations. Once women are freed from brothels, there is almost never a fine given to those accused of the crime, therefore they are not dissuaded from committing the crime again. Lehti and Aromaa (2006) argue that it is so prevalent because the main way that victims are recruited is through the elusive promise of employment. Often this is accompanied with a threat of violence or with well-planned coercion. The authors explain that where the main victims are minors, as in Cambodia, families often sell the children to known traffickers. While there are many reasons for the occurrence of exploitation, some explanations are discussed in depth. These are a lack of justice, corrupt officials, and armed conflict, and will be discussed in order in each of the following paragraphs.

Mckay (1998) acknowledges what many others state as a large hurdle in stopping the sexual exploitation of children and women; the fact that many rapists and traffickers are not prosecuted. The author cites Brunet and Rousseau (1996) in saying that the lack of justice gives way to psychological harm because without shame and guilt from the community, there is no avenue for rehabilitation or working through the past to gain freedom for the future.

The U.S. Department of State focuses less on the scenarios that get women and girls into the situation of sexual exploitation, and more on the reason why eradicating brothels that make the industry profitable is difficult. The report explains that while specific shelters might be willing to help victims for an indefinite amount of time, governments often have set limits on how long benefits can be administered or to whom their services can be offered. An additional dilemma in sex trafficking is that brothels often employ off-duty police officers to serve as security. The report points to this conflict of protecting the offenders while not serving in an official capacity as a reason that law enforcement officers do not always investigate allegations of abuse. Victims are also turned away from reporting to police officers because of this practice. Overall, when law enforcement officers provide security, it discourages the identification and eradication of brothels.

There is extensive previous research on the notion that war increases the likelihood that women and girls will face sexual exploitation. Parrot and Cummings (2008) show a higher prevalence of sexual exploitation during times of war, political strife, and economic instability. Additionally, McKay (1998) cites the previous studies Brownmiller (1975) and Wilbers (1994) in stating that sexual exploitation of women and children has been considered an unfortunate part of armed conflict. These acts are now considered a legitimate act of war that is meant to weaken and manipulate the enemy while affecting the whole population. McKay (1998) gives the example of the raping and sexual mutilation of the Tutsi in Rwanda as an act of war and not just an unconnected side effect. The United Nations has taken efforts to combat these issues by passing legislation such as Resolution 1325. This resolution called

on member nations to enforce humanitarian law in protecting women and girls throughout and after armed conflicts. Ndulo (2009) explains that while these efforts have been implemented, there needs to be increased attention paid to ensuring compliance with the regulations. An additional concern is that the majority of exploitation by peacekeepers leaves the local population with babies that become outcasts due to the nature of their conception.

McKay (1998) explains that there is a lack of justice and a continuance of armed conflict which leads to the persistence of sexual exploitation and trafficking. The U.S. Department of State (2014) also identifies the corruption of officials as a key problem.

International Efforts

This international effort marks the revival of initiatives on the global scale that began in the early twentieth century. Guinn (2008) notes that renewed international attention has been focused on the sexual exploitation of women and girls recently due to efforts by the United States. Since the end of the 1990s, this attention came through such initiatives as the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000. TVPA, as it is commonly known, declares the issue as important and states that it should be a domestic and international priority. Additionally, the TVPA predicates United States foreign aid on compliance to these norms. Guinn (2008) states that this is often a key factor in compliance. Efforts such as the TVPA and Resolution 1325 follow the precedent set by early conventions and the League of Nations. Resolution 1325 aims to address the role of women in conflict management and sustaining peace through conflict resolution, according to the United States Institute of Peace.

Limoncelli (2010) explores the evolution of international anti-trafficking agreements through a series of conventions and accords throughout the early twentieth century. These nonbinding agreements provided a standard of practice for the countries that signed them. Limoncelli (2010) points to the first international accord, the 1904 Paris Convention, as the starting point where an exchange of information on trafficking was established. In 1910, the prostitution of minors with or without their consent was made punishable. At the same convention, the forced or fraudulent

prostitution of women was also determined a punishable offense. By sponsoring the 1921 convention on this topic, the League of Nations was able to expand protections and require states to devote more resources towards the protection of women and children from sexual exploitation. Limoncelli (2010) finds that these actions were continued after World War II by the United Nations. The 1949 convention hosted by the United Nations made brothel keeping and the procurement of prostitutes illegal, both domestically and internationally.

Patel (2013) discusses the implications of international laws on countries such as India to create and enforce their own laws regarding sexual exploitation of women and children. In 2000, the United Nations adopted the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (Trafficking Protocol). Patel explains that this protocol establishes a three-pronged approach to combatting sexual exploitation. The first prong addresses internationally trafficked persons and is not applicable to this research. The other two are applicable. One portion obligates states to enact legislation to criminalize and execute penalties for trafficking. The last prong states that actions must be taken by national governments to prevent trafficking. These actions can include training and information availability for law enforcement officials as well as identifying traffic patterns. Patel (2013) argues that individuals being trafficked should be identified as victims in an attempt to receive government recognition and help. The author also notes that many being trafficked are not given opportunities for education or employment by the government, and that leads to the issue of sexual exploitation. Patel (2013) states that currently the United Nations is working on an effort to combat sexual exploitation, but state response is also critical.

Lehti and Aromaa (2006) argue that by supporting more equal development worldwide, both economically and socially, the prevention of sexual trafficking and exploitation will be promoted. Along with international efforts, the literature suggests many ways to address the issue of sex trafficking in women and girls at the state level.

National Efforts

Mckay (1998) argues that the effects of sexual exploitation are best dealt with in a community setting where treatment encompasses the social and psychological aspects. The author suggests two remedies for the issue of sexual exploitation. The first solution is to keep a mindful watch on gender balance when selecting judicial candidates nationally and internationally. The second remedy is to provide training for those in power on the prevalence and forms of gender-based violence, specifically in armed conflicts. McKay (1998) explains that this training should be offered to professionals in the legal, medical, and political fields to be most effective. The U.S. Department of State's *Trafficking in Persons Report* encourages police officers to refrain from off-duty work in brothels and for governments to provide training and prosecution for those found to be complicit with sexual trafficking violations.

The training and education that many authors suggest as a necessity in combatting the problem often falls through the cracks of government oversight. Tzvetkova (2002) argues that NGOs have a history of filling the gaps that governments leave and that they are prime to do the same with sexual exploitation of women. NGOs have assumed the responsibility of addressing the needs of victims and potential victims, whereas governments pass legislation and host conferences concerning the issue. The NGO response usually includes help in all aspects. These include financial, social, psychological, housing, legal, and vocational services. Tzvetkova (2002) shows that while efforts might be made in good faith, it is often hard to provide for long-term housing due to financial restraints. Additionally, the author states that women have a hard time accessing state benefits if they are minors or are not part of the legal framework of the nation. Tzvetkova (2002) explains that NGOs are only able to assist trafficked women as far as legislation in the country allows. The author writes not only about actions that NGOs take after women have been trafficked, but also about NGO prevention efforts. These actions include vocational training, access to employment, gender education, and information campaigns. Tzvetkova (2002) cites the Middle East as

developing a network to support victims of sexual exploitation. The author notes that this is being done largely without governmental support, but instead through voluntary work. Guinn (2008) finds the NGO and donor communities to be key players in getting the sexual exploitation and trafficking of women and girls on the issue map for the international community.

Argument

Current research focuses on sexual exploitation and trafficking across national boundaries, but as Kara (2009) explains, the number is still large and concerning for those trafficked within borders. Before additional resources are allocated to help solve this issue, it is important to identify what methods are best at stopping the crimes. Little research has been done to determine whether NGO or governmental efforts are most effective. For the purpose of this paper, “successful” will be defined as a decrease in the number of victims over time.

I believe that because NGOs must operate within the framework of governmental regulations, they are only equipped to help when a country’s legal framework allows. This is a hindrance to their effectiveness, as is the limitation of funding that NGOs inherently face. I do not expect to find any evidence of NGOs solving the trafficking and exploitation issues without the government also creating and enforcing related laws. Related laws could include a situation where the government has set up a specific void for NGOs to fill. In this manner, I expect to find government solutions to have the long-term effects that are necessary in attempting to eradicate sexual exploitation and trafficking. I also expect to find that NGOs are best equipped to aid by conducting research, proposing solutions, and creating short-term solutions such as rehabilitation for victims. I expect to find that NGOs are necessary for these tasks, thus creating a condition that requires both NGO and government efforts simultaneously.

I believe that this pattern will hold true in Thailand as the government has not yet been able to provide the enforcement mechanism, limiting NGO effectiveness. I also believe that Italy will serve as a long-term study to show the role played by the government and NGOs.

Research Design

In this thesis, I am exploring the amelioration of sexual exploitation by focusing on whether NGOs or governments are better able to provide resources effectively. The cases that I chose, Thailand and Italy, are most relevant to this focus because they provide a wide spectrum to investigate. Thailand is a country that is in a gray area of combating sexual exploitation, while also remaining at the forefront of the international discussion on sex trafficking. Thailand is listed as a Tier 2 Watch List country on the U.S. Department of State's 2013 Trafficking in Persons Report (See Appendix A for more information on the Tier system). This designation indicates that the government is making efforts to combat the issues but has not fully done so yet. Their challenges and successes provide a good measure of contemporary issues. The final case that I chose, Italy, gives an example of how the issues surrounding exploitation have been eradicated while still allowing legalized prostitution.

In each of these cases, I will begin by exploring the scope of the exploitation issues facing the country before attempts were made. I will then look at the efforts made by governmental agencies and NGOs and evaluate their effectiveness both short- and long-term. To complete the analysis of each country, I will address whether there are any major events inhibiting potential successes. Examples of these events are economic crises and armed conflicts.

To evaluate these cases, I examined government and scholarly sources and avoided media and news sources. I included all sources that had relevant information, only excluding sources that focused on or made their conclusions based on an international focus of sexual exploitation. These were excluded because I am focusing solely on exploitation that happens within a country's boundaries. The data and methods used by all of the authors are complete.

Case Study I: Thailand

The Law

Thailand did not take measures to curb sex trafficking until the late twentieth century. Gallagher (2006) states that Thailand's first law against trafficking was passed in 1992 and then amended in 1997. The 1997 law remains the major legislation dealing with

sex trafficking. It “prohibits the selling, buying, luring, sending, receiving, procuring and detaining of women and children to perform sexual acts.” Kara (2009) notes that there are ten laws in Thailand relating to sex trafficking and exploitation, but the lack of law enforcement and increasing government apathy leave the law on the books instead of in action. Gallagher (2006) explains the main weakness in Thailand’s penal code is the lack of protection for males, although it affirms that sex with a child under 18 is a crime. There are proposals currently to change the law and alleviate these threats, but the author expresses doubt that they will be enacted.

Victims in Thailand

Thai law provides an avenue for victims to receive free legal counsel; however, it becomes the responsibility of NGOs to provide the service, said Gallagher (2006). The author states that often the only avenue given for redress is for victims to help prosecute their traffickers. Moreover, there are many shortcomings of using victims as witnesses, including lack of protection against retaliation on their families. Gallagher (2006) lists ways in which Thailand has created special protections for children that are victims of exploitation and trafficking. These include support services, speedy trial and separation from the accused. The government’s job of protecting children in this scenario is decent at best.

The Police

Kara (2009) states that police often take bribes to let brothels remain open, and some officers have even become traffickers. The author discovered this information by speaking first-hand to women in the brothels of Thailand. Gallagher (2006) states that Thai police are unwilling to provide any form of witness protection services. He agrees that officials are complicit and involved in the trafficking and exploitation of women and girls in Thailand. Additionally, many politicians, police, and military have commercial interests in the brothels. Kara (2009) expands on this opinion by recounting a meeting with a member of the Thailand trafficking police unit. This officer was one of 340 that had been hired as part of this force after 2005 legislation. The author explains that the unit had not been funded, so they were operating without computers or vehicles.

Government Efforts

The 2005 Trafficking in Person Report released annually showed that Thailand ranked highly in prevention measures. Gallagher (2006) notes that this is due in part to public information campaigns and support of NGOs by the government. Arnold and Bertone (2002) describe children's shelters that are made available by the social welfare branch of the Thai government. These shelters are available for victims and at-risk youth. While staying at a shelter, children receive training in skills to help them survive in the real world.

Nongovernmental Organization Efforts

Arnold and Bertone (2002) describe the work of NGOs in Thailand by highlighting specific efforts. Fight Against Child Exploitation (FACE) focuses on monitoring cases of arrested perpetrators, advocacy, and awareness. The authors note that FACE also works closely with many government agencies to propose changes to trafficking and exploitation laws. Gallagher (2006) notes that it is almost exclusively the NGOs that identify victims and report them to the government. Once victims have come forward, the Thai government does not deploy investigative services to help with the prosecution but instead leaves the burden to the victim.

NGO and Government Cooperation

A problem identified by Gallagher (2006) is a lack of coordination between government efforts and NGOs within Thailand even though agreements have been signed. Arnold and Bertone (2002) note that there are organizations that serve as liaisons between NGOs and the government such as the Center for the Protection of Children's Rights Foundation (CPCR). This particular organization performs six tasks: emergency shelter for children and pregnant women, twenty-four-hour counseling service, a place where people can call and report abuse, the first stop for a child if he or she is found exploited, miscellaneous services to victims of trafficking, and a hub of coordination between the government and NGOs. Arnold and Bertone (2002) explain that there are also private shelters for youth victims of trafficking, but

these are often much smaller and have a harder time creating a system of cooperation with the government and other NGOs.

Persistence of the Problem

Thailand faces one major structural hurdle to solving the issue of sexual exploitation and trafficking, and it is described by Arnold and Bertone (2002) and Kara (2009). A major problem for Thailand is centered on their large hill tribe population that is considered a lower class than the rest of the population. The stigma associated with this group of people creates financial hardships and low education levels, often leaving few opportunities other than exploitation. Traffickers will go to these villages and lure girls to work in jobs that are guaranteed to bring in significant money for themselves and their families. Kara (2009) explains that the families often feel like there is no choice but to send their daughters away with the traffickers. Once they have joined the traffickers, there is almost no way out as their families enjoy the income they are receiving.

Findings

In summary, NGOs are behind the majority of the meaningful advancements in curbing the prevalence of sex trafficking and exploitation in Thailand. The government has taken steps to codify the illegality of this issue, but lacks appropriate enforcement of the law. NGOs are on the streets, finding victims, bringing them to services and reporting trafficking to officials. There is very little that the government does in prevention and prosecution that is not aided by NGOs. This finding agrees with my argument in a key way. Because the government is not doing the majority of the work, but instead the NGOs are, Thailand is not successful in combatting sexual exploitation and trafficking.

Case Study 2: Italy

The Law

Italy's interaction with sexual exploitation spans more than two centuries back to when the Italian state was just beginning. While Italy is not a developing country, it has dealt with this issue in the past and thus serves as a baseline for comparison. Limoncelli (2010) states that the Italian law passed in 1860 by Prime Minister

Cavour was modeled after French and Belgian systems but with centralized regulation. The legislation sought to protect the health of the people and provide safety for those involved in prostitution. Gibson (1999) explains that Cavour felt that the young country was threatened by the lack of decency and values that were associated with sexual exploitation at the time. The regulations included medical examinations twice weekly and standardized police surveillance.

In 1913, Italy developed measures to follow the recommendations of the 1904 and 1910 conventions, Gibson (1999) said. Danna (2004) explains that Italy's government passed the Merlin Law in 1958 to outlaw trafficking, exploitation of prostitution, and all aiding and abetting regardless of financial gain. This law was passed with the help of Italy's socialist government and marked the first change in trafficking legislation since the unification of the country in 1861.

In 1998, there were three significant advancements in the penal code. Danna (2004) notes that the Turco-Napolitano Law, also referred to as Article 18, was implemented to raise penalties for traffickers and allow persons trafficked to stay and work or study in the country. NGOs heavily criticized this measure as inadequate due to the slow timeline in which things would be handled. Danna (2004) lists the second major policy change as dealing with Italy's law against child molestation in 1998. The added portion to this law created a stricter prison sentence and fine for exploiting a minor with even more penalties if the exploitation included paying the minor. The most recent action by the Italian government, which also came in 1998, was a formal agreement to continue the enforcement of the Merlin Law.

The Police

Kara (2009) relays that Parsec, an Italian NGO, workers complain that police are customers of the street prostitutes. The workers argue that this is why pimps are often not prosecuted for prostituting minors.

Victims in Italy

Danna (2004) notes that by closing all brothels and making only street prostitution legal, the government liberated over 2,500 women and girls. Kara (2009) suggests that these street

prostitutes are usually the victims of sex trafficking, although the majority of trafficked victims are exploited in illegal “closed-door establishments.” Danna (2004) notes that the change to the child molestation law was not altogether effective because the only person able to make a credible charge is a victim. This occurs due to the Tribunal of Perugia in 2000 that outlawed the practice of using the police force as bait in prostitution crimes.

Government Efforts

Limoncelli (2010) explains that neo-regulationist discourse gained popularity and helped push the government to stop compulsory medical examinations in 1880. These reforms were later overturned in 1891. The author also states that by 1890, women’s groups were forming to push for abolitionist laws. These organizations became the first in Italy to force this issue in front of the government since the action taken in 1860.

Gibson (1999) asserts that the neo-regulationists were not concerned about the religious issues surrounding exploitation and trafficking, but instead were concerned about public order, morality, and health. The Chief of the Division of Public Safety sent Italian delegates to the 1904 and 1910 conventions for this reason. Limoncelli (2010) notes that in the 1920s, the major steps forward in reform publicity and enforcement came from the government rather than associations. However, during the next two decades, many women and children were returned to their homes and eleven brothels were shut down in Rome as an experiment, the author explains. As women received the right to vote in 1946 and elected 44 women to Parliament, the issue came back to the forefront of discussion. Limoncelli (2010) describes this moment as the point in which the formulation of the Merlin Law began.

Danna (2004) lists several political parties in opposition to the law. These included the Christian Democrat Party in 1973, as well as the Democrats of the Left and the Federation of Housewives in 1998. All parties called for the reopening of brothels. The author also lists an effort in 1994 by mayors in several cities to have traffic police target clients. This went so far as to include ticketing clients with aiding and abetting if they walked a prostitute back to her spot.

Nongovernmental Organization Efforts

Limoncelli (2010) notes that the major problem with relying on NGOs during the latter part of the 1920s was that Mussolini abolished all groups not organized by the state. However, by the passage of Article 18, NGOs were playing a major part, says Crowhurst (2006). Danna (2004) points out that Article 18 lists about 200 NGOs as receiving extra funding under this legislation to help create and teach specific job training sessions for victims. Crowhurst (2006) states that by the late 1990s, NGOs were intervening on the streets of Italy as part of their daily activities in a way that the state was not.

Kara (2009) describes an NGO operating in Rome that runs street units in prostitution areas. The NGO that the author followed is Parsec, an organization that offers free condoms, abortions, and promotes health and safety. The author also recounts a first-hand story of a prostitute saved off the street and tested for STDs by an NGO called TAMPEP. These are examples of the street services offered by NGOs.

Crowhurst (2006), however, explains that in many instances there is only one professional on staff and the rest are unpaid volunteers. Additionally, each NGO has its own ideological framework within which it operates. This creates a vastly different experience for women attempting to get out of prostitution. Kara (2009) explains that many of the slaves that visit NGO shelters eventually return to the streets.

NGO and Government Cooperation

Danna (2004) explains that Article 18 created significant traction for women's issues in Italy that opened up communication and collaboration with like-minded politicians, NGOs, and policy organizations. Crowhurst (2006) states that when a victim begins the rehabilitation programs offered by social services, the woman is required to complete all portions of the program, including job training and health checkups. The author states that once these have been completed, NGOs will then work with the woman and law enforcement to phase her back into Italian society. Many NGOs run their own rehabilitation programs but lack the necessary

funds to adequately provide all of the training and phases required by Italian law.

Danna (2004) notes, “many other local governments have provided resources for information and aid projects of NGOs, in the spirit of both harm reduction and of Christian redemption.” Kara (2009) spoke with a girl who escaped the brothel she was being held in to live in an NGO shelter. This was only temporary and the government provided her the next step of training and rehabilitation on the premise that she testify against her abusers.

Persistence of the Problem

Crowhurst (2006) and Kara (2009) both agree that the discrepancies between the law as it is written and enforced remain a large issue in Italian society. Kara (2009) states that although there is some police corruption, the main problem with effective prosecution is limited resources for investigation.

Findings

In the case of Italy, NGOs run secondary to government efforts of ameliorating exploitation and trafficking. The Italian government has consistently created and enforced, at least to an acceptable degree, anti-trafficking laws. The NGOs operating within the country are doing the job that the government leaves for them to do. They have established rehabilitation centers that serve as just a portion of the government’s response. It does not seem that NGOs are leading the way in the fight against sexual exploitation and trafficking in Italy, nor that they alone could solve the issue. The argument of this thesis is supported by these findings. Italy has substantial government effort and little NGO work, and enjoys success in lowering the incidence of sexual exploitation and trafficking.

Conclusion

My argument was upheld through the two case studies as supported by the U.S. Department of State’s “Trafficking in Persons Tier System.” By using the tiers as a way to judge whether the efforts within a country are working, a clear pattern emerges. Thailand, a Tier 2 watch list country, relies mostly on NGO support to ameliorate trafficking and exploitation. Therefore, the government

does very little to solve the problem and thus little progress is seen. The result is a low ranking on the tier system. Italy, a Tier I country, enjoys significant support from the government on this issue. NGOs still have a place in the work to stop sex trafficking, but it is regulated and directed by the government.

It is evident through this research that there is a direct relationship between more government action, which means less NGO action, and a higher ranking on the tier system. This system serves as a measurement of success in combatting sexual exploitation and trafficking. Although these findings serve to move the study of this issue forward, there is still work to be done. The research done in this thesis is broad in the sense that there is no specific ratio of NGO to government effort identified as the ideal option. Work can also be done to identify why governments are better able to provide success in this area compared to NGOs. This thesis allows the international community to see that it is important to invest in a country's government rather than an organization to gain the best results when it comes to exploitation and trafficking. While a government can work largely without the support of NGOs, the opposite is not true.

References

- Arnold, C., & Bertone, A. M. (2002). Addressing the sex trade in Thailand: Some lessons learned from NGOs, Part I. *Gender Issues* 20(1), 26.
- Crowhurst, I. (2006). The provision of protection and settlement services for migrant women trafficked for sexual purposes: The case of Italy. In K. Beeks & D. Amir, *Trafficking and the Global Sex Industry* (217-227). Lanham, MD: Lexington.
- Danna, D. (2004). Italy: The never-ending debate. In J. Outshoorn (Ed.), *The politics of prostitution: Women's movements, democratic states, and the globalisation of sex commerce* (165-184). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge UP.
- Definitions and Methodology. (n.d.). In U.S. Department of State online. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2013/210543.htm>
- Gallagher, A. (2006). Human rights and human trafficking in Thailand: A shadow TIP report. In K. Beeks & D. Amir, *Trafficking and the global sex industry* (139-161). Lanham, MD: Lexington.
- Gibson, M. (1999). *Prostitution and the state in Italy, 1860-1915*. Columbus, OH: Ohio State UP.
- Kara, S. (2009). Italy and Western Europe. In S. Kara, *Sex trafficking: Inside the business of modern slavery* (83-107). New York: Columbia UP.
- Kara, S. (2009). Thailand and the Mekong subregion. In S. Kara, *Sex trafficking: Inside the business of modern slavery* (152-178). New York: Columbia UP.
- Limocelli, S. A. (2010). Introduction. In S. A. Limocelli, *The politics of trafficking: The first international movement to combat the sexual exploitation of women* (1-18). Stanford, CA: Stanford UP.
- Limocelli, S. A. (2010). Italy's state-driven movement. In S. A. Limocelli, *The politics of trafficking: The first international movement to combat the sexual exploitation of women* (133-143). Stanford, CA: Stanford UP.

- Mckay, S. (1998). The effects of armed conflict on girls and women. *Peace & Conflict*, 4(4), 381.
- Parrot, A., & Cummings, N. (2008). *Sexual enslavement of girls and women worldwide*. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- Protection from Sexual Exploitation and Abuse. (n.d.). In *UN News Centre* online. Retrieved from <http://www.un.org/news/>
- Trafficking in Persons Report. (2014). *The United States of America*. In U.S. Department of State online. Retrieved from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/210742.pdf>
- Tzvetkova, M. (2002). NGO responses to trafficking in women. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 60-68.
- What Is U.N. Security Council Resolution 1325 and Why Is It so Critical Today? (n.d.). In United States Institute of Peace online. Retrieved from http://www.usip.org/gender_peacebuilding/about_UNSCR_1325

Appendix A

A Guide To U.S. State Department's Trafficking in Persons Tier System

Tier 1

Countries whose governments fully comply with the TVPA's minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking.

Tier 2

Countries whose governments do not fully comply with the TVPA's minimum standards but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards.

Tier 2 Watch List

Countries where governments do not fully comply with the TVPA's minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards, and whose:

- a) the absolute number of victims of severe forms of trafficking is very significant or is significantly increasing;
- b) there is a failure to provide evidence of increasing efforts to combat severe forms of trafficking in persons from the previous year, including increased investigations, prosecution, and convictions of trafficking crimes, increased assistance to victims, and decreasing evidence of complicity in severe forms of trafficking by government officials; or
- c) the determination that a country is making significant efforts to bring itself into compliance with minimum standards was based on commitments by the country to take additional steps over the next year.

Tier 3

Countries whose governments do not fully comply with the TVPA's minimum standards and are not making significant efforts to do so. The TVPA lists additional factors to determine whether a country should be on Tier 2 (or Tier 2 Watch List) versus Tier 3. First, the extent to which the country is a country of origin, transit, or destination for severe forms of trafficking. Second, the extent to which the country's government does not comply with the TVPA's

minimum standards and, in particular, the extent to which officials or government employees have been complicit in severe forms of trafficking. And third, reasonable measures required to bring the government into compliance with the minimum standards in light of the government's resources and capabilities to address and eliminate severe forms of trafficking in persons. A 2008 amendment to the TVPA provides that any country that has been ranked Tier 2 Watch List for two consecutive years and that would otherwise be ranked Tier 2 Watch List for the next year will instead be ranked Tier 3 in that third year. This automatic downgrade provision came into effect for the first time in last year's report. The Secretary of State is authorized to waive the automatic downgrade based on credible evidence that a waiver is justified because the government has a written plan that, if implemented, would constitute making significant efforts to comply with the TVPA's minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking and is devoting sufficient resources to implement the plan. The Secretary can only issue this waiver for two consecutive years. After the third year, a country must either go up to Tier 2, or down to Tier 3.